

shifts model Aden's method, which he refers to as "re-collection." The point, he explains, is not necessarily to focus on a singular location, but rather to understand how "persons and places interact within the complex process of meaning-making at memory sites" (14).

*PMHB* readers will appreciate the sources that Aden brings into play. He scours newspapers, scholarly books and journals, travel blogs, visitor studies, NPS reports, and his own interviews with various stakeholders for any and all indication of how people have responded to the President's House project since its inception. He even explores proposed monument designs that were not built, as well as the 780 evaluation cards filled out by people who reviewed them. This is important work that hedges against the tendency to study people who build monuments rather than those for whom they are built. Aden discovers that the monument's historical treatment of slavery—the burning core of the President's House controversy—did not occasion a predictable bifurcation of audiences by race. In fact, visitors sustained a remarkably dynamic conversation about race and power during the site's excavation.

It is this facet of Aden's book, in fact, that leaves me wanting more. The President's House episode was just one of several in Philadelphia during those years wherein high-stakes conversations about the history of slavery figured prominently in heritage settings. Understanding why that was seems vital to plumbing the particularities of the President's House story. Aden sees the national context, and he gestures at the complex relationship between race and urban development in postwar Philadelphia, but there is a deeper regional story here that gets lost in the mix. That the mix is so thick, though, is a credit to Aden's vision, and good reason to engage this first stab at one of the weightiest public history controversies of our time.

*Temple University*

SETH C. BRUGGEMAN

*Gateway to Freedom: The Hidden History of the Underground Railroad.* By ERIC FONER. (New York: W. W. Norton, 2015. 301 pp. Maps, illustrations, notes, index. \$26.95.)

*Gateway to Freedom* is a generously illustrated book based on Sidney Howard Gay's recently discovered "Record of Fugitives." It situates New York City as both the hub of an extensive Underground Railroad (UGRR) network and a treacherous place for freedom seekers. Referring to William Still's *The Underground Railroad* and Gay's journal among other sources, Eric Foner explains New York City's pivotal role and provides context for famous escapes, kidnappings, and rescues.

Gay's "Record of Fugitives" emerges alongside the works of William Still, Wilbur Siebert, and Levi Coffin as a major primary source in UGRR literature. Don Papson and Tom Calarco's *Secret Lives of the Underground Railroad in New York City*, an annotated publication of Gay's journals, adds helpful detail when read in conjunction with *Gateway to Freedom*. Distinguishing abolitionists, the antislavery movement, and the Underground Railroad movement, *Gateway to Freedom* outlines the relationships that defined the New York Vigilance Committee and the UGRR and clarifies how the UGRR operated in the city and along the northeastern metropolitan corridor. The African American leadership of the Vigilance Committee emerges as a major conduit for freedom seekers. The book details public legal actions of the committee and of other prominent New York abolitionists. From the internal strife of the Vigilance Committee to the formation of the American Anti-Slavery Society and the American and Foreign Anti-Slavery Society, Foner parses the committee's permutations and reformations. *Gateway to Freedom* clarifies the causes and results of schisms between New York and Boston, Garrisonians and Tappanites, and the committee and subsequent antislavery societies.

This book extends Larry Gara, Charles Blockson, and David Blight's critique of Harvard-trained historian Wilbur Siebert's seminal work, *The Underground Railroad from Slavery to Freedom*. Foner's claim that the detailed maps contained therein are "largely a product of [Siebert's] vivid imagination" demands both substantive examination and proof, as Siebert's maps are too valuable to be readily dismissed (12).

Foner highlights multiple legal strategies adopted in the fight against slavery, with an excellent discussion of opposition to the Fugitive Slave Law of 1793 and the support of such legal doctrines as "the freedom principle." New York's reaction to the Fugitive Slave Law of 1850 exposes the complicated relationship between New York state and the economy of slavery.

This exploration of Gay's papers brings the reader closer to understanding the reality that underlies legends of the Underground Railroad. Foner observes that the "heroic work" of New York's white abolitionists "would not have been possible without the courage and resourcefulness . . . of blacks, from the members of the Vigilance Committee to the black churches that sheltered runaway slaves and ordinary men and women who watched for fugitives on the docks and city streets and took them into their homes" (230). Even as the book describes the indispensable work of black abolitionist Louis Napoleon, the author laments the lack of information about "black men and women whose names are lost to history" (230). The future work of New York historians will be to add these names to the foundation laid by *Gateway to Freedom*.

*University of Maryland, College Park*

CHERYL JANIFER LAROCHE