

Book Reviews:

Edited by Louis M. Waddell. *The Papers of Henry Bouquet, Volume 6: Selected Documents, November 1761—July 1765.*

(Harrisburg: The Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission: P.O. Box 1026, Harrisburg, PA, 17108. 1994. 898 pp. \$65.00 or \$200.00 for set of six.)

This last volume of the Papers of Henry Bouquet (1719-1765) covers the most historically significant segments of the Swiss-born British army colonel's career. It begins in November, 1761, immediately following Bouquet's proclamation banning settlement west of the Alleghenies and ends with his death in 1765. The texts deal primarily with Indian-white relations during the time of Pontiac's Rebellion, the most unified and successful Indian effort to combat white incursions. The edition continues to use the term Indians—not Native-Americans—but seeks whenever possible to employ the name of a particular group. The documents are divided between those selected for inclusion in the volume and those consigned to a microfiche supplement, coordinated through footnotes, and a catalogue of all known texts at the end of the volume. There is no interpretive introduction, but the editor delineates key issues and documents within a chronology placed at the beginning of the volume and through the sparse subject entries incorporated in the index. The documents are transcribed as literally and accurately as possible; French texts are given in the original language with a translation appended.

The documents cover a broad geographic area, from Detroit and Fort Pitt to New York, Philadelphia, and Williamsburg, and the incoming correspondence reports on many aspects of both the Indian and white societies of the era. Many provide everyday details of military life on the frontiers, including the inevitable supply problems and the occasional contracting abuses, while the more significant ones cover the battle of Bushy Run, Bouquet's relief of Fort Pitt under Indian attack, and his 1764 march into the Ohio Valley. The numerous documents relating to negotiations and conflicts with Indians run the gamut from enlightened efforts to preserve the peace, to unrelenting mutual suspicion, to horrifying atrocities on both sides.

Within the context of escalating warfare against a formidable foe appear the most controversial of the documents, those relating to the attempt to use biological or "germ" warfare against hostile tribes. Printed are Sir Jeffrey Amherst's notorious letters to Bouquet of July, 1763, recommending that he attempt to spread smallpox among the Indians. Bouquet's reply is consigned to microform, but it is discussed in notes. The contents of related texts indicating that Simeon Ecuyer, the Swiss-born commander at Fort Pitt, had, prior to this correspondence, already made such an attempt are highlighted in the chronology. Ecuyer's men, by giving blankets and handkerchiefs taken from the fort's smallpox ward to Delaware envoys they regarded as "spies" had, as Ecuyer's accounts confirm, intended that these presents spread smallpox. Subsequent reports on the spread of the smallpox among the Shawnees, Mingoes, and Delawares and the military consequences are printed in full. However, none of the texts provide evidence that either Ecuyer's actions or any as yet undocumented implementation of Amherst's recommendation were in fact the cause of the later smallpox outbreaks. Nevertheless, the texts remain the only solid evidence available of a policy of deliberate biological warfare against Indians. The editorial framework of the volume does not provide scope

for in-depth discussion or interpretation of this subject; for that the reader must turn to the nineteenth-century writings of Francis Parkman and Bernhard Knollenberg's article "General Amherst and Germ Warfare" and the responses to it published in 1954 in the *Mississippi Valley Historical Review*.

Amherst's letters in this volume justify his reputation as an arrogant, insensitive, and intolerant commander—a politically incorrect villain straight out of central casting. Bouquet appears as a tough but fair commander, relatively unprejudiced and capable of honorable dealings with Indians, who struggles, often vainly, to implement treaties, suppress illicit trade, and impose some discipline and order in a wayward frontier environment. The Indian chiefs with whom he negotiates appear equally hard pressed to preserve peace and security in the face of lawless settlers and provocative actions by "hotheads" among their peoples.

Overall, the portrait of western Pennsylvanians that emerges from Bouquet's papers is not flattering, particularly in the aftermath of the massacre of friendly, dependent Indians by the "Paxton Boys" in 1764 and the failure of Pennsylvanians to volunteer as soldiers for frontier defense. An incensed Bouquet laments the irresponsible, mean-spirited behavior of Pennsylvanians, asking "Will not people say that they have found it easier to kill Indians in the Goal [Jail] than to fight them fairly in the woods," and adding "I hope that this will be the Last Time I Shall Venture my Reputation and Life for their Sake." As he prepares to leave the province, he warns against "the licentious spirit still subsisting" in western Pennsylvania and predicts that "a connection seems probable among that Sort of People, which if not suppressed might involve us in many difficulties with the Indians."

At the end of the volume Bouquet, having succeeded in temporarily restoring peace on the frontier, is promoted to Brigadier General and assigned to the southern district headquartered in Florida. His last documents include his will and his farewells to his Pennsylvania friends. His rewards for his achievements were short-lived since Bouquet succumbed to fever immediately upon his arrival at Pensacola.

Although only a small portion of the texts are personal, those dealing with Bouquet's courtships of Anne Willing and Margaret (Peggy) Oswald reflect Bouquet's quest, now that he was in his forties, for the comforts of marriage, and provide interesting depictions of the Philadelphia social life within which these romances took place. Overall, this carefully edited volume is primarily useful for students of military life and Indian affairs, but it also provides numerous other insights into life in eighteenth-century Pennsylvania and its neighboring frontiers.

Elizabeth M. Nuxoll, *The Papers of Robert Morris*, Queens College of CUNY

By Virginia K. Bartlett. *Keeping House: Women's Lives in Western Pennsylvania, 1790-1850*.

(Pittsburgh: Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania and University of Pittsburgh Press, 1994. xxii+ 178 pp. \$39.95 cloth. \$19.95 paper.)

This book examines the everyday lives of ordinary women in western Pennsylvania during the half century that encompassed the area's evolution from an isolated frontier to a region of thriving farms and flourishing towns. Virginia Bartlett describes women's reactions to the journey west across the Allegheny Mountains, their efforts to establish new homes in the

wilderness, and their experiences in the fledgling urban communities of southwestern Pennsylvania. She creates a detailed picture of the components of their daily routines in chapters that focus on material household goods; diet, food preparation, and alcohol consumption; health and medicine; education and religion; courtship and marriage; and leisure activities.

Under the difficult economic conditions that characterized early western Pennsylvania, women typically confronted hard labor and a lower standard of living than they had known in the east. Frontier farm life was not conducive to the development of personal autonomy. Wives enjoyed few legal rights and played subordinate roles while their husbands made the important decisions. Town life mitigated some of the hardships of the rural setting, providing access to more substantial dwellings, diverse material goods, household servants, and eventually amenities such as dancing classes and concerts.

In contrast to the many letters and diaries that record early-nineteenth-century American female experiences in the east and the far west, very few accounts of life on the western Pennsylvania frontier document women's perspectives and impressions directly. Bartlett uses the available evidence effectively, drawing on a wide range of primary sources such as personal recipe and remedy books, family papers, newspapers and magazines, prescriptive literature, and the published reminiscences of both male and female settlers and travelers. Numerous illustrations—paintings, engravings, drawings, and photographs of objects from the collections of the Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania and other sources—enhance the text. Among the most interesting are several charming drawings from the diary of Liwwat Boke, a young woman who traveled from Germany to join her husband on the Ohio frontier.

The book's overall approach emphasizes description more than analysis. The author concentrates primarily on the domestic world and women's household responsibilities as they have been defined traditionally, although references to female tavernkeepers and innkeepers provide evidence of other activities as well. Bartlett does not engage with the current historiographic discussion regarding the nature of women's sphere in the past, the debate about whether or not the private and public spheres were actually separate and distinct from one another. But she does locate the specific experiences of women in western Pennsylvania in a broader social historical context. For example, references to widely-read prescriptive literature such as Lydia Maria Child's *The American Frugal Housewife* and Godey's *The Ladies Book*, and to more general historical trends, as in the discussion of the ideology of republican motherhood as an impetus for the development of educational institutions for women in western Pennsylvania, link local developments with those in the wider society. Similarly, descriptions of the dirt and smoke that characterized Pittsburgh in the 1820s and beyond suggest the impact of the nascent Industrial Revolution.

This volume offers many intriguing details that will interest the general reader. It vividly portrays a resourceful and determined group of women—how they performed the myriad of duties assigned to early-nineteenth-century wives and mothers—and even includes some of their favorite recipes with updated versions for the late-twentieth-century cook. While it does not suggest any new historical insights, it provides interesting and relevant data about the experiences of ordinary post-Revolutionary women outside the New England area, and thus extends the range of our existing knowledge about women's lives in the early years of the American nation.

Linda W. Rosenzweig, *Chatham College*

By Norman Johnston with Kenneth Finkel and Jeffrey A. Cohen. *Eastern State Penitentiary: Crucible of Good Intentions*.

(Philadelphia: The Philadelphia Museum of Art, Philadelphia, PA 19130. 1994. Pp. 116. Write for information.)

For 142 years, from 1829 to 1971, Eastern State Penitentiary housed tens of thousands of prisoners. No building ever constructed in Philadelphia was more emulated. No building was more visited by Europeans in search of America's republican mysteries. No building better represented Philadelphia's reputation as the world capital of philanthropic and benevolent intentions. Perhaps no building in Philadelphia went through so many additions, remodelings, and reconceptualizations. No building more bitterly disappointed its progenitors because, as it is said in the book under review, "noble ideas collided with reality." And no building in United States history that became such a crucible of misery has ever been so evocatively, elegantly, and expensively treated in book form.

Crucible of Good Intentions accompanies a recent exhibit that commemorated the history and architecture of the Eastern State Penitentiary (ESP), known familiarly as Cherry Hill (for the orchard it replaced). Such a commemoration occurred only because civic-minded Philadelphians wanted to preserve, in recycled form, John Haviland's much-copied building, erected to rehabilitate eastern Pennsylvania's criminal element in the early nineteenth century. By the 1980s, ESP was a crumbling hulk, scheduled to give way to private development. With a grant from the Pew Charitable Trust, it was possible to save ESP from the wrecker's ball; the vast prison complex now resides in the hands of a talented group of planners, historians, and conservationists.

This beautifully illustrated book is a visual and verbal gem. A sparkling essay by Kenneth Finkel traces the "new civic consciousness" in the 1820s that spawned, through an amalgam of Quaker idealism and non-Quaker pragmatism, a muscular, new public architecture, most dramatically represented by Haviland's hub-and-spoke penitentiary.

Norman Johnston continues his distinguished career with four essays that form the heart of the book. In the first, he describes Philadelphia as a city, in DeTocqueville's words, "infatuated with the penitentiary system": the hope to reform criminals through separate solitary confinement on the theory that barren solitude would lead to reflection, then to remorse, then to religion, and finally to self-reformation. In his second essay, Johnston reconstructs the building of ESP under Haviland's seven-spoke plan. Even before ESP was completed—it took fourteen years—the penitentiary system was under heavy attack. The visiting Charles Dickens called solitary confinement "cruel and wrong . . . I hold this slow and daily tampering with the mysteries of the brain, to be immeasurably worse than any torture of the body. . . ."

Johnston's third essay, the most valuable for social and cultural historians, surveys the *modus operandi* of ESP. Almost from the beginning it functioned poorly. If it was an architectural triumph, it was a social failure. Built for 250 prisoners, each in a separate cell, Cherry Hill was quickly housing within its massive walls far more inmates than was intended, thus undermining the cardinal rule for separate confinement where prisoners would never see, hear, talk to, or work with other prisoners. By the late nineteenth century, new cell blocks were constructed for a burgeoning inmate population, which topped 1,400 by 1893. The solitary system quickly crumbled. In any event, the penal reformers never demonstrated that the penitent ideal rehabilitated those who walked through the massive gates of ESP.

In a fourth essay, Johnston traces the amazing international impact of Haviland's prison design. Cherry Hill, he opines, "must be considered the most influential prison ever built and arguably the American building most widely imitated in Europe and Asia in the nineteenth century" (p. 105).

Jeffrey Cohen contributes a chapter that traces the dismal remaking of Cherry Hill into a twentieth-century warehouse for Pennsylvania's most hardbitten convicts. Though obsolete and archaic, the state kept pouring money into enlarging and modernizing the prison. Adding rows of cell blocks that bastardized Haviland's architectural triumph only compounded ESP's notorious reputation. Eminent penologists described it in the 1940s as "one of the worst prisons in any civilized state" (p. 94). Functioning until 1971 (though described by Pennsylvania's governor in 1944 as "not fit for human habitation"), its future now, if it has one, is as a national penological museum. If the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority is not able to save it, or at least part of its original form, this book will remain as the principal testimony to one of the nineteenth century's most expensive and wrongheaded ideas.

Gary B. Nash, *University of California, Los Angeles*

By Thomas Mellon. *Thomas Mellon and His Times.*

(Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1994. Pp. 560. \$35.00.)

Thomas Mellon may be one of American business history's best kept secrets. Although a contemporary of Andrew Carnegie and Henry Clay Frick (the latter having built his coking empire with the help of a timely Mellon bank loan), the immensely successful Pittsburgh financier never attracted the same attention accorded his fellow entrepreneurs. Perhaps Mellon's stern, Scots-Irish temperament would have disapproved of such publicity. Or perhaps he anticipated that the careers of his progeny—which included son Andrew and grandson Richard King—would assure the family name its place in the pantheon of American history.

For all those reasons, the commercial publication of *Thomas Mellon and His Times*, printed privately by Thomas Mellon in 1885, is a welcome supplement to an underdocumented subject and a bracingly honest insider's account of industrial capitalism in its early stages. Mellon begins his memoirs with a straightforward and mostly unsentimental description of his childhood in Northern Ireland, his family's passage to America in 1818, and the Mellons early years on a farmstead near Poverty Point (located outside of present-day Murrys ville). The remainder of the autobiography outlines young Thomas's steady rise from reluctant farmer—Mellon left the family farm for the relatively bright lights of Pittsburgh in the 1830—to the professional ranks of attorney, judge, speculator, and eventually, banker. Brief introductory essays by David McCullough, grandson Paul Mellon, and Mary Louise Briscoe who served as editor help to place the memoir in the context of nineteenth century autobiography and Mellon family history. (Although Thomas Mellon had directed that his memoir be restricted to family and descendants, Paul Mellon permitted the University of Pittsburgh Press to republish the manuscript in the belief that his grandfather's book "deserved a wider readership.")

The trajectory of Mellon's career placed him in an ideal position to observe some of the tumultuous events of the nineteenth century, albeit from the often pragmatic lens of a tight-

fisted businessman. While admitting the tragic consequences of Pittsburgh's Great Fire of 1845, for instance, Mellon is also quick to note how the disaster stimulated a frenzied building spree from which he and others benefited. The Civil War is similarly reduced to its economic features: from Mellon's perspective, the "war of rebellion" was more a source of financial anxiety than a moral cause, a view undoubtedly shared by many of his contemporaries. (For Mellon, who opened his bank in downtown Pittsburgh in 1870, it is the panic of 1873 which figures more ominously in the course of American history.) Even his observations on his private life fall to the cold calculus of the shrewd capitalist. Mellon only half-facetiously suggests that the courtship process be revised along business-like terms so as to avoid "the shy, coy, evasive methods in use." (His 65-year marriage to Sarah Jane Negley became by his own admission his wisest investment.)

Mellon's reminiscences are thus anything but a dull accounting. Having been a life-long admirer of Benjamin Franklin, Mellon relies on both his professional and personal experiences to exact lessons on everything from marriage and child-rearing to lawyering and real estate investment. Readers will find some of these observations, such as Mellon's treatise on taxes and "vexatious litigation" astonishingly prescient and surprisingly humorous. Other views, particularly on social issues, appear harsh in the light of modern sensitivities but are consistent with nineteenth-century thought and the perspective of one whose own career seemed to confirm the availability of opportunity, at least for those willing to exercise self-discipline. In true Horatio Alger fashion, Mellon continually asserts the fundamental fairness of capitalism, even though he acknowledges the sometimes tedious routine required by its practice. "Professional success," he admits after a lengthy discussion of his legal career, "is not followed for the love of it" but rather the financial independence it offers—a distinctly modern view.

Although his contradictions may not have been pronounced as those of Henry Ford, Mellon presents a similar paradox. He laments the passage of rural society at the same time that he candidly admits rejecting the farming life his father had intended for him; after observing the wealth of Pittsburgh families like the Negleys and other benefits of "accumulation," life at Poverty Point lost its pastoral charm. At other times, particularly in a closing chapter entitled "Changes of a Lifetime," Mellon seems almost wistful for the lost world of self-reliant artisans and independent entrepreneurs. "Small proprietors who own their own tools and work on their own materials are better contented and make better citizens." It's a remarkable sentiment, even if Mellon conveniently overlooks his own role in the destruction of that pre-industrial paradise. But it is these kinds of perspectives that make *Thomas Mellon and His Times* consistently stimulating to read.

Curtis Miner, *The State Museum of Pennsylvania*

By Eric Homberger. *Scenes from the Life of a City: Corruption and Conscience in Old New York.*

(New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994. Pp. x, 358, 60 illus. \$30.00.)

This aptly titled book is about contrasts: shadows and sunshine, the squalor and human misery of Five Points versus the elegance of Fifth Avenue and the pastoralism of Central Park, the infamous abortionist Madame Restell and the corrupt politico Richard B. Connolly ver-

sus the efforts of dozens, perhaps hundreds of middle-class New Yorkers who feared that their community was being lost as a result of rapid and relentless urban growth and whose reformist efforts tried to span the chasm separating the disparate peoples of the city.

Scenes from the Life of a City consists of four lengthy chapters about episodes in New York's history during the middle years of the nineteenth century. The first, "The Lower Depths," demonstrates the author's approach to his subject. It begins with a series of Dantesque accounts describing the Five Points, New York's most notorious slum, and of the efforts of reformers such as Robert Hartley, Charles Loring Brace, and Lewis M. Pease to counter the omnipresent effects of poverty. Important too were the sanitary reformers—John H. Griscom, Stephen Smith, Elisha Harris, and numerous colleagues—who attempted to promote public health and prevent the spread of infectious diseases. These themes came together as the reformers and their wealthy supporters realized that unsanitary conditions threatened all residents of the city and that corrupt politicians opposed their efforts. The arrival of the second epidemic of Asiatic cholera in 1865 strengthened the hands of reformers, who carried the day in the state legislature with the creation of the Metropolitan Board of Health in February, 1866.

Some of the individuals who energetically promoted public health were just as committed to a related cause, the criminalization of abortion, which serves as the theme of the second chapter. Physicians such as Stephen Smith and Gunning Bedford battled the infamous abortionist Madame Restell, whom Homberger describes as a "complex cultural icon" (p. 102). She was the city's most successful and notorious purveyor of quack medicines and other remedies for "women's conditions." Restell's frequent confrontations with the law, and her own boasts that she bribed her way out of trouble in Tammany's city, provide the connection to the career of "Slippery Dick" Connolly, comptroller of New York City during the ascendancy of the Tweed "Ring." The Committee of 70 that toppled the "Ring" represented an overlapping elite of merchants, professionals, and an old aristocracy that supported the philanthropists and the reformers. These same concerns—for social order and public health, for efficient government and professional expertise—culminated in the construction of Central Park, a public space open to all residents of the city, which Homberger judges the one true success of mid-nineteenth-century reform. Whereas the crusades against the city's slums, against abortion, and against Tammany Hall at best could claim only limited success, the park, a positive achievement, represented the "hopes as well as the fears" of its residents (p. 293).

Although the subject of each chapter of *Scenes* could stand alone, the author attempts to achieve coherence through the use of intersecting biographies, analysis of the process and limits of reform, and a concern for the meaning of community in a discordant urban environment. There are significant problems with the book. There is no explanation of why these "scenes," and not others, exemplify mid-century New York; there is little sense of progression from chapter to chapter; and no attention is paid to change over time. But Homberger's work also has genuine merit, particularly the author's shrewd analysis of texts, keen eye for detail, and solid interpretation of his subject's motives and aspirations. This is a very idiosyncratic book, but also a very interesting and ultimately rewarding one.

David Schuyler, *Franklin & Marshall College*

Mark Wahlgren Summers, *The Press Gang: Newspapers and Politics, 1865-1878*.

(Chapel Hill and London: University of North Carolina Press, 1994. Pp. xiii+405. \$49.95 cloth. \$17.95 paper.)

This book studies successfully a transition period in the history of American newspapers, largely neglected by journalism historians, in which the old personal editors were passing from the scene and the "New Journalism" of Joseph Pulitzer and others had yet to emerge. Newspapers were changing from personal editorial organs into corporate enterprises. Reporters' importance increased, especially that of the Washington press corps. A transition was made from party papers to independents, characterized not by neutrality but by "political engagement and a strong commitment on public issues" (p. 66), dominated by such editors as Charles A. Dana of the *New York Sun*, Horace White of the *Chicago Times*, and Murat Halstead of the *Cincinnati Commercial*. Summers surveys the woeful coverage of the Reconstruction issue in the national press. And his study of corruption in government, and in the press that covered it, is a sequel in some ways to the author's earlier book, *The Era of Good Stealing*. It is, then, difficult to do justice to the work in a short review.

Summers' focus is on reporters and their "investigative reporting" of the corruption issue during a period of transition from party patronage of newspapers to the private patronage of business interests. Reporters lobbied as a sideline and speculated on the basis of inside information. Summers provides a number of meaningful anecdotes and short biographical sketches to illustrate press ethics. "Striker" Uriah Hunt Painter of the *Philadelphia Inquirer* and *New York Sun*, an extortionist and shakedown artist in the pay of lobbyists is an example, as is Donna Piatt of the *Washington Sunday Capital*, a cynical master of character assassination.

Politicians learned the techniques of press management in the Gilded Age, and there is much rich detail on this topic, such as James A. Garfield's skill and Ulysses S. Grant's ineptitude. In 1876 Rutherford B. Hayes's more astute handling of the press than his opponent, Samuel J. Tilden, was partly responsible for the general acceptance of his disputed election.

Three central chapters center on Reconstruction in the South, and especially on the roving special correspondents who reported it for the Northern metropolitan papers. Their coverage reflected both racial and class biases, with their almost complete reliance on disaffected upper class whites as sources. They spent most of their time in state capitals and seldom visited rural areas. Corruption was the dominant theme. There was no balance because there was no strong Republican press in the South, and the Southern reports of the Associated Press came exclusively from Democratic papers. A long case study of newspaper coverage of the December, 1874, race riot in Vicksburg provides compelling proof.

After 1872 the press gang began to break up. The defeat of the Liberal Republican movement, supported by so many independent editors, meant that "the independent press had lost much of its moral power by hazarding all on Greeley and losing so badly" (p. 255). By 1874 most independents were back in the Republican fold, and Hayes was very astute in his press management. The crusading zeal of the Washington press corps was largely gone by the 1880s, and reporters became a part of the Washington establishment. Politics declined in importance as a story, and "objectivity" grew as a concept on the part of reporters.

Summers' research into newspaper and manuscript collections is exhaustive and the

book is written with zest. Twenty-three cartoons, mostly by Thomas Nast, are a valuable accompaniment to the text. The book is must reading for all students of newspaper history, the Reconstruction era, and post-Civil War politics.

James L. Crouthamel, *Hobart and William Smith Colleges*

By Jon C. Teaford. *Cities of the Heartland: The Rise and Fall of the Industrial Midwest.*

(Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994. Pp. 300. \$39.95.)

In *Cities of the Heartland*, Jon C. Teaford chronicles the life cycles of America's midwestern industrial cities. Beginning with their emergence as aspiring trade centers on the western frontier of the early nineteenth century, he traces their transformation into industrial powerhouses by the dawn of the twentieth century, and then their trials of maturity and tribulations of industrial collapse 75 to 100 years later. Calling his book "a biography of that life" (p. vii), Teaford covers familiar ground in his description of the cities' economic development, unfolding geographies, changing populations from successive waves of migration from Europe and then the American South, union organization, and Progressive reform. Just as familiar is the format, used in several of his previous works, *The Municipal Revolution in America* (1975); *City and Suburb: The Political Fragmentation of Metropolitan America, 1870-1970* (1979); *The Unheralded Triumph: City Government in America, 1870-1900* (1984); and *The Rough Road to Renaissance: Urban Revitalization, 1940-1985* (1990). In each study, he identifies a broad, important theme and develops it through a survey and synthesis of the experiences of several cities, often depending on a vast array of secondary writings.

Unlike Teaford's previous work, which explored a particular aspect of urban life, the central theme in *Cities of the Heartland* is the distinctive regional character of midwestern cities, what he calls their "heartland consciousness" or "interior mentality." Although these midwestern cities of the Old Northwest—from Cleveland, Cincinnati, Detroit, Chicago, and Milwaukee to smaller ones such as Youngstown, Akron, and Dayton—shared features of geography, dependence on the exploitation of similar natural resources, and ethnic composition (especially German and Slavic), it was their common heartland cultural outlook, Teaford argues, which shaped a regional distinctiveness no less striking than that of other commonly recognized, regional clusters of cities such as those of the Northeast, South, or West Coast. Starting out as frontier upstarts remote from the nation's eastern core, midwestern cities strove to overcome their interior isolation both economically and culturally. With the achievement of industrial power, especially from the automobile industry, these cities gravitated from the nation's margins to its vital center and moved for a while to the forefront in urban planning, municipal and social reform, and architecture. Midwestern architects (Frank Lloyd Wright), landscape architects (Jens Jensen), and writers (Carl Sandburg, Theodore Dreiser) found a common voice, becoming cultural innovators instead of imitators. The Midwest, led by its cities, embodied truly American values; they were the nation's heartland. In these chapters Teaford's prose comes alive with inspired interpretations of familiar material.

The period of midwestern cultural ascendancy was short-lived. Economic maturity and decline after 1930 drained these cities of their vitality and restored their awareness of inferiority, as "cultural colonies" of eastern cities and now also the dynamic West Coast. Teaford's

life cycle metaphor for these cities implies that decline (old age) might lead to death. But he does not predict these cities' literal demise; rather he suggests they might be buried within the amorphous sprawl of the megalopolitan landscape.

Although he defined his midwestern cities as those of the Old Northwest states, Teaford included St. Louis because of its position adjacent to Illinois and rivalries with Chicago and Cincinnati. By the same logic, he might have included Pittsburgh. The Gateway to the West and later Steel City shared "geography, natural resources, and ethnicity" (ix) with its sister industrial powerhouses. But did Pittsburgh share the heartland consciousness? Pennsylvanians living east of the Allegheny Mountains might wonder why Teaford did not include Pittsburgh; Pittsburghers would not question his decision to exclude it. Pittsburghers looked to the East Coast for experts, architects, and cultural inspiration. Indeed, Pittsburghers did and do think of themselves as easterners; the Midwest begins 50 miles west at the Ohio border.

While Pittsburghers could locate themselves comfortably within Teaford's description of the midwestern urban industrial experience, they could not identify with the regional outlook. His survey approach has not allowed him to develop fully the issue of heartland identity and its importance for the shaping of cities. Pittsburghers would not understand why they have not had a heartland mentality or what difference it made. Teaford might do well to take up the topic of city identity or culture for his next work.

Edward K. Muller, *University of Pittsburgh*

By Patricia Burgess. *Planning for the Private Interest: Land Use Controls and Residential Patterns in Columbus, Ohio, 1900-1970.*

(Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1994. Pp. 258. \$59.50.)

Over the years since New York City enacted the first American zoning ordinance in 1916, historians, social critics, and planners themselves have religiously scorned the practice. Lewis Mumford in his magisterial *Culture of Cities* (1938) assailed zoning for pandering to business and industry and irrationally intensifying urban land use when "natural" economic forces at the time operated to lower them (p. 245). The historian William Wilson [*Coming of Age: Urban America 1915-1974*(1994)] viewed zoning as quintessential "mole" work and as "narrow, partial [and] socially defective (p. 131)."

Paradoxically, the above encapsulation of anti-zoning rhetoric notwithstanding, zoning in practice has thrived, and nowhere more, as Patricia Burgess's *Planning for the Private Interest* makes clear, than in suburbia. First, Burgess explains, business, especially suburban developers, coopted zoning as a means of officially and permanently implanting private land-use exclusions originally framed as covenants and deed restrictions. Second, following Christine Boyer and others, Burgess contends that zoning stabilized urban land values while allowing developers to recast profitably the character of older neighborhoods through the appeals and rezoning process. Likewise, zoning protected the interest of suburban middle-class property owners who viewed housing more as investment than as shelter.

The author's incisive historical analysis of the zoning and planning process in Columbus, Ohio, from 1900 to 1970 balances the effectiveness of zoning as a public policy against private sector land development practices in shaping the metropolitan region. Burgess's study of course encompasses the city of Columbus, including a look at both its 1908

"City Beautiful" plan and Harland Bartholomew's 1957 planning report. She assesses unfavorably the effectiveness of zoning in controlling central city land use. But the book emphasizes much more the development of the Columbus periphery. Therefore, it beautifully complements Marc Weiss's study *The Rise of the Community's Builders: The American Real Estate Industry and Urban Land Planning* (1989) and Doris Keating's look at Chicago suburb building.

To defend her argument that in Columbus "privatism" triumphed over the commonweal, Burgess delineates the forces shaping the twentieth-century Columbus metropolitan region. She sees a three-pronged process: planning, zoning, and land development. Planning and zoning emerged together around 1900 as part of the Progressive reform concern for slum overcrowding, bad housing, mixed land usage, and the general seaminess of the urban environment. Zoning, in the words of its apostle, Edward Bassett, addressed all of these reform concerns, for by separating industrial, commercial, and residential land uses, it presumably eliminated speculative profits. Most early planners (like other reformers) embraced zoning, while at the same time protesting that it did not replace planning.

Burgess bemoans that after World War II, as the city annexed one contiguous suburban community after another, zoning increasingly served to imprint a developer-molded urban landscape. This was even true in independent suburbs where postwar zoning embedded the class and status character which prior to the war developers had imposed through high-priced racially and land-use restrictive deeds and covenants.

Burgess's is the best case study to date of the "effectiveness" of zoning, especially zoning's usefulness in perpetuating the suburban mystique. She beautifully fits her narrative into a planning history context making her book very appropriate for both urban and planning history courses. Perhaps, however, her exploration of zoning in the city of Columbus itself is less useful. Planning there, she observes, did not take hold as it did in Pittsburgh, Cleveland, Cincinnati, and elsewhere. Columbus, indeed, failed to create a planning department until after World War II. For that reason, the city's 1923 zoning ordinance in truth substituted for planning, and without a planning department to impose "discipline," the city's Board of Zoning Appeals succumbed to the wiles of real estate developers. Burgess's main and important contribution lies in her superb presentation of the complex interaction of private and public actors, developers, public works departments, planners, zoning boards, and private homeowners in the shaping of a metropolitan region. It is a story and a book that will find an important place on the shelves of urban historians and, one hopes, urban officials in Pennsylvania as well as Ohio.

John F. Bauman, *California University of Pennsylvania*