

THE
PENNSYLVANIA
MAGAZINE
OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY

VOLUME CXLII

April 2018

NO. 2

IMPROVING INDEPENDENCE: THE STRUGGLE OVER LAND
SURVEYS IN NORTHWESTERN PENNSYLVANIA IN 1794

Marcus Gallo 131

PARDON OR PUNISH? LEGAL AND COMMUNITY
INTERPRETATIONS OF A NINETEENTH-CENTURY
INFANTICIDE

Joanna B. Spanos 163

MIXED FEELINGS: STEPHEN COLWELL, CHRISTIAN
SENSIBILITY, AND THE AMERICAN STATE, 1841–61

Drew VandeCreek 189

BOOK REVIEWS

215

BOOK REVIEWS

BUTTERFIELD, <i>The Making of Tocqueville's America: Law and Association in the Early United States</i> , by Jessica Roney	215
COHEN, <i>Luxurious Citizens: The Politics of Consumption in Nineteenth-Century America</i> , by Rosanne Currarino	216
HOLCOMB, <i>Moral Commerce: Quakers and the Transatlantic Boycott of the Slave Labor Economy</i> , by Carol Lasser	217
DIEMER, <i>The Politics of Black Citizenship: Free African Americans in the Mid-Atlantic Borderland, 1817–1863</i> , by Millington Bergeson-Lockwood	219
MAILLARD, ed., <i>Whispers of Cruel Wrongs: The Correspondence of Louisa Jacobs and Her Circle, 1879–1911</i> , by Harriet Hyman Alonso	220
BRADDOCK AND IGOE, eds., <i>A Greene Country Towne: Philadelphia's Ecology in the Cultural Imagination</i> , by Eliza Butler	221
MCCONNELL-SIDORICK, <i>Silk Stockings and Socialism: Philadelphia's Radical Hosiery Workers from the Jazz Age to the New Deal</i> , by Katarina Keane	222
ORESICK, <i>The Schenley Experiment: A Social History of Pittsburgh's First Public High School</i> , by Jon Shelton	224

COVER ILLUSTRATION: Title page vignette, in *The Pennsylvania Hermit* (New York, 1838). This image depicts the 1786 execution of Pennsylvania woman Elizabeth Wilson, convicted of the murder of her infant twins. By the time this engraving was produced circa 1838, legend surrounded Wilson's story. As seen here, tradition held that Wilson's brother arrived too late to save his sister with a pardon from the governor. Roughly two decades later, Pennsylvania executed another woman, Susanna Cox, under similar circumstances. As Joanna Spanos shows in this issue, stories of Cox's life and death also melded fact and legend. Image courtesy of the Library Company of Philadelphia.

ERRATA: Print copies of the October 2017 issue neglected to include the following sentence in the editorial: "Guest editors William W. Cutler III and Jonathan Zimmerman, without whom this issue would not have been possible, deserve much of the credit for the variety of topics represented and the high quality of the articles in which they appear."

Editorial Advisory Committee

SUSAN BRANSON

Syracuse University

CHRISTOPHER CAPOZZOLA

*Massachusetts Institute of
Technology*

PETER CONN

Athenaeum of Philadelphia

KALI N. GROSS

Rutgers University

BERNARD L. HERMAN

*University of North Carolina,
Chapel Hill*

JOHN HINSHAW

Lebanon Valley College

LISA LEVENSTEIN

*University of North Carolina,
Greensboro*

CHRIS MAGOC

Mercyhurst University

ELIZABETH MILROY

Drexel University

LESLIE PATRICK

Bucknell University

THOMAS RZEZNIK

Seton Hall University

FRANCIS RYAN

Rutgers University

KARIM TIRO

Xavier University

ROGER SIMON

Lehigh University

JANNEKEN SMUCKER

West Chester University

JONATHAN WHITE

*Christopher Newport
University*

JAMES WOLFINGER

DePaul University

Editor

CHRISTINA LAROCCO

Managing Editor

RACHEL MOLOSHOK

Editorial Intern

JESSICA LIS

THE PENNSYLVANIA MAGAZINE OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY (ISSN 0031-4587, print; ISSN 2169-8546, online) is published in January, April, and October by THE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA PRESS, 3905 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104-4112. Postage paid at Philadelphia, PA, and additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** send address changes to PMHB, Historical Society of Pennsylvania, 1300 Locust Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107-5699. **Authorization for academic photocopying:** For permission to reuse material, please access <http://www.copyright.com> or contact the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, 978-750-8400. CCC is a nonprofit organization that provides licenses and registration for a variety of uses. **Submissions:** All communications should be addressed to the editor. Email may be sent to pmhb@hsp.org. Manuscripts should conform to *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Electronic submissions are welcome. For submission guidelines, visit the *PMHB* web page (<http://hsp.org/publications/pennsylvania-magazine-of-history-biography>). The editor does not assume responsibility for statements of fact or of opinion made by the contributors.

Contributors

MARCUS GALLO is an assistant professor in the history department at John Carroll University.

JOANNA B. SPANOS earned her PhD, specializing in folklore, from the Department of Comparative Studies at Ohio State University and her Master of Arts in history from Penn State. Her dissertation, titled "Redeeming Susanna Cox: A Pennsylvania German Infanticide in Community Tradition," focuses on the ethnography, literary representations, and festival reenactments associated with Cox's life. The research for this project was supported in part by the Coca-Cola Critical Difference for Women Grant Program and the David and Helen Birdsall Memorial Scholarship Fund.

DREW VANDECREEK is Director of Digital Scholarship at Northern Illinois University Libraries. He holds a PhD in American history from the University of Virginia (1996).