# Pennsylvania History







# A JOURNAL OF MID-ATLANTIC STUDIES

VOLUME 72, NUMBER 4 · AUTUMN 2005

# ARTICLES

Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward: Graduate Teaching and Student Research

Almost Our Own Montmartre: Studying Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward Michael Barton 405

Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward: Constructing a Website for Student Research Stephanie Patterson Gilbert 419

Bakers and Confectioners of Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward, 1890–1917 Stephanie Patterson Gilbert 428

Barbershops in Harrisburg's Old Eighth, 1890–1905 *Julie Ann Hurst* 443

The Butcher Shops of Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward, 1860–1916

John D. Myers 454

Website Review: Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward By Mark Wahlgren Summers 463

Rethinking the End of Black Voting Rights in Antebellum Pennsylvania:

Racial Ascriptivism, Partisanship and Political Development in the Keystone State Christopher Malone 466 "A Piazza from which the View Is Constantly Changing":
The Promise of Class And Gender Mobility on the Pennsylvania
Railroad's Cross-Country Tours

\*\*Carolyn Kitch\*\* 505\*\*

# IN MEMORIAM

Donald Durnbaugh
By *David Eller* 528

# **EXHIBIT REVIEW**

The No. 9 Mine and Wash Shanty Museum, Lansford, Pennsylvania By Kenneth Wolensky 531

# REVIEW ESSAY

Looking Up From the Basement: New Biographies of Franklin Pierce and James Buchanan By Michael Birkner 535

# **BOOK REVIEWS**

Michael Barton and Jessica Dorman, eds., Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward Reviewed by Timothy J. Gilfoyle 544

Jeffrey L. Pasley, Andrew W. Robertson, and David Waldstreicher. Beyond the Founders: New Approaches to the Political History of the Early American Republic

Reviewed by Paul E. Doutrich 546

Jonathan H. Earle. Jacksonian Antislavery & the Politics of Free Soil, 1824–1854 Reviewed by William G. Shade 548

Mark Tebeau. Eating Smoke: Fire in Urban America, 1800–1950 Reviewed by Charles Jarvis 550

Anne E. Mosher. Capital's Utopia: Vandergrift, Pennsylvania, 1855–1916 Reviewed by Edward Slavishak 553

CONTRIBUTORS 556

### SUBMISSION INFORMATION

The editor invites the submission of articles dealing with the history of Pennsylvania and the Middle Atlantic region, regardless of their specialty. Prospective authors are urged to review past issues of *Pennsylvania History: A Journal of Mid-Atlantic Studies*, where they will note articles in social, intellectual, economic, environmental, political, and cultural history, from the distant and recent past. Articles may investigate new areas of research or they may reflect on past scholarship. Material that is primarily of an antiquarian or genealogical nature will not be considered.

*Pennsylvania History* publishes documents previously unpublished and of interest to scholars of the Middle Atlantic region. The Journal also reviews books, exhibits, and other media dealing primarily with Pennsylvania history or that shed significant light on the state's past.

Please conform to the *Chicago Manual of Style* in preparing your manuscript and submit three copies to the editor, Paul Douglas Newman, Department of History, University of Pittsburgh at Johnstown, 450 Schoolhouse Rd, Johnstown, PA 15904. Or, submit electronically via a Word document through email to pnewman@pitt.edu.

News of meetings, projects, exhibits, manuscript collections, and related matters should be sent to the editor at the address above or by email: pnewman@pitt.edu.

Send books for review and names of individuals who wish to review for the Journal to Thomas J. Kiffmeyer, Department of Geography, Government, and History, Morehead State University, 450 Rader Hall, Morehead, KY 40351, or t.kiffmeyer@morehead-st.edu.

Send suggestions for exhibit reviews and names of individuals who wish to review museum exhibits for the journal to Jeffrey A. Davis, Department of History, Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania, 128 Old Science Hall, Bloomsburg, PA 17815, or jdavis@bloomu.edu.

# EDITOR'S NOTE

Readers will notice a change in editorship of the Journal with this issue. I would like to thank Jean Soderlund and John McWilliams for their hard work and dedication to *Pennsylvania History* and for the help they have offered in the transition process. Joining the Journal as Associate Editor is Jeffrey A. Davis of Bloomsburg University, and taking the job of Book Review Editor is Thomas J. Kiffmeyer of Morehead State University. In addition, I would like to thank former editors and book review editors Brian Black, William Pencak, Michael Birkner, and Jack Bauman for the assistance and advice they have lent over the years. The support of the Editorial Board, the Pennsylvania Historical Association Council and Executive Committee, Peter Potter and MaryLou McMurtrie of Penn State University Press, as well as the PHA members has been enormous and is deeply appreciated. I am looking forward to working with, and for, all of you. I implore you to submit your scholarship to *Pennsylvania History*, to encourage your friends and colleagues to do the same, and to contact me with any comments or suggestions for the Journal that you may have.

In this issue appears a special series of essays entitled "Harrisburg's Old Eighth Ward." The essays reflect the scholarship and teaching of Professor Michael Barton at Penn State Harrisburg. Included is a pedagogical essay by Professor Barton, an essay by graduate student Stephanie Patterson Gilbert discussing the creation and maintenance of the project's website, and three graduate student essays. Readers should be aware that the examples of graduate student work were not peer reviewed for acceptance. Instead, Professor Barton submitted the work of six graduate students, and the editorial staff and one editorial board member chose three essays to publish.

Paul Douglas Newman

# IMPORTANT NOTICES

*Pennsylvania History* (ISSN-0031-4528) published quarterly by The Pennsylvania Historical Association and The Pennsylvania State University Press.

Annual subscription rates: \$15 for students, \$30.00 for individuals, and \$35.00 for institutions. Payment should be directed to Professor John Frantz, The Pennsylvania State University, 108 Weaver Building, University Park, PA 16802–5500. Address changes should also be directed to Professor Frantz.

Periodicals postage paid at State College, and additional mailing offices. POST-MASTER: Send address changes to Pennsylvania History, Professor John Frantz, The Pennsylvania State University, 108 Weaver Building, University Park, PA 16802–5500.

Claims for missing or damaged issues should be directed to The Pennsylvania State University Press, 820 North University Drive, USB-1, Suite C, University Park, PA 16802–1003.

# EDITOR

Paul Douglas Newman, University of Pittsburgh at Johnstown

# ASSOCIATE EDITOR

Jeffrey A. Davis, Bloomsburg University

# **BOOK REVIEW EDITOR**

Thomas J. Kiffmeyer, Morehead State University

# EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Wendy Engelberg, University of Pittsburgh at Johnstown

# PRODUCTION ASSISTANTS

Joseph Heffley, University of Pittsburgh at Johnstown Andrea O'Neill, Bloomsburg University

# EDITORIAL BOARD

Michael J. Birkner, Gettysburg College Brian Black, The Pennsylvania State University Altoona Wayne Bodle, Indiana University of Pennsylvania Simon Bronner, The Pennsylvania State University Harrisburg

David Hsiung, Juniata College

Janet Irons, Lock Haven University

Susan E. Klepp, Temple University

Gregory T. Knouff, Keene State College Janet Lindman, Rowan University

Peter C. Mancall, University of Southern California

Sally A. McMurry, The Pennsylvania State University

Leslie Patrick, Bucknell University

William Pencak, The Pennsylvania State University

Carol Reardon, The Pennsylvania State University

Daniel K. Richter, University of Pennsylvania

Philip B. Scranton, Rutgers University at Camden

Joel A. Tarr, Carnegie Mellon University

Joe W. Trotter, Carnegie Mellon University

Kenneth C. Wolensky, Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission Michael Zuckerman, University of Pennsylvania ublication of *Pennsylvania History: A Journal of Mid-Atlantic Studies* is made possible by deeply appreciated support from the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, the McNeil Center for Early American Studies, and the University of Pittsburgh at Johnstown, Division of Social Sciences.

We thank John Frantz for keeping our membership lists in order.

# OFFICERS OF THE PENNSYLVANIA HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

President, Dennis Downey, Millersville University Dennis.Downey@millersville.edu

Immediate Past President, Rosalind Remer, Benjamin Franklin Tercentenary

Vice President, David Schuyler, Franklin and Marshall College David.Schuyler@fandm.edu

Business Secretary, John B. Frantz, The Pennsylvania State University jbf2@psu.edu

Treasurer, Robert Blackson, Kutztown University blackson@kutztown.edu

Secretary, Charles Cashdollar, Indiana University of Pennsylvania cashdolr@grove.iup.edu

Editor, Paul Douglas Newman, University of Pittsburgh at Johnstown, pnewman@pitt.edu

# THE PENNSYLVANIA HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

The Pennsylvania Historical Association endeavors to stimulate scholarly activity and arouse popular interest in the Commonwealth's history. It sponsors *Pennsylvania History: A Journal of Mid-Atlantic Studies*, a publication series, and annual meetings held successively throughout the state.

www.pa-history.org

On the cover: Philip Levinson's Walnut Street confectionery, the corner store to the right, operated between 1901 and 1911. Source: Pennsylvania State Archives