

THE
PENNSYLVANIA
MAGAZINE
OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY

EDITORIAL	<i>Tamara Gaskell</i>	7
INTRODUCTION	<i>Erica Armstrong Dunbar and Randall M. Miller</i>	9
THE CONTESTED HISTORY OF AMERICAN FREEDOM	<i>Eric Foner</i>	13
THE AGE OF EMANCIPATING PROCLAMATIONS: EARLY CIVIL WAR ABOLITIONISM AND ITS DISCONTENTS	<i>Richard S. Newman</i>	33
“GOD IS SETTLEING THE ACCOUNT”: AFRICAN AMERICAN REACTION TO LINCOLN’S EMANCIPATION PROCLAMATION	<i>Daniel R. Biddle and Murray Dubin</i>	57
“YOU FEEL SO OUT OF PLACE”: GERMANTOWN’S J. GORDON BAUGH AND THE 1913 COMMEMORATION OF THE EMANCIPATION PROCLAMATION	<i>David W. Young</i>	79
REVIEW ESSAY		
“A MEASURE ALIKE MILITARY & PHILANTHROPIC”: HISTORIANS AND THE EMANCIPATION PROCLAMATION	<i>Douglas R. Egerton</i>	95
BOOK REVIEWS		115

BOOK REVIEWS

- NEWMAN and MUELLER, eds., *Antislavery and Abolition in Philadelphia: Emancipation and the Long Struggle for Racial Justice in the City of Brotherly Love*, by Katrina Anderson 115
- GRIVNO, *Gleanings of Freedom: Free and Slave Labor along the Mason-Dixon Line, 1790–1860*, by Howard Bodenhorn 116
- DAVIS, “We Will Be Satisfied With Nothing Less”: *The African American Struggle for Equal Rights in the North during Reconstruction*, by W. Fitzhugh Brundage 118

COVER ILLUSTRATION: Lithograph of illustration by Thomas Nast commemorating the Emancipation Proclamation in January 1863. This image appeared as an illustration in the January 24, 1863 issue of *Harper's Weekly* as a celebration of President Abraham Lincoln's decree emancipating slaves during the Civil War. At the top of the illustration, the female figure Columbia, an early symbol of the United States, cheers emancipation and a portrait of President Lincoln is inset below. Nast depicts the horrors of slavery on the left-hand side, which feature scenes from a slave auction and whip-wielding plantation master. In contrast, the scenes of the right-hand side show free blacks attending school and gathering with family, as well as suggest harmony between blacks and whites. Online at http://digitallibrary.hsp.org/index.php/Detail/Object/Show/object_id/694.

Editorial Advisory Committee

BETH BAILEY
Temple University

DANIEL B. BARR
Robert Morris University

SETH BRUGGEMAN
Temple University

ERICA ARMSTRONG DUNBAR
University of Delaware

CAROL FAULKNER
Syracuse University

JOHN FEA
Messiah College

JUDITH GIESBERG
Villanova University

ANN N. GREENE
University of Pennsylvania

LISA LEVENSTEIN
*University of North Carolina,
Greensboro*

WALTER LICHT
University of Pennsylvania

SALLY McMURRAY
Pennsylvania State University

RANDALL MILLER
St. Joseph's University

CARLA MULFORD
Pennsylvania State University

EDWARD MULLER
University of Pittsburgh

JUDITH RIDNER
Mississippi State University

FRANCIS RYAN
Rutgers University

DAVID SCHUYLER
Franklin & Marshall College

ANDREW SHANKMAN
Rutgers University, Camden

Editor

TAMARA GASKELL

Assistant Editor

RACHEL MOLOSHOK

THE PENNSYLVANIA MAGAZINE OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY (ISSN 0031-4587) is published each quarter in January, April, July, and October by THE HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF PENNSYLVANIA, 1300 Locust Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107-5699. Periodicals postage paid at Philadelphia, PA and additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** send address changes to PMHB, Historical Society of Pennsylvania, 1300 Locust Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107-5699. **Authorization for academic photocopying:** For permission to reuse material, please access www.copyright.com or contact the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, 978-750-8400. CCC is a nonprofit organization that provides licenses and registration for a variety of uses. **Submissions:** All communications should be addressed to the editor. E-mail may be sent to pmhb@hsp.org. Manuscripts should conform to *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Electronic submissions are welcome. For submission guidelines, visit the *PMHB* web page (<http://hsp.org/publications/pennsylvania-magazine-of-history-biography>). The editor does not assume responsibility for statements of fact or of opinion made by the contributors.

Contributors

DANIEL R. BIDDLE is the co-author, with Murray Dubin, of *Tasting Freedom: Octavius Catto and the Battle for Equality in Civil War America* (2010). He is politics editor of the *Philadelphia Inquirer*, and his investigative stories with two other reporters on Philadelphia's troubled courts won a Pulitzer Prize and other national awards. He has taught urban journalism at the University of Pennsylvania and nineteenth-century civil rights history at Villanova.

MURRAY DUBIN is co-author, with Daniel R. Biddle, of *Tasting Freedom: Octavius Catto and the Battle for Equality in Civil War America* (2010). He was a journalist for thirty-six years, thirty-four of them as a reporter and editor at the *Philadelphia Inquirer*.

ERICA ARMSTRONG DUNBAR is associate professor of history and black American studies at University of Delaware and author of *A Fragile Freedom: African American Women and Emancipation in the Antebellum City* (2008). She has participated in documentaries including PBS's *The Abolitionists* (2013). Her latest book project is entitled *Never Caught: The President's Runaway Slave*.

DOUGLAS R. EGERTON is professor of history at Le Moyne College. His most recent books include *Year of Meteors: Stephen Douglas, Abraham Lincoln, and the Election That Brought on the Civil War* (2010) and *The Wars of Reconstruction: The Brief, Violent History of America's Most Progressive Era* (2013).

ERIC FONER is DeWitt Clinton Professor of History at Columbia University and the author of numerous works on American history. His most recent book is *The Fiery Trial: Abraham Lincoln and American Slavery*, winner, among other awards, of the Bancroft, Lincoln, and Pulitzer Prizes.

RANDALL M. MILLER is the William Dirk Warren '50 Sesquicentennial Chair and Professor of History at Saint Joseph's University. He is the author or editor of numerous books, including, most recently, *Lincoln and Leadership: Military, Political, and Religious Decision Making* (2012) and is a former editor of the *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*.

RICHARD S. NEWMAN is a professor of history at Rochester Institute of Technology and the author of numerous books on African American history and abolitionism, including *The Transformation of American Abolitionism: Fighting Slavery in the Early Republic* (2002) and *Freedom's Prophet: Richard Allen, the AME Church, and the Black Founding Fathers* (2008).

DAVID W. YOUNG is executive director of Cliveden, a historic site of the National Trust for Historic Preservation located in Philadelphia. He is a lecturer in the graduate program in historic preservation at the University of Pennsylvania and holds a PhD in American History from Ohio State University.

The full run of the *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography* is available in electronic format on JSTOR (<http://www.jstor.org>). Information on both print and electronic subscriptions can be found at <http://shop.hsp.org/catalog/publications/pmhb/subscription>. Both sites can also be accessed from the journal's website at <http://hsp.org/publications/pennsylvania-magazine-of-history-biography>.