
The subtitle of this volume is a clear statement of its contents—a history of the brownstone-front Executive Mansion at 311-313 Front Street, Harrisburg, upon which is built a commentary on each of the governors of the Pennsylvania region from the days of the Dutch in 1624 until the administration of Governor Fine in 1951. This dual project involved the problem that three-fourths of the Pennsylvania Governors, from Cornelius Mey in 1624 to James Pollock in 1855 had never been provided with an "official residence." Author Greene's decision to include these first seventy-seven executives seems to have stemmed from two reasons: first, that no serial treatment of the governors had been published since William C. Armor's Lives of the Governors in 1873, and second, that the present chief executive, John S. Fine, appeared to be the one hundredth governor. The latter conclusion, while defensible, may also be questioned because of the vague and sometimes contradictory claims to directorship of the Delaware Valley in early colonial days.

Because the main emphasis of the book is upon the Executive Mansion, dating from 1858, the governors of pre-Mansion days receive exceedingly brief attention. The first seventy-seven governors are given about a page each. The governorships described in Armor's 500-page volume (Mey to Hartranft) are dealt with by author Greene in 105 pages. Thus, the new publication in no way supplants Armor. It does, however, bring this early study up to date. From the administration of Hoyt (1879) to the present, Greene's book becomes increasingly detailed. One-half of the volume (pp. 149-341) is devoted to the period since 1900. In this period, on which little has been written, the book makes a real contribution to Pennsylvania history.

That the author has been a professional journalist is readily apparent in his style and choice of subject matter. Human interest is probably the basic factor in the selection of material. A classic anecdote or two is included in the sketch of almost every governor. The author is much concerned with "firsts"—the governor with the "shortest term" (p. 52), the "first Governor under a Constitution" (p. 53), the "second daughter of a Pennsylvania Governor to become the wife of a Governor" (p. 54), the fifth governor to die in office (p. 55), the "first sisters to becomes wives of Governors" (p. 56), the "first sisters who were daughters of a Governor to become wives of Gover-
nors" (p. 56), and so on. This continual concern about priority persists throughout the volume, offering to the reader much that is interesting and not a little that is dubious in point of fact.

In addition to human interest material, the author has provided a skeletal outline of Pennsylvania political history which gives a sketchy narrative quality to the book. From the critical point of view the best features of the work are the personal characterizations of the recent governors, and the succinct statement of the outstanding achievements of successive administrations. While no obvious partisan bias is apparent, it does not require a mind-reader to recognize Colonel Greene's political sympathy with anti-New Deal Republicanism.

Much of the material on the early governors was secured from the standard secondary sources. For the recent period, the author has availed himself of official documents, newspaper files, and direct contact with many of the persons of whom he writes. The book has a brief bibliography but no footnotes. The text is typographically clean except in the listing of Pennsylvania's one hundred governors, where numerous errors in dates and names occur. The volume is illustrated by charcoal sketches of many of the governors, and by half-tone photographs of the Executive Mansion and the Capitol buildings at various stages of their history.

The Pennsylvania State College

PHILIP S. KLEIN

Two Hundred Years in Cumberland County. Compiled by an editorial committee of the Historical Association of Cumberland County. (Carlisle, Pa.: The Hamilton Library and Historical Association of Cumberland County, 1951. Pp. 388. $3.50.)

Within recent years, at least three different approaches to the problem of writing county history have come to the attention of this reviewer. In 1948, George F. Dunkelberger published The Story of Snyder County (reviewed in Pennsylvania History by Homer T. Rosenberger, XVI, 249-250), which was a straight literary history, organized into topical chapters. Next arrived a history of Centre County in the form of pictures (also reviewed in this journal, XVIII, 179-180). Now comes the Historical Association of Cumberland County with a third form of county history, namely, a book which is both a pictorial and documentary collection. Produced to celebrate the bicentennial of the County (1950) and of Carlisle (1951), the work as described on the dust cover has "Over 100 original, first-hand reports of past events—Over 100 pictures and old photographs—392 [really 388] pages, including 72 pages of photographs—Illuminating 200 years of county history."

The compilers begin with a letter dated November 19, 1731, in which three signers, one of them Samuel Blunston, tell about their orders to move across the Susquehanna River and dispossess certain squatters on Indian lands in what was to become Cumberland County. The collection then proceeds through the history of Carlisle and the County, using excerpts from letters, diaries, public documents, reminiscences, editorials, and news stories. The last item in the historical collection is about the boys leaving for war in 1917. The earliest
pieces are for the most part from manuscripts, many of which are preserved in the Hamilton Library at Carlisle. The last sixty-four pages are devoted to factual statements about the sponsors of the volume. The reason for this section is given in these words: "... The following histories are ... only brief accounts of various businesses, individuals, and societies prominent in the county at the present time, but they form so many success-stories of American enterprise, and they are interesting and often entertaining in themselves. As a record of the present they will be of historical value in the future."

Like the documents, the pictures are almost uniformly well selected and instructive. From a photograph of Meetinghouse Springs Graveyard, site of one of the earliest churches in the County, about 1734, the pictorial story moves along to the final illustration, which shows Company G awaiting travel orders in September, 1917. Some of the most noteworthy pictures deal with colonial houses, the coming of the railroad, fire-engine days, and the automobile era.

The book is a laudable project, shedding credit upon the Historical Association of Cumberland County, the editorial committee, the Hamilton Library, and the sponsors. It is a marvelous panorama of Cumberland County Americana, valuable not only to local people but to others as well. The people of the County have been presented with a first-rate collection of documents and pictures, which, while not integrated into a connected story, does offer a fresh approach to county history.

As the reader moves from item to item, one of the diverting phases of the account is the development from barbarism to modern civilized life. In this procession from Indian to doughboy, some of the most notable steps which receive attention in the book are the stage coach, schools, railroads, gas lighting, telephones, trolley cars, automobiles, and finally the flying machine. A similar development is evident in the spelling, which is quite fantastic in some of the earlier documents but which improves as the years go by.

Only a few questions are in order. While proofreading is fairly good, it could have been better. Parentheses are often used where brackets should probably have been employed. And there is practically nothing on the Revolution. One wonders why.

Susquehanna University

WILLIAM A. RUSS, JR.


Biographies of the wives of American "Captains of Industry" have rarely been written. After the death of Louise Whitfield Carnegie in 1946, the many letters and diaries found among her papers suggested to her family that Burton J. Hendricks (the biographer of her husband, Andrew Carnegie) who knew her well be consulted about their publication. He urged the writing of her biography which he agreed to do. Unfortunately he died in March, 1949, with the work only partly finished. The poet, Daniel Henderson, author of
several informal biographies and a friend of Mr. Carnegie, agreed to complete it. The co-authors of this biography focus their attention on Mrs. Carnegie's rôle as the center of her family and stress that her human relationships—whether as daughter, wife, mother, grandmother, or friend—seemed always to come first. Living an extremely active life both here and abroad for ninety years, she survived her husband by seventeen, during which time she carried on some of his philanthropies, as well as her own.

She spent her early life in the Old Chelsea and Grammercy Park neighborhood of New York City. The first meeting of Louise Whitfield and Andrew Carnegie occurred at one of the Whitfield "at homes" on New Year's Day, 1880, when she was nearly twenty-three and he was forty-four. The psychologist might wish for more details of a long and troubled courtship, the protracted character of which resulted in part from the influence of Carnegie's mother, to whom, the authors allege, Carnegie had promised never to marry during her lifetime. Other factors were the extended invalidism of Mrs. Whitfield and Miss Whitfield's hesitancy to marry one of the wealthiest men in the United States. Not until after Mrs. Carnegie's death and Carnegie's recovery from a long attack of typhoid fever were they free to marry in 1887.

After her marriage her life was much divided between the Carnegie residences on Fifth Avenue and Skibo Castle in Scotland. Here as chatelaine she met and often entertained a galaxy of personages such as Edward VII, Gladstone, and Lord Roseberry; Presidential candidate James G. Blaine; young Walter Damrosch, who married Blaine's daughter; Kaiser William II; and writers Herbert Spencer, John Morley, Matthew Arnold, and Rudyard Kipling, who wrote part of *Kim* while a guest of the household. All this is agreeably described with frequent quotations from her letters and diaries but without any distinguished literary quality. While her authors assert her judgments and advice were elicited on the many problems of Carnegie's career, there is very little evidence as to their quality. Certainly few if any echoes reached her ears of the disturbances in the business and industrial world of Pittsburgh or elsewhere, in which Carnegie figured so prominently. The Homestead Strike of 1892 goes unmentioned, and very little is said of her husband's part in the formation of the U. S. Steel Corporation. She remains throughout the biography generally serene, sometimes gay, restless, energetic, often playful, without much sense of humor, but with a devotion to her husband and her only child, a daughter, which never faltered.

The biography contains a foreword by her daughter, Margaret Carnegie Miller, and fifteen pages of illustrations from family photographs, but neither footnotes, bibliography, nor an index.

*Carnegie Institute of Technology*  
F. CURTIS SWANSON


Students of American social history may be grateful to Professor Seeber of Indiana University's French department for his smooth, idiomatic, and
complete rendering of this travel account, originally published in 1821 and badly translated in an abridged version the same year. Although virtually nothing is known about Montulé, it would appear from his writing that he was a diligent and honest observer whose remarks will be of interest and value for study of many phases of our history. Less profound than Tocqueville, less sparkling than Dickens, he seems to have possessed a sincerity which gave his journal a natural quality of truth and authenticity. The book is cast in the form of twenty-four letters to an unspecified correspondent in France.

Landing at New York in November, 1816, Montulé proceeded in December to Philadelphia, of which he gave a very favorable description which will be of special interest to Pennsylvanians. He then sailed to the West Indies, where he visited Saint Thomas, Santo Domingo, and Jamaica. In April, 1817, he arrived in New Orleans, where he took passage on one of the early steamboats for Louisville. Thence he proceeded by stage and horseback to Frankfort, Lexington, Chillicothe, Wheeling, and Pittsburgh, where he noted that "smoke blackens the houses and gives the city a rather gloomy air." The entire western Pennsylvania area was studied in some detail as the traveler headed for Buffalo and Niagara. The Falls were the highlight of Montulé's trip; to him they were "perhaps the finest spectacle in the whole world." A brief account of his journey through the Finger Lakes country to Albany and of his return to New York and Philadelphia brings the book to a close.

Handicapped by his imperfect knowledge of English, Montulé nevertheless had a remarkable facility for getting acquainted with the people along his route, and the result is a generally sympathetic account, quite in contrast to the reports of such travelers as Frances Trollope. Slavery was one of the few aspects of American life that really distressed him. Montulé's comments on fauna and flora, roads and transportation, and the economic structure are especially valuable. His steamboat descriptions are likewise notable. Religion, education, and the arts are neglected—as they were on the Mississippi frontier with which this account so largely deals. The book is illustrated with eighteen sketches done by the author in the course of his journey. The editor's introduction and notes are minimal, and the index includes only proper names.

The Pennsylvania State College

IRA V. BROWN


It is entirely fitting, although somewhat surprising, that the first full-dress biography of the founder and first editor of the New York Times should be published in the centennial year of that paper's history. Only one previous biography of Raymond has appeared, written almost three-quarters of a century ago by a fellow journalist, Augustus Maverick, who not simply knew Raymond but had also worked for him. The author of the volume
under review is likewise a newspaper man, trained as a professional historian, who has been with the New York *Times* during the greater part of his journalistic career, since 1949 as Book Review Editor.

In the preparation of this volume, Francis Brown has combined writing skill and painstaking research to produce a highly satisfactory account of *Raymond of the Times*. His quest for Raymond's private papers involved him in a search that extended across the country—from the Widener Library at Harvard to the Huntington Library in California. Since this volume went the press, the largest single collection of Raymond Papers, placed at the author's disposal by Mrs. Seymour Holbrook of Norfolk, Conn., has been deposited in the New York Public Library.

Although there is little that is strikingly new about Brown's interpretation of Raymond the Man, Raymond's family difficulties, here adequately explained for the first time, add appreciably to our understanding of the factors which drove him to overwork, resulting in his premature death. In Brown's opinion, Raymond had a good and well-trained mind, although not a very original one. "More principled than Bennett, he was also more stable than the erratic Greeley, and personally far more likeable than either" (p. 332).

In his treatment of Raymond's journalistic record, the author makes clear that Greeley's "Little Villain" was a great reporter, as well as a great editor. "You needn't give yourself any trouble, Daniel, about your speeches as long as Mr. Raymond reports them," Mrs. Webster is said to have told her husband. Years afterward Raymond's feat of turning out sixteen columns of obituary material on the day Webster died was usually recalled whenever his achievements as an editor and writer were being discussed.

One of the most interesting parts of this biography is that which deals with Raymond the Politician, especially during the Reconstruction period. As Administration leader in the House of Representatives during his first term in Congress, Raymond was arrayed against the redoubtable Pennsylvania Congressman, Thaddeus Stevens, disastrously as it proved. In a period in which party regularity was looked upon as a fundamental virtue, Raymond's independency subjected him to widespread abuse. "You would be worth all the world to us if you would only fight within the lines," Stevens told him. But Raymond refused to submit to Radical pressure until it finally became obvious to him that his involvement in politics had been a mistake.

Only a few minor errors were evident to this reviewer. It is at least debatable to state (p. 113) that in the election of 1852, slavery was "the only issue... that mattered." Lorenzo L. Crouse was not a member of the *Times* Washington staff in 1861, did not accompany Raymond to Manassas at the time of the First Battle of Bull Run, and did no reporting for the *Times* during the Peninsular Campaign of 1862.

The book contains nine full-page illustrations, no footnotes, and a five-page index, which is essentially a list of names.

*Pennsylvania College for Women*  
J. CUTLER ANDREWS
Both in its authors and its publisher this book bears the stamp of authenticity. Its subject is American painted decoration, from colonies to mid-nineteenth century. It is a practical treatise for the use of those interested in making authentic reproductions, or readapting American folk art to modern purposes. Seven headings are treated individually: (1) Decorated furniture, (2) Decorative accessories, i.e., boxes, picture frames, clocks and small objects of all sorts, (3) Ornamented tinware, (4) Stenciled and painted fabrics, ranging from curtains and bedspreads to floor coverings, (5) Architectural design, with particular emphasis on wall painting and the Pennsylvania barn, (6) Coach and sign painting, (7) Fractur.

Each is preceded by a brief but inclusive historical summary, interesting in itself and essential to an intelligent approach to the matter in hand. This is followed, in each case, by practical directions so precise and detailed that the author seems to do everything but hold the hand of the worker. The text is reinforced by five color plates, nearly two hundred half-tone reproductions of authentic pieces, and a generous use of black-and-white illustration wherever, as with stencils particularly, a definition in outline is helpful.

This book will have an important influence in spreading and preserving the charm of early American decoration. Reproduction, created with sympathy and skill, can release our traditional folk art from confinement in collections and carry the enjoyment of it everywhere. Throughout, and wisely, the authors insist upon the ideal of fidelity to the originals. Unhappily, however, the wretched process of “antiquing” is countenanced, “to approximate the mellowing of age.” The authors make occasional and restrained suggestions on the adaptation of the traditional designs to modern uses, to paper napkins, bridge score cards, and the like. But in such a work they cannot rightly admit the taking of any liberties with the models they present, with the culture, conventions, and whimsy of the past.

And yet it is to be hoped that some who acquire the skill and comprehension this book imparts will venture beyond pure imitation into a reflection of their own feelings and lives. The arts of wall painting and fractur, especially, are adaptable and appropriate to this. Let us have not only the old forms, directly and faithfully preserved, but new ones emerging from the old, spontaneous and individual—a living tradition.

Dickinson College

Charles Coleman Sellers

Heroism and Romance, Early Methodism in Northeastern Pennsylvania.

By the Rev. Louis D. Palmer. (Stroudsburg, Pa.: Published by the author, 1950. Pp. 248. $3.50.)

This book covers the first forty years of the history of the Methodist Church in northeastern Pennsylvania from its origins in 1788. The area examined includes all of what are now Bradford, Susquehanna, Wayne, Pike,
Wyoming, and Lackawanna counties and parts of Luzerne and Monroe counties.

The subtitle might better have been used as the title, rather than "Heroism and Romance" which is too general. This left-handed approach to the subject is fairly typical of the book. Its underlying idea is good, but the execution is faulty. The author constantly inserts material useful perhaps to the genealogist or the antiquarian, but irrelevant to the purposes of the study. For example, the information that the stewards' book of the Wyoming circuit was presented to the Wyoming Conference Historical Society by "Miss Stella G. Wadhams and Ralph H. Wadhams, Esq., great grandchildren of Calvin Wadhams, deceased, grandchildren of Samuel C. Wadhams, deceased, and only surviving children of Elijah C. Wadhams, deceased," should have been relegated to a footnote or an appendix. The body of the text contains a superabundance of meaningless names and unimportant facts, at the expense of a well-balanced account and the reader's interest.

Furthermore the scope of the book is too narrow. The author endeavors to avoid this effect by devoting considerable space to "background" and thus placing the main theme in its proper setting. In so doing he apparently failed to consult the better secondary sources. More important, he does not include enough background material of the right sort. Most of the book concentrates on the vicissitudes of the circuit riders, the slow growth of the church, and changes in organization. Little effort is made to describe adequately the religious, economic, and social changes throughout the area and to relate them to the subject; nor is the significance of Methodism in northeastern Pennsylvania connected with similar developments elsewhere in the United States.

In spite of these defects, some of which are fundamental and others a matter of taste, the book contains well-written and enlightening material. It is particularly good in the section on the origins, creed, and organization of the Methodist Church. By describing the church in a restricted area for a limited period, the study serves as a corrective for loose generalizations often characteristic of larger works in religious or cultural history. It also clearly demonstrates how the Methodist Church owes so much to the large band of humble, devoted, and little known circuit riders who endured great hardships for an ideal.


Now for many years, Middle Western studies have been taking on a range and depth befitting the importance of the region. Earlier studies followed rather familiar patterns and were tied to relatively few themes of a conventional nature. Now the range of topics is much greater. Sections and subsections have been delineated, and regionalism has its devotees. Immigrant groups and their culture have become favorite topics. The state his-
Agricultural development, the spread of industrialism, the story of the rivers and the Great Lakes, Middle Western progressivism in politics, and so-called isolationism in world affairs—all these in later years have been and are being traced.

The rescue of the Middle West from the tendency toward cultural degradation, a condition so often characteristic of frontier areas, is a theme that is now being fully exploited, and it is to this category that the book before us belongs. The Ohio of 1850 to 1870 was a rich market for the aggressive, able, and popular lecturer from the East, and the organized lyceum program served as an important agency of this transit of civilization. The newly-constructed railroads afforded convenient lecture routes. In the book fifteen lecturers are treated in detail and two very useful appendices are added. The style of treatment is primarily journalistic, the sources being in large part newspaper reporters' accounts of the visits of these ambassadors of culture.

Ralph Waldo Emerson delivered his "bold thought-strokes" in lectures on such subjects as "The Conduct of Life," "Beauty," "Eloquence," and "The Spirit of the Times." Well-known figures like Amos Bronson Alcott, Henry Ward Beecher, Bayard Taylor, Wendell Phillips, and John G. Saxe are also treated, and, in addition, the book makes a real contribution in telling us of several lecturers of whom we know little but who were apparently popular and important in that day. The first appendix embodies a very informing general historical treatment of the lyceum movement; in the reviewer's opinion this appendix might well have been made an integral part of the book.

The local improvement clubs in the larger cities had taken on a more dignified form in such organizations as the Young Men's Mercantile Association of Cincinnati, the Cleveland Library Association, the Franklin Lyceum in Columbus, the Toledo Young Men's Association, and the Dayton Library Association. The lyceum movement also took shape from college literary societies or downtown circles in the smaller towns. We read of lecture courses in Chillicothe, Sandusky, Wooster, Xenia, Hamilton, Massillon, Oberlin, Delaware, Zanesville, and many other towns. Indeed the wide prevalence of the lyceum idea strikes the reader with surprise. The successes and failures of the lecture courses, their financial ups and downs, the favorable and unfavorable comment in the press—all this receives extensive treatment.

The reviewer feels that too much attention in paragraph after paragraph is given to the lecturers' reception in town after town, to estimates of how large the audiences were and how large was the speaker's stipend. All this is too repetitious and statistical and constitutes a major flaw in the book. But in general the author is to be congratulated for his description of these cultural efforts of the people of Ohio in an important period. It all sums up to a real contribution to the saga of the locality and to the broader field of culture history.

Ohio Wesleyan University

HENRY CLYDE HUBBART

The "Compromise of 1877" was the agreement as a result of which Rutherford B. Hayes was counted in as victor following the disputed presidential election of the preceding year. Professor Woodward's excellent monograph explores in considerable detail how this agreement was arrived at and concludes by sketching its short-range results.

The traditional account has it that the Compromise sprang from conferences of February 26-27 between Hayes' lieutenants and Southern representatives, who were willing to end their filibuster against completion of the electoral count and thus permit Hayes' peaceful inauguration in exchange for his withdrawal of Federal troops from the two remaining States of Louisiana and South Carolina. Professor Woodward seems to have established that these conferences were anti-climactic, that others of Hayes' lieutenants had already reached with other and more numerous Southern representatives an agreement that covered not only the political front, but the economic as well. This earlier and broader, but unpublicized, agreement had practically been clinched after some two months of unremitting activities behind the scenes by a clever and capable coterie of Western Associated Press officials that included William Henry Smith, Hayes' closest personal friend; Henry Van Ness Boynton, ex-Union general and Washington representative of the Cincinnati Gazette; and Andrew J. Kellar, an ex-Confederate colonel and editor of the Memphis Daily Avalanche.

The Northern Democrats wanted Samuel J. Tilden and "retrenchment and reform," seeking particularly an end to Federal subsidies for internal improvements since the unpleasant odor of the Credit Mobilier was still strong. The Southern Democrats were unenthusiastic about Tilden but clamorous for withdrawal of Federal troops from the South and for Federal aid to Mississippi levees and a Southern Pacific railroad with termini at Memphis, Vicksburg, and New Orleans. Controlling the most powerful lobby in Congress was Thomas A. Scott, president of the Texas and Pacific Railway Company, who was straining every resource in win Federal assistance for his enterprise. The WAP coterie saw in these cleavages an opportunity to split the Democratic representation in Congress, capture the presidency for Hayes, and gain a number of other ends. The strategy worked beautifully. The Southerners were to permit the counting in of Hayes by the Electoral Commission, as well as the organization by the Republicans of the next House of Representatives, while they were to obtain withdrawal of Federal troops from the South and presidential aid for internal improvements in the South and Southwest. What came of the "bargain" is common knowledge among historians.

Professor Woodward's account is well documented. It rests solidly upon an examination of numerous manuscript collections, notably those including correspondence to and from several of the leading manipulators of events. These collections are described in six pages of "Notes on Sources." This reviewer would like to have seen greater use made of Southern newspapers.
in States east of the Mississippi in order to gauge press opinion in this sec-
tion of the succeeding scenes in the drama. The index is not sufficiently
inclusive. There are fifteen illustrations, fourteen of persons and one of rail-
way construction. The style is lively and the format satisfactory. The title,
however, reflects a trend in modern publishing that this reviewer deplores, a
trend toward the assumption that every book must have a title and sub-title.
All too often, as in the case of Reunion and Reaction, the title does not indi-
cate sufficiently the nature of the subject matter. To be sure, a title such as
“The Making of the Compromise of 1877” would not stimulate sales, but it
would offer more than a clue to content. Quibbling aside, Professor Wood-
ward’s monograph becomes the standard account of the play of economic
forces in determining the outcome of the electoral count in 1877.

National Archives

*The Lackawanna Story, the First Hundred Years of the Delaware, Lacka-
wanna and Western Railroad.* By Robert J. Casey and W. A. S. Doug-

This is a light and flimsily-constructed account of the Lackawanna Rail-
road, spiced with titbits of the past that journalist-historians like to sprinkle
through their writing, such as the amours of Nell Gwynn, the tragic affair
of Francis Slocum, and the Pennamite war, without regard to their rele-
vancy. Both authors are well established reporters and war correspondents,
and Casey has at least twenty-seven books to his credit, covering such varied
subjects as religion in Russia, submarine warfare, and Dwight Green, once
a favorite son whose candidacy was being pushed by a political biography.

An earlier joint attempt at popularizing railroad history—this time the Chi-
cago and Northwestern—had given the authors experience in whipping
together a smattering of facts, a dash of legend, a few colorful incidents,
and numerous fulsome remarks about officials.

Casey and Douglas seek in this book to capitalize upon the current interest
in railroad history with a minimum of study and research in a few local
histories, railroad accounts, and annual reports. The early development of
the coal and iron industry in Scranton is linked properly with the beginnings
of the Lackawanna Railroad, the growth of the project from a series of
small beginnings is traced, and the rounding out of the system and the
enormous returns it made to investors are treated. Some attention is given
to construction problems, and a hint is dropped concerning the meager com-
pen-sation paid to the workers. Two or three early financiers and railroad
promoters, especially John I. Blair, are described with some perspective,
but much of the personal matter is useless, and the efforts to picture other
leaders are not fruitful. The book makes no contribution to our knowledge
of railroad technology, problems of operation, maintenance, working condi-
tions, or the impact of the railroads on American life. It can only be summed
up as a model of how not to study railroad history.

Cornell University

Paul W. Gates

Dr. Peffer has brought out a scholarly study of an important subject. Her study is essentially one of conflicts involving the public domain—conflicts between old attitudes and new attitudes; conflicts between Western views and Eastern views; and conflicts between the Department of the Interior and the Department of Agriculture for larger jurisdiction. Roughly, the period covered extends from the law of June 4, 1897, which made provision for the administration of forest reserves, to the Presidential action which, on July 16, 1946, united the General Land Office and the Grazing Service to form the Bureau of Land Management. By this merger, as Dr. Peffer affirms, the "old public domain" was officially closed. With its closing was ended a vastly important chapter of the history of the expansion of the American people.

This study has extraordinary value when it is projected against a long historical background. We easily forget that we have been one of the greatest colonizing peoples of modern times. We easily forget that through long years we had to deal with the three great problems of modern colonization, namely, the government of colonies (we have called them territories), the transference of land from public to private ownership, and the treatment of native tribes. We all know that we solved the first of these problems by changing territories into states, but we ordinarily forget that the other two problems of our colonial regime persisted in the Far West after the political problem there had been solved. In the Far-Western states the Federal Government has continued to be a proprietor of lands and the guardian of Indians living on widely scattered reservations. Naturally the states so affected have felt that they were not quite on a footing of equality with the Eastern states which are no longer vexed by the presence of large "foreign" jurisdictions within their respective boundaries.

The reason why vast areas of the public domain lying west of the hundredth meridian did not quickly pass from government ownership to private ownership is that these lands are either semi-arid or mountainous. The laws enacted for the disposal of the humid lands of the East were ill-adapted to the disposal of the dry lands of the West. With the changing attitudes respecting these Western lands and with the changing laws embodying these changing views, Dr. Peffer has been much concerned. The last fifty years, as she has shown, have witnessed a revolutionary change of view with respect to these lands. The old view that the public domain should pass as rapidly as possible to private ownership has yielded (not without heart burnings) to the new view that what remains of the public domain should be retained and administered by the Federal Government for the public good. The laws touching the public domain that were enacted between the Reclamation Act of 1902 and the Taylor Grazing Act of 1934 have reflected the changing view. These laws are numerous, varied, and highly significant. Unfortunately, they do not lend themselves to short and easy generalizations. Those who are interested in this subject can learn about them by reading Dr. Peffer's book.

Students of Pennsylvania history will peruse this book with especial inter-
est, for it deals extensively with an important part of the career of a distinguished Pennsylvanian. The large shadow of Gifford Pinchot falls across most of the years covered by this study. Pinchot has received adequate attention. His contribution to the conservation movement has been fully recognized. His conduct, however, has not been invariably approved.

This book is not an easy one to read. It was written for scholars. Partly because the author has compressed much information into a relatively few pages, her style tends to be heavy. Occasionally it is not altogether lucid. Her research, however, has been thorough and painstaking, and her documentation is abundant and precise. There are a few minor errors and inconsistencies—some of them the result of careless proofreading and some of them the consequence of indifferent editing. A few readers of a generation older than the author’s will not approve of some of her literary devices.

Bucknell University

J. ORIN OLIPHANT


This book, written for the general reader, is a history of the century-old Pinkerton Detective Agency. It is based largely upon the records of the Agency; otherwise, despite the lack of footnotes or bibliography, the context indicates secondary sources have been used. The style is quite readable but somewhat marred by the inclusion of personal reminiscence and frequent use of “in the authors’ opinion.”

Many of the chapters, particularly those on the Mafia Society and the Molly Maguires, are quite interesting, and that on the Reno Boys is quite exciting; but, in the latter case, it was the Vigilantes with their battering rams and lynching parties who furnished the excitement after the Pinkertons had placed the gang behind bars. The Molly Maguire story is told from the Pinkerton point of view; no conclusive proof is offered that such an organization ever existed, although, in the opinion of the authors, it did.

Concerning the labor activities of the Agency, the authors are on the defensive. No attempt is made to analyze the record or the vast amount of material at their disposal. Horan and Swiggett are on solid ground when they write that such activities should not be judged by present-day standards, but it is to be regretted that they based their defense on the grounds that the Pinkertons had a legal right to do what they did and always insisted that their men be deputized. The economic philosophy of the later nineteenth century offered a better defense than that. No new light is thrown on the Homestead Strike; and indeed, if one wishes to voice an objection, their conclusion that the strikers fired the first shot at the “Battle of Fort Frick” is a doubtful assumption. That question is as bewildering as the first shot at Lexington. The labor record of the Pinkerton Agency is not as pure as the authors indicate, and what happened at Homestead was the accumulated wrath of twenty-five years bursting on men for the first time at bay. Deputized or not, labor had no love for the Pinkertons.
Perhaps the most enlightening part of the book is that concerning Allan Pinkerton's Civil War record as an intelligence officer. Here he was on unfamiliar ground and erred greatly in estimating the strength of the enemy. How much Pinkerton was at fault or who was at fault, the authors are unable to answer; but a key is offered to McClellan's cautious tactics in the Peninsular Campaign.

The value of this book rests not in the field of history, for it adds little to that field; nor in the field of detective literature, for it does not prove the old adage that truth is stranger than fiction; but rather in its insight into the operation of a great detective agency, the infiltration into the ranks of the criminal, the espionage activity, the development of criminal files, and the wide range of the agency's interests. For these alone the book has claim to importance.

State Teachers College, Shippenburg, Pa. J. Bernard Hogg

Songs Along the Mahantongo. By Walter E. Boyer, Albert F. Buffington, and Don Yoder. (Lancaster, Pa.: The Pennsylvania Dutch Folklore Center, 1951. Pp. 231. $3.75.)

Here is a zuckersicssi (sugarsweet) book, as the Pennsylvania Dutch might say. It is a glimpse in song of life in a little Pennsylvania Dutch valley—the Mahantongo Valley, about an hour's drive north of Harrisburg.

The authors, all natives of the valley, call on about forty relatives and neighbor folk to sing or chant sixty-two songs and twenty-three chants under eight headings: Childhood; Courtship-Marriage; The Farm; The Snitzing Party, The Tavern; American Life; New Year's Blessing; and The Camp Ground. The texts and tunes (with chord indications), and, on the whole, very singable translations are given. The authors' contributions are mainly those of a good master of ceremonies—selection, organization, and background.

The songs are as distinctive as the Pennsylvania Dutch culture is as a whole. The collection itself is, however, our first book-length documentation of its subject. The songs are a delight just as songs to sing, but they also shed remarkable light on American musical culture-process. They offer possibly our best available case-study in musical diffusion and acculturation, both tonally and verbally.

The authors have made a splendid comparative study of the texts but have done almost nothing with the tunes—which is not strange considering the unsatisfactory state of comparative tune-study as a whole. Because of its importance, however, a tentative summary of the diffusion and acculturation as revealed by the sixty-two songs of this book may be hazarded:

1. High German songs, little altered traditionally ................................... 3%
2. High German translations of British and American songs .......... 3%
3. Old German folksongs, texts and tunes traditionally altered in being “Pennsylvania-Dutchified” .................................................. 27%
4. Old German folksongs, texts "Pennsylvania-Dutchified" but sung with British tunes, or tunes common in British tradition ........................................ 13%
5. Songs with texts of Pennsylvania Dutch origin sung to known but adapted German tunes ........................................................................................................ 8%
6. Songs with texts of Pennsylvania Dutch origin, using tunes in old German tradition, but possibly also original ............................................................... 15%
7. Songs with texts of Pennsylvania Dutch origin but using American (or British-American) tunes, more or less adapted .................................................. 31%

Thus ninety-seven per cent of the Pennsylvania Dutch folksong culture has been created or adapted in some degree, and only three per cent represents "mechanical transit" from Europe, while nearly a full third is completely American in tonal derivation. This is possibly the clearest evidence we have to suggest that apparently-fallacious cultural premises underlie most of our "official," or "prestige," or "institutional" musical activities—our symphony, opera, college, school music, etc.—which consists so overwhelmingly of the mechanical transit of European music intact.

Of course the book has shortcomings, too—mainly musical: there is a lack of tempo suggestions; much of the rhythmic notation is under suspicion; chord choices are often poor; the notation is messy sometimes, even illegible; a map and some pictures would have added much. But the authors have the ball rolling, and mighty well. It is to be hoped that systematic, continual, comprehensive collection of Pennsylvania Dutch folksongs will follow. We are indeed very greatly indebted to Messrs. Boyer, Buffington, and Yoder who are respectively a Mahantongo Valley school superintendent, a Pennsylvania State College professor, and a Union Theological Seminary professor. More power to them and all their colleagues in this essential work.

Pittsburgh, Pa.

JACOB EVANSON


Henry C. Carey, often called founder of the United States school of economists, reflected in his voluminous writings the optimism of a young and growing nation, and repudiated the dismal doctrines of classical economists. In his first publication, an Essay on the Rate of Wages, Carey boldly disputed Malthus by contending that an increase of population would bring about new divisions of labor and increase the means of support. In the study here under review, Professor George W. Smith of the University of New Mexico carefully traces the evolution of Carey's economic thinking and relates it to the rising sectional conflict which coincided with the period of Carey's most productive work. It is something more than ironical that this prodigious scholar, who spent most of his mature life expounding the harmony of economic interests within the United States and pleading for national unity, should have lived through America's most devastating struggle between economically divergent sections.
Carey was much more than a theoretical economist. As a successful book publisher, public-spirited citizen of Pennsylvania, and conservative man of property, he constantly attempted to guide the nation along a moderate and sane path toward sectional harmony. Always critical of the southern economy, he was yet tolerant of the slaveholder, believing that the planter's increased prosperity would benefit the slave and eventually make him a tenant farmer. Certain as he was that New England's diversified economy provided a model for the whole nation, he still castigated her advocacy of abolition. The South's stubborn insistence upon a free-trade policy and New England's abolitionism, plus her apparent lack of interest in protection, drove Carey to believe that the only hope for salvation of the nation lay in the great middle region, running from Pennsylvania to the Mississippi and including the upper South. Failing to find any real unity here, however, Carey hopefully turned to the Republicans, especially after they embraced protection. For a time he seems to have favored allowing the South to leave the Union in peace, confident that economic disaster would soon force her to return.

Carey is best known as America's leading propagandist, with the possible exception of Alexander Hamilton, for protective tariffs. He apparently considered protection the principal agent in his program to advance free labor, diversify and industrialize the South, and crush monopoly, which he hated and feared. Free trade was the great breeder of monopoly, allowing the leading traders of the large coastal cities to drain wealth from the whole country. It is when dealing with these apparent contradictions in Carey's economics that Professor Smith's book is least satisfactory. Few would contend that the high-tariff policy of the post-Civil War years crushed monopoly or materially benefited free labor. The author recognizes the contradiction but resolves it only with the statement that "... the new era of monopoly and business concentration was in some respects the exact opposite of the economic society that Carey had dreamed of..." (p. 120). Professor Smith's most interesting suggestion, that "social planning for regional development" constituted the closest modern approach to Carey's basic ideas, seems unwarranted.

*Henry C. Carey and American Sectional Conflict* is a well-written study which demonstrates that the author has made good use of the basic research materials, including manuscript collections of Carey and several of his associates. The absence of a bibliography, however, limits the usefulness of the book.

*University of North Dakota*  
GEORGE F. LEMMER

*Agricultural Discontent in the Middle West, 1900-1939.* By Theodore Saloutos and John D. Hicks. (Madison, Wis.: University of Wisconsin Press, 1951. Pp. viii, 581. $6.75.)

It would be safe to say that no historian can in the future speak with authority on the American agricultural "problem" of this century without respectful reference to the research reported in this substantial volume—unless, of course, he repeats the prodigious studies of the authors. Not even
the special papers which Professor Saloutos has published prolifically during the course of his study of agricultural discontent in the American heartland tell the whole story as it appears in this full-length account. His collaboration with Professor Hicks—author of the definitive work on the Populist revolt in the period immediately preceding that covered in the present volume—is particularly felicitous. In three brilliant chapters (I, II, and IV) the senior author supplies the setting, bridges the years between the agrarian uprisings, and analyzes the economic and psychological impact of the war on the American farmer. The remaining fifteen chapters, the bulk of the study, are the work of Professor Saloutos. Presented as a series of case histories of the farmer's attempts to better his distressed condition, they may be read separately with profit or taken successively for a more complete understanding of the complications hidden behind the deceptively simple phrase, the plight of American agriculture.

Whether the reader chooses to taste or to chew and digest he will find himself forced to make many interpretations for himself. While obviously sensitive to the farmer's difficulties and sympathetic to his efforts to solve them, the authors are more concerned with producing an objective history than with pleading a special cause. After reviewing in the wealth of detail the complications of the "farm problem," presenting a simple panacea would hardly be in keeping with the spirit of this scholarly enterprise. Yet out of the almost endless complexities of conflicting personalities and remedies for the discontent a basic pattern emerges. In broadest outline the trend in agricultural movements has been from the purely self-help organizations such as the American Society of Equity, instituted and controlled by its membership, in the direction of governmentally established programs responsive to the farmer's wishes. At the climax during a more general economic depression, the New Deal programs, unprecedented in size, form a final and important episode before the outbreak of war brought heavy demands for agricultural products and ended the long thirst for ample markets and adequate prices.

In the course of this evolution the many problems of method fought over provide all the excitement of any battle of ideologies which serve to advance the interests of a militant, self-conscious group. Questions of the relationship of price control to production control, of free competition to cooperatives, and of domestic to foreign markets were raised and discussed by advocates who ran the gamut from witch-doctors to profound economic theorists. Spectacular promoters and crack-pots provide color and humor, but the surprising list of able thinkers and effective political leaders impresses the reader with the urgency of the problems which they faced and with the sincerity of their efforts to provide solutions. Professor Saloutos' wide knowledge of the literature produced by these men and about them as well as the contemporaneous studies of all phases of mid-western agriculture from planting to consumption give a solidarity to his work all too frequently missing in cursory treatments.

The apparatus of the book is beyond reproach. A formal bibliography is replaced by full citations in the text to supporting evidence. A combined
name and topical index facilitates the use which the careful student is certain to make of a volume of this magnitude.

_Vanderbilt University_  

_Aubrey C. Land_


CONTRIBUTORS

DONALD H. KENT is Associate State Historian in the Historical Division of the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, Associate Editor of PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY, and a co-editor of The Papers of Henry Bouquet.

ERNEST C. MILLER is by vocation an oil man, but by avocation an amateur historian. He is the author of Oil Mania and John Wilkes Booth—Oilman.

MILTON W. HAMILTON, the former Editor of PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY, is now Assistant State Historian in the New York State Division of Archives and History, and the editor of Volume X of The Papers of Sir William Johnson.

JOHN CUMMINGS is Curator, and AUDUBON R. DAVIS, Librarian, of The Bucks County Historical Society in Doylestown.

PHILIP S. KLEIN, Professor of American History at The Pennsylvania State College, is the Secretary of the Association.

The cover illustration, a pen-and-ink sketch of George Washington as a young man, was drawn by Guy Colt. It is based on the statue of Washington which stands at the site of Fort Le Boeuf in Waterford, Erie County; and represents him delivering Governor Dinwiddie's message to the French commandant, a few months before the beginning of his journal of 1754.
The Letters of Benjamin Rush

Edited by L. H. BUTTERFIELD. Full of flavor and zest, this collection of over 650 letters, two-thirds of them never printed before, is a companion piece to Rush's *Autobiography*. Written between 1761 and 1813, the letters trace Rush's career, from his schooling in Scotland and England to national eminence as signer of the Declaration of Independence and Philadelphia's leading physician. He writes to John Adams, Franklin, Jefferson, Witherspoon, and a host of others. "A sourcebook for intellectual and social history.... The editing is extraordinarily complete and, in the best sense, it is sympathetic." Dumas Malone in the N. Y. Herald Tribune.

2 vols., 1,388 pages, 6 x 9 inches, illustrated, $15.00

The Letters of Benjamin Franklin and Jane Mecom

Edited by CARL VAN DOREN. The delightful correspondence between Franklin and his favorite sister contains more letters than he is known to have written to any other person. As the personality of Jane Mecom emerges through them, we understand the reasons for the esteem in which her brother held her. "These letters illuminate, often in picturesque language, life in colonial America, and throw light on the always fascinating personality of Benjamin Franklin."—*The New Yorker.*

Illustrated, $5.00

These books are published for the American Philosophical Society by Princeton University Press, Princeton, N. J.

At your bookstore

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS
ATTENTION!

Show your interest in the history of your state by urging your friends, acquaintances, and fellow citizens to join the Pennsylvania Historical Association, and to become interested in its work. Use this form:

APPLICATION FOR MEMBERSHIP

I, ____________________________ (Name of individual or society) ____________________________ (Address)

hereby apply for membership in the Pennsylvania Historical Association, which includes a subscription to Pennsylvania History. I enclose my check as indicated below:

☐ Annual individual membership ______ $ 4.00
☐ Annual institutional membership ______ $ 4.50
☐ Annual sustaining membership ______ $10.00
☐ Life membership ______ $50.00

Please make checks payable to the Pennsylvania Historical Association and mail to the Secretary, Philip S. Klein, The Pennsylvania State College, State College, Pa.