BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTES

Edited by Norman B. Wilkinson


The stream of books on the Founding Fathers and their contributions to the creation and development of the American nation goes on without cease. In recent years this flow has been augmented by the work of such excellent students as Irving Brant, Dumas Malone, Leonard White, John C. Miller and Adrienne Koch, to mention only a few. Breathing the dust of basic research they have dug deeply into the sources for understanding and meaning, and to them Mr. Brown is greatly indebted. Also, since he has depended principally, if not exclusively, upon published materials for his original sources, he owes much to the Boyds, Fords, Adamses and Fitzpatricks.

The title of Mr. Brown's work, *The First Republicans*, is an excellent one, full of great promise. But it implies a broader and deeper coverage than the book embraces. It is neither biography nor narrative, nor is it a history of the period in which the first Republicans appeared. Unconcerned with Republicans *en masse*, it is instead a series of observations on the ideas of a very few men, the elite of Republicanism. The individuals selected for consideration are George Mason, James Monroe, Thomas Paine, Albert Gallatin, James Madison and Thomas Jefferson. The proportion of space allotted to these men is uneven, and by far the greatest amount of time is devoted to Madison and Jefferson.

The author's purpose in writing this book was to select some of the ideas of these men, as expressed during the approximate period, 1775 to 1810, and to show their relationship "to the concrete policies and programs which united the republicans in political action and characterized them as the Republican Party." These ideas are held to be distinctive contributions to the theory and operation of republican government as it developed in the United States. In pursuance of this objective he begins with a brief appraisal of the basic philosophical theories of government which guided the Republicans not only during the decade of opposition to Hamiltonian Federalism but during the administrations of Jefferson, Madison and Monroe. In essence these theories emphasized man's power to reason and improve his condition, his inherent dignity, his "inalienable" rights, and his liberties. These are listed in the first chapter. In the following five chapters the author presents several concrete issues and events to which the Republicans applied their fundamental concepts. The ones selected should surprise no one: the Constitution and its ratification, the Alien and Sedition Acts, Hamilton's financial proposals, the Whiskey Rebellion, the French Revolution and the Na-
polemic wars, internal improvements, Jay's Treaty, the Monroe Doctrine and the separation of church and state.

While considering these many issues, with a brevity that presupposes a considerable knowledge on the reader's part, Mr. Brown finds that the Republicans maintained a "remarkable" consistency of policy down through the years. This opinion is so firm that it leads him to deprecate strongly the "shallow . . . judgment" of textbook historians who have "parroted" the notion that the Republicans became conservative after 1800 and followed the policies of their predecessors. He is again hard on the historians when he exaggerates the significance of a paper on money written by Madison. This essay, written in 1779, must indeed have been the work of a man endowed with prophecy for "it effectively nullifies the shallow cliché of the historians that Madison and his friends were ignorant critics of Hamilton" (p. 54). In another place (p. 57) he refers to "the stereotype of the historians that Jefferson and Madison did not understand banking and spoke from provincial prejudice." It is to be noted that he is condemning all historians, not just a few, and at no time does he name names or present detailed criticism. These easy generalizations and shot-gun indictments are unfortunately too frequent in this book. One must be constantly on the alert for loose identifications of a few men—sometimes only two or three—with the whole Republican party. For example, Madison's essay on money, above referred to, "shows clearly why the Republicans were never susceptible to persuasion by the Federalists in merely technical argument." This is indeed the Great Man Theory of history, with a vengeance. A more serious question is raised when Mr. Brown refers to party formation: "The Republican Party, as an articulate faction, had its origin in the opposition of Madison and Jefferson to Hamilton's fiscal policy in 1790." Aside from the assertion that the Republican Party had its beginning in 1790, in itself highly debatable, we are to believe that "Republican Party" and "faction" are synonymous, that conceivably there would be no difference between the two in 1790 or in 1800—from the standpoint of party organization. Surely the controversial implications in this statement require some qualification.

Mr. Brown's book, within the limitations he has prescribed, is interesting and provocative, but it would have been improved had he omitted a rather inadequate postscript on Crosskey and included an index.

Temple University

HARRY M. TINKCOM


That this is volume two of a comprehensive historical work is implied by the time limits of the title. The excellent "Foreword" by William L. Henning, Pennsylvania Secretary of Agriculture, states well both the scope of the first volume and the features of this volume. It is true as asserted by Henning, "As with the first volume, Dean Fletcher really has written two books. One is the evolution of farming as an industry and an occupation
of Pennsylvanians. The other is concerned with the life of the farmer in terms of the individual and of the farm family."

The table of contents makes it plain that few topics are left out and that Dean Fletcher is a scholar indeed, in the particular literature and evidence relating to the two aspects of his professional and historical interests. Over two hundred topical headings found in the "Contents" are wisely handled in the context. Paragraphs four, five and six of the "Foreword" contain a highly condensed but very lucid summarization of the findings and contributions of the author in the presentation of his numerous topics in twenty well organized chapters on "The Land," "The Farmers," "Mechanized Farms," "Labor," "Soil Fertility," "Feed Crops," "Cash Crops," "Dairying, 1840-1900," "Dairying, 1900-1940," "Livestock Farming," "Horticulture," "Transportation and Marketing," "Profit and Loss," "Agriculture and Government," "Agricultural Organization," "Agricultural Education and Research," "Country Life," "Rural Schools and Churches" and "Farmers as Citizens."

More than twelve hundred notes, many of them mere references for comprehensive statements or quotations in the text and usually to agricultural journals or reports, are a conspicuous feature of the volume. No bibliography is included, but considering the specialization of the literature this is explicable. The notes are less satisfactory where placed.

While somewhat encyclopaedic and dealing with many highly familiar matters, the text is unusually well written and printed in good format with a minimum of typographical imperfections. Some of the facts and statements are such as to intrigue the reviewer. Among these may be mentioned: that only one of eight Pennsylvanians of 1940 lived on farms (p. 28); that in 1840 each farmer produced only enough food for himself and three others, while in 1940 he produced enough for himself and fifteen others (p. 61); that by 1946 more than eighty per cent of Pennsylvania's farms were electrified (p. 60); that by 1926 the farm products were eighty per cent marketed through livestock (p. 99); that by 1948 one half of the corn raised in Pennsylvania was of the hybrid variety (p. 125); that potatoes and tobacco are the leading Pennsylvania cash crops (pp. 143-156); that dairying provides forty per cent of the Pennsylvania farm income (p. 202); that preferential freight rates for western products greatly damaged Pennsylvania agriculture (p. 317); that the capital investment in agriculture in Pennsylvania by 1940 reached a billion dollars (p. 350); that neither the financial panic of 1893 nor the Spanish-American War greatly affected Pennsylvania agriculture (p. 369); that between 1915 and 1919 the rural "cost of living" in Pennsylvania increased by nearly one hundred per cent (p. 371); that the New Deal was important to the farms of Pennsylvania; and that rural health was long poor and inferior to urban health.

As claimed in the Foreword, and as would be expected, the volume is particularly valuable on "the history of Agricultural Extension, The Agricultural Experiment Station and the Pennsylvania State University." The last four chapters, dealing with "Country Life" are brief but excellent, with
Sotp specific detail added to the general account. The index of six and a half pages covering about four hundred items is meagre for so comprehensive a work, but it properly is mainly a subject index.

The particular dissatisfaction of the reviewer, on finishing this book, was that it contained too much expression of facts and ideas in the form of relevant quotations and too little of the digested wisdom and reflection of Dean Fletcher.

University of Pittsburgh

ALFRED P. JAMES

A Goodly Heritage. By Ella Chalfant. (Pittsburgh, University of Pittsburgh Press, 1955. Pp. 239. $3.00.)

This is a recent volume in a series on the cultural history of Western Pennsylvania, made possible through a grant-in-aid from the Buhl Foundation. Miss Chalfant has devoted her attention principally to the wills of men and women who lived in one of America’s great frontiers, the Gateway to the West. She read 100 of the Allegheny County Will Books and selected representative ones from the first three books for this work. She apparently also examined colonial newspapers, journals, histories, genealogies, tombstones, and letters. The result of her labors succeeds in depicting much of the social, educational, religious, economic, and political atmosphere of the late 1700’s and early 1800’s. The author’s experience as a librarian and statistician in the Pittsburgh banking industry will be obvious to her readers; her lack of training as a historian may also be apparent.

This reader’s most frequent adverse criticism concerns the repetitive remarks; for example, the mentions of the need for a will, that these early wills are to be venerated, the wearisome descriptions of the present condition of the wills (cracked, folded, ink blot locations, precise size to the nearest one-eighth inch), and measurements of tombstones. “Absolutely forever” appears three times on one page (127) referring to the same will. More than once she tells us that Ebenezer Denny was Pittsburgh’s first mayor, and that Margaret Harrah bequeathed her “eight day clock.” Some wills are quoted two or more times throughout the book. There is too frequent comment on the obvious (Indian place names still used; naïve wonder at the long “s”; “accounts of people murdered by Indians seem very strange today”). Explained repeatedly was the “usual provision” in wills that “widows were entitled to legacies only if they remained widows.” There was a tedious listing of assets in some of the wills (11, 12, 15, 16, 17, 18).

There are more than the usual assortment of typographical errors, irritating or incorrect grammar, clichés, historical inaccuracies, and unwarranted conclusions. This reader did not enjoy being asked such questions as “That bequest to a man of two petticoats sounds peculiar, doesn’t it?” (141) Annoying, also, was the frequent appearance of “a lot,” the editorial “we,” “everybody knows” and subject-verb disagreement, such as “Another feature . . . are” (195), “scope and vision . . . has” (204). Inaccuracies include the statements that the Missouri Compromise made slavery illegal in Pennsylvania and other states north of 36 degrees 30 minutes (92, 93), that
PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY

Pittsburgh's industrial progress was well under way at the beginning of the 18th century (101), and that France turned over to England her claim to Canada and all her claims east of the Mississippi "when Quebec was captured in 1759" (1). John Brady was journeying "from the Mouth of Yough River" according to his will (3), but "to" the Mouth of the Yough, according to the author (4). This reader wondered how a man's character is "illuminated" by his instructions that his body be interred in a certain church (64-65); how more of a man's personality is "bound" to find expression if he writes his own will (68); and how one concludes that James and Rachel Burke perished at sea because his will was recorded 16 days after he wrote it (83); or that Dr. Richardson was referring to Tarleton Bates in his will when he mentioned "sudden death" (83)—Bates died more than two and one-half years before Richardson.

The bibliographic style and content is not the most commendable. George Bancroft's History of the United States and the elementary Eggleston's, A History of the United States, seem to be the author's only sources for general American History. The New Funk and Wagnalls Encyclopedia is also listed (perhaps used to get details). Despite the reference in the text to the Revreend Mr. McMillan, no listing of Guthrie's recent biography appears. Other obvious omissions include Baldwin's works on the Whiskey Rebels and, on Pittsburgh, and Ferguson's book on early politics in the same area.

Various topics covered by the author's commentary include whiskey, the labor market, money, luxuries, land laws, Pittsburgh's first insurance policy, first steam grist mill west of the mountains, and trust estates in Egypt. Some of the remarks providing the transition from one will to the next are well phrased, others are unnecessary. There appears to be no point in including the preamble to an Act as Appendix A, but Appendix B, "How To Look Up a Will," is of interest and of value to searchers through old wills of Allegheny County. The dust jacket is perhaps unique, and certainly attractive; inside it is a 1784 map of the "Manor of Pittsburgh" which is helpful.

The book generally proved interesting and provided a unique aperture through which to view something of the sociological conditions of the frontier. It should be of value to lawyers, genealogists, librarians, historians, and descendants of pioneer families of the Pittsburgh area.

State Teachers College, Millersville, Pa.

ABRAM J. FOSTER

Centennial Exhibition. Pennsylvania Painters. October 7-November 6, 1955. Commemorating the 100th Anniversary of the Pennsylvania State University. (University Park, Pa.: The University Library, 1955. Pp. [124]. Paper, $1.00; Cloth, $2.00.)

Anniversaries have so often fostered hasty and haphazard historical scrapings-together, that a grateful accolade should echo any which has been celebrated in a worthy and memorable way. It was appropriate that the Pennsylvania State University should mark its centennial with an exhibition
Of Pennsylvania painting. Both are rooted in the soil and aspirations of the region, and both a coherent cultural expression of its life. It is appropriate that an institution of learning should give the occasion permanence in a book which is itself a contribution to learning—that the whole affair would be scholarly, restrained, exploratory. In this it casts lustre upon the University as perhaps no other public event could have done.

The exhibition, and this catalogue, are the work of Harold E. Dickson, Professor of Fine Arts at the University. Forty-six painters, from the Eighteenth Century to our own time, are represented. Each work is here illustrated with a full-page plate, and a biographical and critical notice appears upon its opposite page.

Pennsylvania has had a cultural tradition such as few other states possess, due to its size and wealth and due to the position so long held by Philadelphia as a center of scientific advance, literature, art and publishing. That preeminence is illustrated here, as well as the later rise of Pittsburgh as a similar center of influence. Arts and sciences are reflected in the paintings themselves, but, more basic and more intimate, the selection opens to us the life of the people on farms and in the cities. Our deep preoccupation with religion appears in the work of Benjamin West, Edward Hicks and the too-long-neglected John Valentine Haidt. Our almost equal absorption in politics is at least touched upon in Krimmel's "Centre Square" and Francis' portrait of Governor Ritner at the plow. Portraiture, so long our dominant art, is here subordinated, but the examples which are included show superlatively well how our painters held their own as students and interpreters of human character. We see the portrait, too, as an attribute of social status, guarded through the early years by rigorous conventions. Such, it might be noted, is the strange and appealing portrait of the old chief, Tishcohan. John Penn, in 1735, did not commission Gustavus Hesselius to paint this as an ethnological document, as has occasionally been asserted, but was observing an established custom of international diplomacy.

Regional histories of the arts diminish in value as influences increasingly overflowed all older boundaries. But Pennsylvania's heritage well deserves a comprehensive survey, and has received it, briefly and authoritatively, in the introduction and text of this little book.

Dickinson College

Charles Coleman Sellers


Some excellent studies have been made of the Jay Treaty and of the period of controversy which led to President Madison's war message of June 1, 1812. However, there has been a long-standing need for a book on the Anglo-American rapprochement which took place between 1795 and 1804. Dr. Perkins has at last supplied us with the book which was needed, and it is a pleasure to be able to comment that he has written a very thorough and scholarly study of his subject.
Dr. Perkins' book begins with a discussion of the significance of the Jay Treaty in the history of Anglo-American relations. The treaty checked the drift of America and Britain toward what might have been the War of 1795. War was averted because of the diplomacy and the conciliatory spirit of the leaders of the Washington and Pitt administrations; in particular, credit for restoring friendly relations should be given to John Jay and to Britain's able Foreign Secretary, William Wyndham Grenville, Lord Grenville.

The good work begun by Jay and Grenville in 1794 was continued and carefully implemented by the Adams and Pitt administrations and, later on, by the Jefferson and Addington administrations. Pitt and Grenville were careful to send to Philadelphia an experienced diplomat, Robert Liston, who was particularly well-qualified to promote good understanding and friendly relations between the two English-speaking nations. The United States reciprocated by sending Senator Rufus King of New York to London to work for continued improvement in Anglo-American diplomatic and commercial relations. Liston and King both proved themselves to be able, personable, and conciliatory diplomats, and both made major contributions to the steady improvement of relations between their two countries in 1796, 1797, and for several years thereafter.

The diplomacy of Liston and King helped to settle various disputes and misunderstandings which had arisen between Britain and America. Dr. Perkins has, quite rightly, pointed out in some detail the key role played by the two men, but he has also made it clear that their efforts would have been in vain if they had not received the support of their governments. Rufus King's conciliatory diplomacy was based upon the desire of President Adams, and, later, of President Jefferson, to maintain friendly relations with Great Britain. Similarly, Robert Liston found that his efforts to be reasonable and conciliatory in dealing with the United States were approved and supported by his superior, Lord Grenville. In the circumstances, suspicions were dispelled, mutual understanding was established, and problems ranging from boundary disputes to disagreements over impressment of seamen and seizures of merchant ships were negotiated sensibly and amicably by British and American diplomats. The high point of the rapprochement between the two countries was reached when they cooperated in naval and military matters during America's undeclared naval war with France. There was a brief cooling of Anglo-American friendship in 1799, but the drift toward misunderstanding was quickly brought to a halt and the rapprochement was kept alive until 1804.

Dr. Perkins has done a fine job of archival research in Washington, London, Edinburgh, and elsewhere. He has written a very good book, and has made a major contribution to our knowledge of a decade of Anglo-American diplomatic and commercial relations. Unfortunately, however, he has overlooked some recent articles on certain phases of his subject—including the reviewer's articles on Robert Liston in the August, 1948, issue of the *Journal of Southern History* and the June 10, 1949, *Proceedings of the American

This publication on Germantown is the result of an admirable interest on the part of the citizens of this community in their old buildings. The Germantown Historical Society has set a worthy example. The book contains in happy proportions a history of the community by Harry and Margaret B. Tinkcom, and a professional account of its architecture in surveys of eighty-five buildings by Grant Miles Simon. As publisher the American Philosophical Society is to be congratulated once more.

As the advances, called progress in our civilization, take their toll of our architectural heritage, the need for an awareness of what our first two centuries can and should mean becomes increasingly pronounced. Here in this publication is a satisfying combination of the point of view of the architect and that of the historian.

In the first section pertaining to the history of this grand old village of Germantown one senses the characteristic flavor of one of the most appealing and significant of any of our early settlements. It is easy and pleasant to envisage the Germantown of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries as the Tinkcoms present it to the reader. Written with the conviction that can only result from sound study, substantiated by documentation, there is nothing of the stuffiness that might easily have characterized it. Regional historical accounts so often become stilted by an abundance of detail fascinating to the local historian but less appealing to the general reader. Here the story of Germantown from its beginnings and with its European background to the early nineteenth century is stated without important omission, yet unburdened.

The section on the early architecture of Germantown by Grant Miles Simon, follows easily and naturally. The colonial buildings of eastern Pennsylvania are a definite and distinctive part of the pattern of American architecture as a whole. Largely in local stone these houses have a sturdiness and strength that bebespeaks the courage of their builders. The photographs of exteriors and accompanying plans with entertaining and straightforward commentary present the architecture clearly before the reader. Mr. Simon has conveniently located each building with respect to the present time. Hence it can serve not only as a record but also as a very special guidebook. Seldom does one come upon a community with so many of its early buildings still standing. Stenton, Cliveden, Loudoun, and Upsala are outstanding examples. But it is important too to have buildings with special interests recorded in this way, such as the house of Daniel Pastorius, David Rittenhouse,
the little School of St. Michael Lutheran's Church, and the Dunkers' Church of the Brethren. The end paper maps and index contribute greatly as an aid for locating each of the buildings.

Such a work, confined as it is to its particular purpose and without needless repetition of already published material, should be the aim of all historical societies or similar organizations. The historical significance of a community is of course relative. But an orderly record such as this one, of areas reasonably important historically and architecturally, could be of inestimable value for future preservation by interested citizens and foundations, and a source of infinite pleasure for civic minded members of the community. It is the only means by which a comprehensive understanding of our history and architecture may ultimately be achieved.

University of Pittsburgh

VIRGINIA E. LEWIS


In 1939 the American Numismatic Society published Harrold E. Gillingham's Counterfeiting in Colonial Pennsylvania, a creditable job of research. Now, less than a generation later, the same institution has brought out Kenneth Scott's product with the same title, a volume to which the same characterization must be applied. Professor Scott's chronicle is more than three times as long as that of Gillingham's, chiefly because it has gone beyond Gillingham's sources to include new materials obtained in a thorough search of records of the county and provincial courts. While Gillingham included some materials for the years 1776-1788, the present author has rightly omitted such data; the Revolutionary Period deserves full and separate treatment.

In this new volume are to be found, apparently, all the known objective facts about counterfeiting in colonial Pennsylvania and Delaware. In spite of its subject matter this recital of facts will not hold the attention of readers. It constitutes, however, a valuable reference book for numismatists and may well serve the purposes of interpretive writers. Counterfeiting is demonstrated to have been common in colonial times, involving in crime not alone men on the margin of society, but also respectable Joseph Richardson, Samuel Ford, Samuel Jackson, and even that pious diarist of the Revolution, Christopher Marshall.

Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, Harrisburg

HENRY J. YOUNG