PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY

involvement in a wide variety of economic activities. Stern's ability to make sense of a complicated set of materials will be valuable to colonial and revolutionary historians of Pennsylvania interested in such practices. The nature of the primary materials produced by Franks, however, significantly limits the ability of the author to make definitive cultural or theological statements about this dynamic period in Pennsylvania's history.

BENJAMIN G. SCHARFF
West Virginia University

Judith Ridner. A Town In-Between: Carlisle, Pennsylvania, and the Early Mid-Atlantic Interior. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010. Pp. viii, 287, maps, illustrations, notes, index. Cloth, \$49.95)

Judith Ridner provides important new insights to multiple audiences in her excellent new study of Carlisle, Pennsylvania's first half-century of settlement. Students of early Pennsylvania will no doubt benefit from this comprehensive narrative of the development of proprietor Thomas Penn's new administrative seat for his sprawling interior Cumberland County. Generalists in early American studies will also be enriched by Ridner's deft analysis of how the residents of Carlisle contributed in material ways to such well-known intercolonial and national events as the French and Indian War, American Revolution, Constitutional ratification, and Whiskey Rebellion. Ultimately, A *Town In-Between* successfully balances the need for intimate detail of local and specialized interest with the forging of broader thematic connections that speak to much wider audiences.

Central to Ridner's argument for Carlisle's broader importance was its status as a place "in-between." Her book does not elaborately theorize this framework, but rather allows its multiple meanings to unfold in the course of her chronological narrative. As Native Americans long knew, Carlisle's geographic location provided a convergence of north-south trade routes along the Susquehanna River Valley and east-west paths (later roads) connecting Philadelphia and the Delaware Valley with the expanding western frontier. Thomas Penn hoped these geographic advantages would allow him to extend

PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY: A JOURNAL OF MID-ATLANTIC STUDIES, VOL. 79, NO. 1, 2012.

Copyright © 2012 The Pennsylvania Historical Association

BOOK REVIEWS

law, order, and proprietary power in a newly made county seat as well as establish a successful way station for merchants in an increasingly important fur and skin trade with Native Americans. Although contested in his vision (see below), Penn's town of Carlisle was quickly successful in both accounts. As the French and Indian War broke out with violence at the forks of the Ohio River in western Pennsylvania, Carlisle's location "in-between" allowed it to serve as a staging ground for General Forbes' military efforts to dislodge the French from Fort Duquesne. When violence again erupted during the American Revolution, Carlisle's crossroads location made it an attractive site to locate a critical depot and manufacturing center for Patriot arms as well as a detention center for captive British and Loyalist soldiers. Following the Revolution, Carlisle remained a significant economic hub as part of the expanding grain trade between the Ohio River Valley and the coastal cities of the eastern seaboard.

Apart from this grain trade, however, the analysis of Carlisle as a place "in-between" during the early Republic becomes strained in the final two chapters of the book. These closing chapters are otherwise strong, describing key aspects of Carlisle's maturation over time, including its industrializing economy, more refined material culture, development of local print trades and newspapers, and the establishment of Dickinson College—Pennsylvania's second institution of higher learning. Even Ridner concedes in the final chapter that this maturation showed that Carlisle had developed into a "town of the cosmopolitan east . . . it sat more on the edge of the east than in the middle of the mid-Atlantic" (179). This admission would have been less jarring had the penultimate chapter not been titled "Still In-Between," as its contents seemed to better describe its transition away from that status.

Another major strength of this book is its excellent analysis of the contentiousness of Carlisle's residents as conflicting visions of the community's meaning and destiny clashed over time. This process began with the earliest settlers, predominantly Scots-Irish Presbyterians, who largely ignored the Proprietor's original town plans, including his preference for a large Anglican church on its central square (Thomas Penn had abandoned the Quakerism of his father). Readers familiar with Gary Nash's accounts of early Pennsylvania will find this type of proprietary versus Anti-proprietary conflict in early Carlisle very familiar. Even more striking examples of contention within the town itself were seen in the friction between merchants who were enriching themselves through western trade and the farmers and townsfolk who feared that same trade was built upon the transfer

PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY

of weapons and alcohol that encouraged and facilitated Native American frontier violence. Local residents would often stop merchants' wagons to ensure they were free of these items and many traders resorted to sending their shipments (including weapons and alcohol) alongside army detachments passing through to frontier forts. Carlisle was predominantly united behind the Patriot cause during the American Revolution, but the politics of the early Republic proved to be extremely divisive for local residents. Dueling public demonstrations planned by Federalists and Anti-Federalists during the constitutional ratification debates developed into riots that commanded national attention in 1787. Street violence returned to Carlisle in 1794 in the midst of bitter disputes over federal tax policy during the Whiskey Rebellion. The town square became a hotly contested public space when anti-excise demonstrators erected a liberty pole that was dismantled by local Federalists before being raised yet again by even more angry protesters. Pacification was forced on Carlisle as it hosted President Washington at the head of an army designed to crush further resistance to the federal taxing power. Ridner's narrative and analysis of each of these conflicts advance a stronger understanding of Carlisle's own development, but also highlight the important role this relatively small Pennsylvania community played in early American history.

Judith Ridner's *A Town In-Between* is everything a good community study should be. It is rich in details combed from exhaustive research in local and state archives. The writing is crisp and accessible, augmented well with maps and images that provide a sense of place and material culture in early Carlisle. Finally, the narrative is framed in a broad context that makes a strong case for Carlisle's importance to the mid-Atlantic region and beyond.

LARRY A. SKILLIN St. Ambrose University

Joe W. Trotter and Jared N. Day. *Race and Renaissance: African Americans in Pittsburgh since World War II.* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2010. Pp. xxi, 352. Illustrations, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. Cloth, \$29.95)

PENNSYLVANIA HISTORY: A JOURNAL OF MID-ATLANTIC STUDIES, VOL. 79, NO. 1, 2012. Copyright © 2012 The Pennsylvania Historical Association