

approved the Declaration of Independence, which, in fact, makes mention of two different Gods: the Enlightenment deity—the “Creator” and “Nature’s God”—and the Judeo-Christian God who offers “Protection” and is the “Supreme Judge of the world.” They embraced these contradictory forces and yoked them together to both direct and inspire. It is also worth noting that they managed to work with other opposing ideas, too, for example, conservatism and radicalism, and liberty and slavery. These are the same gentlemen who came up with federalism and the system of checks and balances in the US Constitution. Having said that, the work provides important depth and new insights to our very human Founders and their thinking in establishing the new nation.

Although it deals with a topic that is currently very popular—religion and its influence in American politics—this work is not for a general audience. Some essays, including the one by Muñoz and the contribution by Petranovich and Holbreich, are brilliant and eminently readable. Others, no less intelligent or insightful, are dense philosophical essays that nonspecialists will find difficult to read. Like a growing number of recent publications, this work could have used a good copyeditor to eliminate typographical errors—one essay included the wrong date for the writing of the Constitution!—and some awkward turns of phrase here and there. A number of contributions contain multiple rhetorical questions, which might have served well when the authors delivered these papers at the conference at College of the Holy Cross in fall 2010 but prove unnecessary and distracting in print. The contributions would have been much improved had the rhetorical questions been removed. These problems aside, the book is a very valuable addition to the scholarship of early American history, philosophy, and politics.

STEVEN GIMBER
West Chester University

Brycchan Carey. *From Peace to Freedom: Quaker Rhetoric and the Birth of American Antislavery, 1657–1761* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2012). Pp. xi, 257. Notes, bibliography, index. Cloth, \$35.00.

If Quakers were key players in the drama of transatlantic abolitionism, Pennsylvania and the Delaware Valley were the stage upon which they made

their best performance. Until recently, historians have showered most of their attention on events from the 1750s onward, when Friends famously made slave trading, then slavery itself, a disciplinary offense within their ranks. Two of the most celebrated Pennsylvania Quaker abolitionists from the 1750s, Anthony Benezet and John Woolman, are the subject of numerous popular and scholarly biographies. By contrast, the earlier period, from the founding of Pennsylvania to about 1750, has garnered less attention, partly because the narrative appears less heroic. Instead of Benezet and Woolman, the main protagonists feature eccentric cranks like Benjamin Lay, who once kidnapped his neighbor's child to demonstrate the sinfulness of slave trading, and George Keith, the notorious Quaker preacher who is best remembered for instigating a contentious schism. In this earlier, more ambiguous era, a few outspoken Friends criticized slavery but were unable to persuade the majority of their coreligionists to do anything about it.

Far more than previous scholarship, Brycchan Carey's *From Peace to Freedom* successfully mines the discursive origins of Pennsylvania Quaker abolitionism in painstaking detail. Carey's main contribution is to demonstrate that, in his words, "Quaker discussions about slavery were far more extensive and far more interconnected than a reading of the printed sources alone would suggest" (22). Carey's approach is revisionist, and he takes issue with previous historians, most notably David Brion Davis and Christopher Brown, who have characterized earlier Quaker antislavery as a series of disjointed texts and protests that lacked coherence or relevance. According to Carey, Pennsylvania Quakers did in fact develop a sustained and coherent set of arguments against slavery that began with the Germantown Protest of 1688 and culminated with the Philadelphia Yearly Meeting's decision in 1758 to ban slave trading among its members. Acting like common law jurists, Quaker antislavery writers elaborated on the moral arguments of their predecessors while introducing new ones to the mix. The cumulative effect over decades was to create an interlocking set of arguments against slavery that convinced a critical mass of Friends to take the first real steps toward abolition. Although Carey mentions Eric Williams's "decline thesis" only briefly, his book is clearly making a larger statement about the importance of ideas in motivating abolitionists at a time when, even among Quakers, the financial interest in slavery posed serious obstacles to moral reform (20, 179–80).

Carey's training as a literary scholar serves him well. His readings of antislavery texts are rigorous and nuanced. He is also not shy about applying

the techniques of rhetorical analysis to speculate on motivation when other evidence is lacking. Despite the abundance of manuscript and printed texts for the period, Quakers left few candid remarks about their state of mind or what motivated their actions. Carey does a good job of reading between the lines and putting human flesh and emotion into otherwise frustratingly vague or incomplete texts. In discussing George Fox's *Gospel Family Order*, for example, Carey argues that it at times reveals "a man very troubled by what he has witnessed" (57). Elsewhere in Fox's writings, he identifies "grammatically lazy but rhetorically effective sentences" that functioned more like "a hymn or catechism" than a philosophical treatise (52). In another tract from the early eighteenth century, Carey creatively speculates that it may "originally have been intended for oral delivery" or as a primer "supplying simple propositions and answers for [antislavery activists] to use in the field or the meeting house" (137).

At times, *From Peace to Freedom* could use more historical analysis to bolster its argument for the exceptionalism of Quaker antislavery. In the introduction, Carey briefly considers why Pennsylvania Friends were the first to make antislavery a "central plank of [their] corporate identity" (25). Carey sketches out a few possible answers by comparing Quakers to other religious groups in the British Atlantic. According to Carey, New England Puritans also questioned slavery, but Congregationalism lacked the hierarchical organization necessary to develop a more coherent antislavery policy. Carey also contends that because Quakers were the majority in early Pennsylvania and in control of the provincial government they "worked harder to disseminate antislavery ideas than they might have done otherwise" (33). These intriguing suggestions merit further exploration than is given in the book. Carey notes one of the central planks of Quaker antislavery is the "Golden Rule"—the religious injunction that we should love our neighbors as ourselves. But Friends were hardly alone in seeing its relevance to slavery. Even the Puritan minister Cotton Mather, a slaveowner, repeatedly invoked the Golden Rule to condemn slave trading in Boston, which he saw as emblematic of the growing power of merchants who put the exploitation of human beings ahead of salvation. Seventeenth-century Puritans and Quakers, despite their institutional and theological differences, shared a common vernacular that grappled with slavery as a moral problem of violence. Carey's book raises the question of what Friends had in common with other antislavery groups. Further research along those lines would better clarify what exactly was unique about Quaker antislavery.

Quaker pacifism also deserves further attention, especially since it is what arguably most distinguished Friends from other antislavery groups.

Carey maintains that the peace testimony, combined with the Golden Rule, “made it easy for many Friends to turn their backs on slavery, and difficult for slaveholding Friends to justify their practice” (31). While it is true that Quakers were renowned (and reviled) as pacifists, I would argue their pacifism, which originated in England as an objection to state-sanctioned violence, was neither uniformly observed nor consistently interpreted across time. As Quakers settled in the American colonies, they had to “learn” to see slavery as a violation of the peace testimony. Carey quotes from an anonymous early eighteenth-century author who reasons that if “*Violence* is (in ordinary Cases) unlawful” and “making *Slaves of Men* (against their Will) is Violence,” then “making *Slaves of Men*, is unlawful” (136). If the equation of slavery with violence was so obvious to the author’s presumably Quaker readers, why bother with the rhetorical gymnastics? From the beginning, there were Quakers who grounded their antislavery in the language of the peace testimony, but just as Quaker abolitionism took time to develop, so too did the notion that the Quaker pacifism unambiguously applied to slavery.

Carey’s *From Peace to Freedom* is a welcome addition to the history of Quaker abolitionism. Its analysis of the rhetorical arguments that underpinned early Quaker antislavery texts is unparalleled. Readers will find its clear prose and careful argumentation essential to any serious study of Quakers and their complex relationship to slavery.

MICHAEL GOODE

Utah Valley University

Daniel Jay Grimminger. *Sacred Song and the Pennsylvania Dutch* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2012). Pp. xxi, 213. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. Cloth, \$85.00.

Hermann Wellenreuther. *Citizens in a Strange Land: A Study of German-American Broad-sides and Their Meaning for Germans in North America, 1730–1830* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2013). Pp. xv, 352. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. Cloth, \$94.95.

The two books included in this review essay both focus upon the language and culture of German settlers in Pennsylvania during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Daniel Jay Grimminger’s *Sacred Song and the Pennsylvania Dutch*