By Thomas Dublin, *When the Mines Closed: Stories of Struggles in Hard Times.*


Most studies of the anthracite coal mining region concentrate on the period prior to the irreversible decline in the 1950's and 1960's. Thomas Dublin's *When the Mines Closed: Stories of Struggles in Hard Times* examines the region since that time. Dublin tells the story through oral histories. He gives a brief account of the rise and fall of the industry, but individual narratives comprise the core of the book. The narratives give insight into community life and depict how people coped with changing economic circumstances.

The coal industry reached its peak in 1917, but dwindled thereafter due to the introduction of alternative fuels. It enjoyed a brief revitalization during World War II, but the bottom fell out of the market in the 1950s and 1960s, and life as people knew it, came to an abrupt halt. Dublin interviewed about ninety people who lived through the transition and selected thirteen accounts he felt represented the broader population. He included seven men and six women, most were in their seventies or eighties at the time of the interviews and experienced the industry's decline in their thirties or forties. The majority resided in the Pennsylvania Panther Valley region in Coaldale, Summit Hill, Lansford and Nesquehoning. They were second-generation American-born children of southern and eastern European immigrants, and the attachment to family, ethnic group, church and community remained strong. Immigration and a history of labor organization created a tradition of ethnic and class solidarity.

The personal chronicles describe the effects of the mine closings, the rise of the garment industry and the impact of outmigration. People made difficult choices based on their values and beliefs. Women went to work in the garment industry and men accepted jobs with less pay. Others moved out of the area permanently. Most of those interviewed stayed or returned after retirement, but their children left. By the third generation, economic concerns took precedence over community ties. The older generation expressed satisfaction with their decision as well as pride in the accomplishments of their children. Although most were surviving on Social Security and small pensions, they had no regrets.

George Harvan's accompanying photographs illustrate the strength and confidence the individuals exhibited. Harvan, a life long resident of Lansford, is the son of a Slovak coal miner. He understood the culture and he portrayed the people as they saw themselves. The pictures evoke respect not pity. Harvan
and Dublin allowed the individuals to tell their history from their own perspective. To insure authenticity, Dublin did very little editing.

The oral histories demonstrate how ordinary people coped with extraordinary situations and how life changed from generation to generation. The coal miners were one of the first groups to experience the impact of deindustrialization and their histories expand our understanding of the human consequences of the process. By dealing with this neglected area, Dublin makes an important contribution to the fields of labor and social history.

Judith McDonough, Indiana University of Pennsylvania


Country clubs, together with parks and natural areas, constitute some of the largest open spaces in the metropolitan landscape. The lush landscape of the fairways and the entrance drives seems timeless and unchanging; yet as James A. Mayo points out, the country club is an evolving form, a product of the processes of urban and suburban development and the development of new forms of leisure. It is also a barometer of social and economic trends, changing roles within the family, and the emergence of a culture of professionalism. Perhaps surprisingly, while there have been any number of books about individual clubs or golf courses, this is the first historical study of the country club as physical space and setting for sports and social ritual.

Mayo attributes the development of the country club to four causes: the emergence of elite men's clubs in cities during the second half of the nineteenth century; the popularity of summer resorts as a means of spending leisure in a pecuniary culture; the increasing popularity of elite sports; and suburbanization, which the author describes as a “landscape solution that reinforced the class status of elites” (58). From these roots Mayo traces the changing landscape of the country club, the almost invariably conservative nature of club house design—surely an attempt to claim heritage or tradition in a rapidly changing society—and the ways the club as an institution has evolved in response to social and economic change in the twentieth century.

The American Country Club is part social history, part design history, part institutional history. Especially useful is the author's evocation of the difficulty of transportation links from city to club in the pre-automobile era, his description of the conflict within clubs over the amount of space allocated to golf and other sports, the role of country clubs as real estate developers, and his analysis of the changing organizational structure of the club as management became a professional responsibility. As golf has become big business,
control of many clubs has passed to for-profit corporations located far from the pastoral fairways—a trend that parallels the consolidation of leisure activities and other service industries at the end of the twentieth century.

Valuable as these dimensions are, *The American Country Club* occasionally leaves the reader disappointed. At times the author slips into the voice of the proponents of country club life he quotes, as, for example, when he asserts that the advantages of the club “are not far removed from the basic beliefs found in Jeffersonian democracy” (84), or when he allusively, and too uncritically, refers to the “values” the country club exemplifies. Similarly, Mayo describes the country club as a familial environment, but the shift from the men’s grill to a mixed grill is hardly a demonstration of gender equity. One chapter, “Country Clubs for Everybody,” really doesn’t mean everybody—just all members of the family, really just people with a little money and a little time—which of course will leave readers wondering why Mayo chose the chapter title in the first place. This lack of authorial certitude, of a consistent voice and argument, is most evident in the final paragraph, in which Mayo describes the country club as the product of an “elite culture advancing its values in the American landscape” (207). So much for everybody, so much for Jeffersonian democracy. Although it is ambitious in scope and interdisciplinary in perspective, *The American Country Club* ultimately raises as many questions as it resolves.

David Schuyler, Franklin & Marshall College


(University Park: Penn State Press, 1998, Pp. xxii, 257 pages; maps, photos. $29.95, Cloth.

In recent years, the National Park Service recognized the logic of employing historians to help managers understand the ways in which agency policies develop over time. Management turnover at many national parks is fairly high, and newly appointed managers at a site can be easily puzzled by the decisionmaking of their predecessors—particularly because many, if not most, policies are the products of contested political struggles and can only be understood in some historical context. Public policymaking is not always a rational process.

Policymaking at Manassas National Battlefield Park, for example, has rarely been entirely rational. Preservation here had originally been managed by private or local groups like the Sons of Confederate Veterans (located in Virginia, this was the site of, not one, but two important Southern victories). Private resources were limited, however, and in 1940 Manassas supporters worked with the Roosevelt administration to bring Manassas into the Na-
national Park system. During World War II, Park Service development was understandably put on hold, but afterwards the agency opened an interpretive museum and began a series of land acquisitions that would increase greatly in subsequent years. Visitation was fairly limited through the 1950s, and so was the size of the staff: there were only four superintendents between 1940 and 1969, all of whom acted as park historians in fact if not name. This was a time when park politics were far more localized and relatively more simple than today and when park management was far less professionally sophisticated.

By the late 1950s, however, suburban sprawl began to affect Manassas, raising real estate values and bringing the entire region under significant development pressure. And since then, the managers of Manassas National Battlefield Park have been pitted against commercial developers, local and state governments, private land owners, and others in a series of twentieth century battles that—except for the actual bloodshed—rival the ferocity of their nineteenth century predecessors. These battles were national in scope and included a 1957-58 interstate highway plan, a 1969 congressional initiative to build an annex to Arlington National Cemetery at Manassas, the Marriott Corporation's 1973 plan to build a historical theme park adjacent to the park, a 1988 shopping mall development scheme, and the celebrated 1993 attempt to build "Disney's America" in the nearby town of Haymarket.

To complicate matters for a succession of professional park managers, proximity to Washington nationalized the park's visibility, and policies at Manassas both caused and reflected changes within the agency. The 1961 reenactment of the first battle, for example, thrilled Civil War enthusiasts but so threatened park resources that it caused the Park Service to forbid future reenactments at any of its sites. Interpretation itself became more wide ranging in order to satisfy a public that demanded more than a description of military strategy. And the park's handling of seemingly innocuous problems caused by its horse program in the late-80s and early-90s—which found Vice President Quayle involved in the controversy—embarrassed park officials before Congress and the public.

Given this busy history, the National Park Service was indeed wise to commission historian Joan M. Zenzen to try to make sense of Manassas. Zenzen's study, happily, is a good one, and it should certainly be mandatory reading for future managers and staff at the site. While the book does not contribute significantly to the growing literature among scholars about the public's uses and understandings of history, Penn State Press's decision to rework this study and make it available to a larger, public audience was still a sensible one. Zenzen describes and analyzes this complicated history insightfully and well, and because the issues raised at Manassas resonate at historic sites both inside and outside the National Park Service, this excellent study in public policy deserves a wide audience.
The principal issues, of course, revolve around the relationship between the Park Service and the public. The agency does indeed have conflicting missions of resource protection and recreational use, and there are inevitably interests inside and outside the agency that advocate the primacy of one mission over the other—just as there are various interests that favor one historical interpretation over another. Likewise, historical agencies and preservationists often find conflict with proponents of economic development, and national, state, and local interests are not always compatible with each other either. It would consequently be foolish to think that public agencies like the Park Service can avoid conflict—and compromise—and carry out their policies in a vacuum. Zenzen's thoughtful study can help teach people a lot about the need to work together in the public interest, and it should certainly be used by the Park Service to develop more proactive, politically savvy policies before confronting its next crisis at Manassas or Gettysburg or wherever its mission comes to be threatened by special interests.

Robert Weible, Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission

Edited by Michael B. Katz and Thomas J. Sugrue. W. E. B. Dubois, Race, and the City.


Katz and Sugrue set out to make century-old scholarship come alive, to breathe new life into an 1899 view of a city, and into the ideas of a young scholar working on urban topics under the aegis of the University of Pennsylvania one hundred years ago. In pursuit of their goal, they enlist 'most everybody who is now working on modern Philadelphia race relations, and the result is a very fine collaboration. The introduction sets the tone for this modern history/sociology anthology. The editors clearly have been marked by decades of the "new" social history: Dubois is introduced not as a disembodied mind afloat in an amorphous public space. Instead, with quick, deft strokes, the editors paint for us a portrait of the recently-Ph.D.-ed young Dubois, recently married, restless, arriving in the sophisticated city from the relative intellectual deprivation of a teaching job at Wilburforce. The reader meets Dubois-the-man, then gets an evocative description of the material and economic culture of the Philadelphia that greets him when he arrives on the train. Word images recreate the city's neighborhoods, buildings, commercial establishments, community landmarks, and though one could hardly say that the volume is lavishly illustrated, the addition of about a dozen well-chosen maps, photo portraits, a manuscript facsimile and some street scenes not only livens up the volume, but helps to underscore the value of material culture for enriching a narrative.
The introduction contextualizes the late-nineteenth-century settlement movement, raising well questions of the fine line between upper-class concern for social problems as a way to expand their own horizons versus genuine sympathy, empathy or comprehension for the “lower sort” they sought to assist. Musings upon the narrow and ethnocentric lines of vision which often accompanied do-gooders’ mission are set alongside considerations of the importance of urban services organizations that originated within the black community. Finally, the editors give some attention to the important role DuBois played in the development of research and teaching in the nascent discipline of sociology at the University of Pennsylvania.

This very graceful introduction is followed by nine essays, grouped into three sections that consider DuBois and “the Color Line,” the social/political/racial realities of turn-of-the-century Philadelphia, and finally, the issues of race and urban-ness in the intervening one hundred years. The anthology is remarkably free of the glaring flaw common to collections by multiple authors: lack of cohesion and balance. These essays hang together well, with a good balance of method and analysis, theory and reportage. All are informative and interesting to read—but some are more pleasurable than others. Mia Bay’s lead essay is, to my mind, the most appealing in both form and content. A tidy argument encased in cogent, accessible language, it uses DuBois’ intellectual connection to Franz Boas to explore the Philadelphia relationship to the wider American conversation about race and culture. The essays bring together a mix of well-seasoned scholars and fresh younger voices, all of them accomplished researchers. Thomas Holt explores the relationship between DuBois’ attempts to balance the tensions of race with his commitment to wide-ranging human comradeship. Gregg seats DuBois’ scholarship in the context of the transformation of history from a primarily humanities exercise to a hybrid of humanities and social science. Jacqueline Jones brings us her well-tuned skill for analyzing labor history; Tera Hunter offers comparative analytic snapshots of working-class black women, North and South. Antonio McDaniel examines some methodological issues raised by DuBois’s research methods and by subsequent students of cities-and-race. V. P. Franklin looks at community development strategies then and now, and Carol Nightingale and Elijah Anderson look at the implications of the internationalization of American commerce and American cities in recent times.

Katz and Sugrue set out to re-enliven DuBois’ discussion about race and the city, a discussion that is still current, still relevant, still unsettled—and likely to remain so until Americans fully recognize, as Jones observes in her essay, that “good jobs, and the collective hope and personal dignity that go with them, are the foundation of a good society.” (p. 124)

Emma J. Lapsansky, Haverford College
By Kenneth J. Heineman, *A Catholic New Deal: Religion and Reform in Depression Pittsburgh.*


Few cities in the industrial heartland of America were hit harder by the Great Depression than Pittsburgh. The all-important steel industry was reduced to operating at 10 percent of capacity, and its flagship, U.S. Steel, imposed wage reductions of 60 percent. Westinghouse, which employed more than 50,000 workers in 1929, had fewer than 30,000 just four years later. Unemployment rates were staggering: more than 30 percent for whites and close to 50 percent for African Americans. At the same time, however, few cities had a better human infrastructure rallying to cope with the disaster, and Kenneth Heineman focuses welcome attention on a frequently overlooked and misunderstood aspect of that base: the people and agencies of the Roman Catholic church.

Historians have often thought they knew all about Catholicism's role in the economic and social crisis. The Roman church had great potential in papal social teaching and in a few prophetic activists, as this line of interpretation goes; Catholics were also an important part of the New Deal political coalition. Too often, however, the church gave itself over the forces of reaction, fueled by unthinking anti-communism and a tolerance (or even encouragement) of rabid hate-mongering from the likes of Charles Coughlin. Pittsburgh presents a very different Catholicism indeed, and Heineman performs a genuine historiographical service by recovering and describing that alternative. Here we meet—or meet again—bishops, priests, and lay people who tried, more or less explicitly and more or less successfully, to define a specifically Catholic approach to social dislocation, while also connecting to wider efforts.

There is Bishop Hugh Boyle, for instance, who helped organize a formal Catholic-Radical Alliance in 1937, coopting secular reformers in support of the church's programs before the Catholic working class was lost to other interests. Boyle's newspaper consistently supported both the New Deal and the Congress of Industrial Organizations (CIO), even though the latter's reputation for tolerating communists in its ranks sent other bishops and diocesan newspapers running in the opposite direction. There is Father James Cox, pastor of a parish in the Strip District, who just happened to have a master's degree in economics. Cox refused to think that his responsibilities to the destitute were fulfilled by opening a soup kitchen. Instead this priestly dynamo helped organize unions, put together a massive march of the unemployed on Washington in 1932—Herbert Hoover didn't want to meet with Cox but found he couldn't avoid it; the priest told the president bluntly that he had his head in the sand like an ostrich. Cox even thought about running for presi-
dent himself, all with Bishop Boyle's approval. There is Philip Murray, devout Catholic and near-daily communicant, who organized the steelworkers and eventually wrested control of the CIO itself away from the formidable John L. Lewis. The heroes of Heineman's narrative are all men, and one wonders whether there were not equally impressive women, religious and lay, whose work deserves similar description. Still, this is a remarkable story, grounded in an impressive array of manuscript and published sources.

The approach is relentlessly chronological, and this sometimes leads to a loss of focus. In the midst of a general discussion of the early New Deal, for example, we get five pages of the contemporaneous history of the University of Pittsburgh, the relevance of which to the local "Catholic New Deal" is not clear. The author's previous work has focused on a later period of American history (the 1960s and after), and this means that he is not entirely sure-footed in this earlier era, especially with things Catholic. Boston's reactionary Cardinal William O'Connell—a hierarch who was everything Boyle was not, and proud of it—appears here as two different people, once as himself and once as William O'Connor. Odd phrases and usages also suggest an author who is not completely at home in the little world in which so many of his characters lived: priests do not "perform" mass, for instance, and to refer to a "seminary school" is to be at least redundant. Still, Heineman has provided nuance to understanding a historical period that will always command our attention. Religious, politics, ethnicity, and social reform can be studied in isolation only at the scholar's peril. Others might profitably follow this example by studying these same forces at work elsewhere.

James M. O'Toole, Boston College


American Jews have long had an intense interest in the history of their individual Jewish communities, and in the literature of local Jewish history Pennsylvania has always been well represented. Studies of various centers of Jewish life in the state include works such as Henry Samuel Morais' nineteenth-century volume The Jews of Philadelphia (1894); Joshua Trachtenberg's history of Easton Jewry, Consider the Years (1944); David Brener's congregationally-sponsored The Jews of Lancaster (1979); Michael B. Coleman's "informal history by a native son," The Jews of Harrisburg (1938); Jacob S. Feldman's regional profile, The Jewish Experience in Western Pennsylvania (1986); and Ewa Morawska's superb analysis of Johnstown Jewry, Insecure Prosperity (1996). To the growing list of informative studies in local Jewish history can now be added the volume under review here.
The Jews of Wilkes-Barre was produced in a rather unusual way, for it was prepared by a nine-member "writers committee" guided by the editor, Marjorie Levin, and it also made use of the work of over sixty volunteer contributors. As a result the book is an unconventional volume: each of its chapters has been written by one or more of the book's principal authors, but each also incorporates lengthy selections from the work of other contributors, appearing either as inserts in the text or as essays that stand alone in shaded boxes. Although it is not clear exactly how it was decided what information to include in the main text, what to set off from the text in italics, and what to present as separate essays, on the whole, the book works surprisingly well.

Much of the narrative in this volume tells the story of the various synagogues in Wilkes-Barre and its immediate environs, and of local Jewish institutions such as the Young Men's and Young Women's Hebrew Association (later the Jewish Community Center). Also occupying much of the text is the story of locally prominent individuals. Most of the supplementary material interspersed in the book is biographical in nature and there is even a separate chapter that tells of "Wyoming Valley Jews in the Arts and Media." Despite an emphasis on institutional history and prominent individuals, however, and despite the inclusion of what some readers might consider unnecessary trivia, the volume also gives a good sense of the actual life experience of Wyoming Valley Jews, and it provides valuable insights into topics such as the role of rabbis in the community, and inter-ethnic relationships in Wilkes-Barre. Moreover, some of the authors who have contributed to the volume have written with great sophistication and wisdom. Paul Zbiek provides an interesting comparison of how the identities of American Jews and American Catholics developed, for example, and a thoughtful analysis of the party politics of Wyoming Valley Jews in the 1930s.

As might be expected in a publication such as this, the text occasionally takes on a self-congratulatory tone. The reader is told, for example, that the Jewish experience in the Wyoming Valley is distinguished by "the absence of significant anti-Semitism," (p. 6) and that children who grew up in The Heights (the early twentieth-century Jewish immigrant neighborhood of Wilkes-Barre) "invariably describe childhood there is idyllic terms" (p. 65). On the whole, however, the text tells a much more complex story, including plenty of evidence of the same kind of "social" anti-Semitism that cropped up elsewhere in America, and numerous references to disputes within the Jewish community.

This volume is clearly intended primarily for a local audience. That is why, as the editor admits, the book "includes, perhaps, more family and business names and histories than might ordinarily appear in a work of this kind" (p. xii), and that is also why the narrative often assumes a familiarity with local geography; for example, a description of "the physically demanding hike up Northampton Street, all the way to Laurel Run by way of Giant's Despair."
66) can have meaning only for those familiar with the city of Wilkes-Barre. Nonetheless, the book frequently does an excellent job of placing the Jewish experience in the Wyoming Valley into the context of larger historical developments. Throughout the text, the story of the Jews of the Wilkes-Barre is linked to events such as the two World Wars, the Great Depression, the Holocaust, the decline of the Eastern Pennsylvania anthracite coal industry, and the floods of 1936 and 1972.

This volume is handsomely produced in a large format with plenty of illustrations. The compilers deserve credit for searching out appropriate photographs wherever they could be found and for commissioning two very helpful maps to accompany the text, one of Jewish landmarks in the Wyoming Valley and the other of The Heights. The book lacks reference citations, but its bibliography is impressive. Overall, *The Jews of Wilkes-Barre* is a satisfying volume. It will have special appeal to those interested in the history of the Wyoming Valley and its various Jewish communities, but more generally it is a useful contribution to the body of writings that reveals the details of American Jewish history from a local and regional perspective.

Lee Shai Weissbach, *University of Louisville*

---


Rice, flaxseed, immigrants: the first two are well-known commodities in the trans-Atlantic commercial networks of the eighteenth century, but their connection to the third item has been obscure. Marianne Wokeck discovers that immigrants to eighteenth-century America were fitted into the same commercial networks as these crops. Migrants became commodified as a profitable cargo, filling the holds of ships that would carry American rice and flaxseed back to Europe. They were a boon to merchants, if a troublesome commodity, and during periods of peak demand for overseas transport could dominate the trade. Yet the migrants were not passive. Wokeck is at pains to discover the agency of these immigrants who sought not only transportation, but to profit by transporting trade goods or by utilizing the increasingly sophisticated credit systems to their advantage. Pennsylvania dominated the American side of this trade as the “best poor man’s country” for much of the colonial period. Philadelphia was a mercantile and financial center as well as a port. This trade in strangers required trans-Atlantic networks. In Philadelphia, London, Rotterdam, and Ireland merchants and officials worked as partners and competitors recruiting boats and crews, and handling paperwork. At the Ameri-
can end, merchants and agents settled accounts and sold those who remained indebted for their passage because they had either not profited from the goods carried over or had no one to redeem them. Wars, continental politics, opportunity elsewhere, and the availability of credit affected size of the trade. It is one of Wokeck's main arguments that the creation of specialized credit and transportation networks in the immigrant trade of the eighteenth century was a foundation for the better-studied mass migration of the nineteenth century.

This is a valuable contribution to the study of immigration, ethnicity and the economy, and essential for historians of greater Pennsylvania. It concentrates on the 163,000 German and Irish immigrants of the first three-quarters of the eighteenth century, but looks back at the few thousand Europeans who migrated in the seventeenth century and looks forward to the migrations of millions more in the nineteenth century. Wokeck also contrasts the European trade with the contemporary slave trade. The tables of the annual numbers of German, southern Irish, and Ulster migrants, the list of German immigrants ships, and the extensive bibliography will be much consulted by historians. The heart of the book, despite its dazzling statistical base and substantive guides to sources in Canada, the United States, Great Britain, the Netherlands and Germany, is found in the text.

The book first establishes the context of German migration and then pinpoints the changing age, sex, and familial characteristics of the immigrants as the flow was established, peaked in the 1740s and 1750s, and then declined because of developments both in Europe and Pennsylvania. The heart of the book describes the business of transporting strangers from Rotterdam to the New World, particularly during the peak years of immigration when innovative merchants rationalized the trade. This period is first discussed from the vantagepoint of the merchants, agents, officials, and ship captains and then from the point of view of the passengers. One of the fascinating aspects of this study, unusual in economic analyses, is that the normative operation of the immigrant transport business is presented in tandem with evidence of various exploitative or corrupt practices. Among the risks faced by passengers were grasping officials, inhumane shipboard conditions, padded bills, theft, incompetence, and outright deception about conditions overseas or even about the real destination of the ship. But again the passengers were often no better. They could be unruly or unprepared for overseas travel. They often smuggled in restricted goods, and sometimes absconded on arrival without paying. The system established in the transportation of Germans is then compared to the less well-documented Irish trade and to the major characteristics of nineteenth-century immigration.

There is little to fault in this meticulous study, whose many insights can only be hinted at here. The discussion is occasionally repetitive. They dynamics of exactly how this eighteenth-century German trade in strangers influ-
enced later developments might have been specified. These are very minor
points. This is a rich study of the peopling of North America that should be of
widespread interest to specialists in many sub-disciplines of history.

Susan E. Klepp, Temple University

Edited by Edward Carter, II. Surveying the Record: North American Sci-
entific Exploration to 1930.

Appendix, Notes, Index.)

According to the editor’s useful introduction, the present volume is the
published offspring of a three-day conference sponsored and hosted by the
American Philosophical Society in 1997. Also, as volume 231 of the Society’s
Memoirs, it is a reminder that the Society’s contributions continue into its
third century. As an institutional sponsor of perhaps the most celebrated ex-
ploration in U.S. history, the Lewis and Clark Expeditions (1803-06), the
Society responded to the renewed interest in Western history and organized
the conference. Indeed, its collections empowered generations of scholars and
now the Society could bring together young and established scholars to dis-
cuss changes in several disciplinary approaches to both concept and act of
exploration in the West.

There are sixteen essays, far too many for individual review, divided into
sectional themes that broadly reflect the expertise of the authors—cartogra-
phy, marine activity, artistic images, anthropology, Lewis and Clark, and his-
toriography. This is an interdisciplinary effort seeking perspectives on what
past studies of exploration have achieved, and what changes already present in
current methodology and focus might shape future endeavors. As geographer
John L. Allen states in his essay “Where We Are and How We Get There:
Surveying the Record of Exploration Studies,” most authors acknowledge in-
debtedness and critical inspiration to the work of predecessors in many fields,
including William H. Goetzmann, Bernard DeVoto, John K. Wright, and
William A. Stanton.

In “A New Mode of Thinking: Creating a National Geography in the
Early Republic,” John Renne Short discusses important themes explored by
other contributors. For him one model of analysis is provided by a consider-
ation of geographers, Jedediah Morse and John Melish. While both wished to
properly represent the nation, Morse’s moral geography of disdain for the South
and opposition to immigration of non-Protestants, stands in contrast to Melish’s
support for immigration and emphasis on economic independence. These
competing visions of what the nation should become nuanced what Manifest
Destiny meant to different audiences in the decades before the Civil War.
Surveying and cartography on land and sea presented sets of problems not limited to available hardware. According to Elizabeth Green Musselman in “Science As A Landed Activity: Scientifics and Seamen Aboard the U.S. Exploring Expedition,” dimensions were not limited to physical space, but also included the conflicts over the proper boundaries between the technical, scientific, and military administrative provinces of naval personnel and civilian scientists on board during 1838-1842. At least for many years, the dependency of civilian scientific activity upon military funding decreased relative to private philanthropic sources.

Romanticized notions of the West or of the explorers have never been completely replaced by scientific, technical, or, indeed, “objective” accounts. Certainly the advent of photography may have tempered the reception of images idyllic or savage created by itinerant or stationary landscape academic artists of the East Coast. As Katherine E. Manthorne argues in “Legible Landscapes: Text and Image in the Expeditionary Art of Frederic Church,” renditions were held hostage by the printed discourse of expectation. Painted and photographic records of geological and geographical expeditions to the West, writes Deborah Rindge in “Science and Art Meet in the Parlor: The Role of Popular Magazine Illustration in the Pictorial Record of the ‘Great Surveys,’” fueled interests in the distant out-of-doors.

Several essays deal explicitly or implicitly with how western explorations shaped emerging scientific disciplines. For example, Don D. Fowler and David R. Wilcox explain in “From Thomas Jefferson to the Pecos Conference: Changing Anthropological Agendas in the North American Southwest,” that explorations into that region stimulated the emergence of ethnography, archaeology, and often competing research methodologies. In many ways such activities were extensions of a vision earlier shared by Jefferson and the Society. The final essay by Donald Worcester, “The Second Colorado River Expedition: John Wesley Powell, Mormonism and the Environment,” is a fitting microcosm of this collection. That is, that he and the other contributors asked very simple questions about the extant record of exploration and developed fresh, thoughtful alternative interpretations. The author wonders why Powell did not include mention of this second expedition in his famous publication. For Worcester the answer lies in Powell’s encounter with Brigham Young and his Mormon settlements. As Powell might have put it, the Mormons were far better explorers than he was and he admired their land ethic, distrust of monied classes, and apparent ease of social unity. Worcester concludes that the role of context muted Powell’s impressions: “in the process of organizing an expedition to the Colorado River, he became an explorer among the Mormons, and thence he became an explorer of his own society’s future possibilities” (page 328).
This is a handsomely produced volume. The narratives and scores of black and white illustrations invite the reader to explore the various meanings of exploration and to revisit, so to speak, a favorite spot, and to imagine once again the possibilities. The Society and the editor have combined institutional and individual missions of the authors to produce a worthy contribution to the study of western explorations.

Eric Howard Christianson, University of Kentucky

COMMON-PLACE

The Interactive Journal of Early American Life

A common place. an uncommon voice.

Bringing together scholars, activists, journalists, filmmakers, teachers, and history buffs to discuss everything from politics to parlor manners.

FEATURES: investigative reporting, primary research, and essays on methodological dilemmas and disciplinary divides

REVIEWS: thoughtful critiques of scholarship, fiction, film and more

OBJECT LESSONS: meditations on artifacts and exhibits

TALES FROM THE VAULT: behind-the-scenes reports from the archives

THE COMMON SCHOOL: stories about the difficulties and delights of teaching early America

ASK THE AUTHOR: provocative interviews with prominent authors

THE REPUBLIC OF LETTERS: ongoing online conversation

Read. Talk back. Submit.

www.common-place.org