

THE
PENNSYLVANIA
MAGAZINE
OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY

VOLUME CXXXIII

October 2009

NO. 4

A LOOKING-GLASS FOR PRESBYTERIANS: RECASTING A
PREJUDICE IN LATE COLONIAL PENNSYLVANIA

Benjamin Bankhurst 317

NOTES AND DOCUMENTS

POLITICAL INFLUENCE IN PHILADELPHIA JUDICIAL
APPOINTMENTS: ABRAHAM L. FREEDMAN'S ACCOUNT

Isador Kranzel, with Eric Klinek 349

ELIZABETH KIRKBRIDE GURNEY'S CORRESPONDENCE WITH
ABRAHAM LINCOLN: THE QUAKER DILEMMA

Max L. Carter 389

A ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION OF GARY NASH'S
THE URBAN CRUCIBLE

*John M. Murrin, Benjamin L. Carp, Billy G. Smith,
Simon Middleton, Richard S. Newman, and Gary B. Nash* 397

BOOK REVIEWS 441

INDEX 457

BOOK REVIEWS

ROEBER, ed., <i>Ethnographies and Exchanges: Native Americans, Moravians, and Catholics in Early North America</i> , by Richard W. Pointer	441
LEMAY, <i>The Life of Benjamin Franklin</i> , Vol. 3, <i>Soldier, Scientist, and Politician, 1748–1757</i> , by Barbara Oberg	442
LOANE, <i>Following the Drum: Women at the Valley Forge Encampment</i> , by Holly A. Mayer	444
FALK, <i>Architecture and Artifacts of the Pennsylvania Germans: Constructing Identity in Early America</i> , by Robert St. George	445
WENGER, <i>A Country Storekeeper in Pennsylvania: Creating Economic Networks in Early America, 1790–1807</i> , by Paul G. E. Clemens	447
VARON, <i>Disunion! The Coming of the American Civil War, 1789–1859</i> , by Judith Giesberg	448
SILBER, <i>Gender and the Sectional Conflict</i> , by Susan Hanket Brandt	450
ARONSON, <i>Nickelodeon City: Pittsburgh at the Movies, 1905–1929</i> , by David Nasaw	451

The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography, from 2006 to the present, is now available online to members and subscribers at The History Cooperative, <http://www.historycooperative.org>. In order to access the full text of articles and reviews, subscribers will need to register for the first time using the identification number on their mailing label. To obtain your member identification number, you may also call the editor at 215-732-6200 x208, or e-mail pmhb@hsp.org. Back issues are freely available on the Penn State University Libraries Web site, at <http://publications.libraries.psu.edu/eresources/pmhb>. Back issues from 1877 through 2003 are also available on JSTOR (<http://www.jstor.org>). All three sites can also be accessed from the Historical Society's Web site, at <http://www.hsp.org/default.aspx?id=68>.

COVER ILLUSTRATION: Elizabeth Paul Kirkbride Gurney. Cox-Parrish-Wharton Papers. In recognition of Abraham Lincoln's two hundredth birthday, we reprint one of our most moving Lincoln documents, a letter from Abraham Lincoln to Quaker Eliza P. Gurney in 1864 that addresses the dilemma that Quakers faced during the Civil War in opposing both war and slavery. See Max L. Carter's discussion of the Lincoln-Gurney correspondence in this issue.

Editorial Advisory Committee

STEVEN CONN <i>Ohio State University</i>	JANE MERRITT <i>Old Dominion University</i>
MATTHEW COUNTRYMAN <i>University of Michigan</i>	CHARLENE MIRES <i>Villanova University</i>
THOMAS DUBLIN <i>Binghamton University</i>	CARLA MULFORD <i>Pennsylvania State University</i>
ELIZABETH ARMSTRONG DUNBAR <i>University of Delaware</i>	MARK E. NEELY JR. <i>Pennsylvania State University</i>
LORI GINZBERG <i>Pennsylvania State University</i>	LESLIE PATRICK <i>Bucknell University</i>
JOHN HEPP <i>Wilkes University</i>	DONNA J. RILLING <i>State University of New York, Stony Brook</i>
RICHARD N. JULIANI <i>Villanova University</i>	DAVID SCHUYLER <i>Franklin & Marshall College</i>
RUSSELL KAZAL <i>University of Toronto at Scarborough</i>	THOMAS J. SUGRUE <i>University of Pennsylvania</i>
HOLLY A. MAYER <i>Duquesne University</i>	ELIZABETH VARON <i>Temple University</i>

Editor

TAMARA GASKELL

Editorial Intern

ERIC KLINEK

THE PENNSYLVANIA MAGAZINE OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY (ISSN 0031-4587) is published each quarter in January, April, July, and October by THE HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF PENNSYLVANIA, 1300 Locust Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107-5699. Periodicals postage paid at Philadelphia, PA and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes to PMHB, Historical Society of Pennsylvania, 1300 Locust Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107-5699. **Yearly subscriptions:** individual, \$35.00; institutional, \$75.00. **Back issues:** Selected issues and annual bound volumes are available. Query editor for availability and price. **Authorization for academic photocopying:** Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., Academic Permissions Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. **Submissions:** All communications should be addressed to the editor. E-mail may be sent to pmhb@hsp.org. Manuscripts should conform to *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Electronic submissions are welcome. Manuscripts will not be returned unless accompanied by a stamped, self-addressed envelope. For submission guidelines, visit the PMHB Web page (<http://www.hsp.org>). The editor does not assume responsibility for statements of fact or of opinion made by the contributors.

Contributors

BENJAMIN BANKHURST is a PhD candidate in history at King's College, London. He is currently writing a dissertation on American charity drives in Ireland during the French and Indian War (1754–63).

BENJAMIN L. CARP is an assistant professor of early American history at Tufts University. He is the author of *Rebels Rising: Cities and the American Revolution* (2007). He is currently working on a book about the Boston Tea Party.

MAX L. CARTER is the director of Friends Center and of Quaker studies at Guilford College in Greensboro, NC. His publications include *Minutiae of the Meeting* (1999), a look at Friends in popular culture, and *College Spirit* (2003), a collection of essays on Quaker campus ministry.

ISADOR KRANZEL was assistant city solicitor of Philadelphia from 1956–71, assistant district attorney from 1973–75, and an administrative law judge with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission from 1978–2000. He has also taught at various universities and is Vice Chairman of the Philadelphia Jewish Archives Center at Temple University.

SIMON MIDDLETON teaches early American history at the University of Sheffield. He has published numerous articles and is the author of *From Privileges to Rights: Work and Politics in Colonial New York City* (2006) and co-editor of *Class Matters: Early North America and the Atlantic World* (2008).

JOHN M. MURRIN taught American colonial and revolutionary history at Princeton from 1973 until his retirement in 2003. He is a co-author of *Liberty, Equality, Power: A History of the American People* (1996) and has published numerous essays on the social, religious, political, and legal history of early America.

GARY B. NASH is director of the National Center for History in the Schools at UCLA where he is professor of history emeritus. His new book, *The Liberty Bell: An American Icon*, will be published by Yale University Press in 2010.

RICHARD S. NEWMAN is professor of history at Rochester Institute of Technology and the author of *Freedom's Prophet: Bishop Richard Allen, the AME Church, and the Black Founding Fathers* (2008), which won the ForeWord Magazine Gold Medal for Best Biography in 2009.

BILLY G. SMITH is professor of history at Montana State University. He is co-editor of *Class Matters: Early North America and the Atlantic World* (2008) and *The Infortunate: The Voyage and Adventures of William Moraley, An Indentured Servant* (1992). He is currently writing *Ship of Death: The Voyage that Changed the Atlantic World* as well as creating GIS maps of early national Philadelphia.