story to speak for itself but displays his selective judgment by asserting that the remarkable detail could only be remembered by a sensitive and intelligent child. He would have us believe that this child aged eight and practically naked (who incidentally became a "baby" on the pitch) was thrown 15 to 20 feet by a workman from a mattress floating in a turbulent current. (The story does not say whether she was thrown from a standing or a reclining position but the reader is asked to note who caught her. Not the man you think. She went beyond him.) Truly remarkable.

The fact remains, that the people most interested did not believe that the South Fork Dam would break, but should it do so, they thought the force of its waters would be dissipated in the fourteen miles of its tortuous course before reaching Johnstown. No one could foresee that wire and wreckage would combine effectively to block the run-off through the unyielding arches of the stone bridge below the city or that fire in the midst of its backwash would destroy hundreds of lives. The verdict was against "neglect" but if it existed it should be shared by the club with the state, the Pennsylvania Railroad, Cambria Iron Company, the newspaper, city council and others.

Criticism of this book is by no means exhausted in this limited space. The honest presentation of the weather conditions, the fairness as to the identity and action of John G. Parke, Jr., engineer, and the description of Clara Barton's relief work are all dimmed by bias so evident elsewhere that one is left wondering as to motive.

Pittsburgh

ROBERT D. CHRISTIE

Bibliography of Pennsylvania History, compiled by NORMAN B. WILKINSON, edited by S. K. STEVENS and DONALD H. KENT (Harrisburg, Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, 1957, xxx, 709 pp. Index. $7.00)

Twelve years ago the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission published its Writings on Pennsylvania History: A Bibliography. This was a compilation of better than 6,000 "secondary materials" published through 1942; it has served as a useful reference tool for teachers and students of Pennsylvania's history as well as those who interpret this commonwealth's role in our country's past.
The Commission candidly recognized that this first effort was neither perfect nor complete and anticipated that subsequent editions would not only correct these shortcomings but also keep the work abreast of the most recent writings produced. To this end, the Commission has published a Bibliography of Pennsylvania History, compiled by Norman B. Wilkinson and edited by S. K. Stevens and Donald H. Kent. To bring the work more nearly to the present, the literature of the period from 1943 through 1952 has been incorporated into the first edition, and, to correct certain omissions, items that should have been included in the earlier compilation but were neglected have been added. As a result, 9,198 entries covering "from prehistoric times to the year 1952 A.D." make up the main body of this Bibliography.

Wilkinson admits that he has been selective in choosing the entries but he asserts, as a general rule, "everything . . . which might add to a more complete picture of the State's past, and to a better understanding of its contemporary affairs" has been mentioned. Consequently, items that can be classified under the following types of materials on or about Pennsylvania are listed: printed books and serial articles, biographies, autobiographical writings, printed source materials, printed and unprinted doctoral dissertations and masters theses, publications of our many regional, county, and local historical societies, general works with material about our state, textbooks on state and local history and government, pamphlets, brochures, and printed addresses, and finally tales, legends, poetry, and plays where Pennsylvania is a part of the scene.

The plan of organization adopted promotes easy use of this Bibliography. After a compact first section devoted to bibliographic aids, the main body of the work, comprising the great majority of entries, is divided into two parts—first, "The Colony," second, "The Commonwealth." Here entries are grouped in a topical, state-wide manner with the hope of making the volume more a state rather than a local research tool. Next, Section 3 picks up those materials not easily adapted to the chronological-topical arrangement of the main body—county and local histories, accounts of military organizations and religious groups, and descriptive works. Finally, folklore tales, legends, poetry, and plays are given a separate and minor place as Section 4. Throughout, many of the volume entries are annotated but only as to content; while most of these comments are
useful, some are hardly more than the title of the work cast in different words.

At the end of the Bibliography an excellent author and subject index of 116 pages is provided.

A careful survey of the Bibliography yields much light on the status of Pennsylvania history. One is struck by the extensive writings about William Penn and yet we are told that Thomas Clarkson's Memoirs . . . of William Penn, published in 1849, is "the first real biography attempted and one that is not yet superseded." There are nearly 200 entries about Benjamin Franklin's life and works, yet other Pennsylvanians of note have hardly been studied. While it is generally true that our governors have been marked by their mediocrity, there is still a real need to evaluate their lives and administrations; only Curtin and Pinchot have attracted the historian to any extent. Our state's industrial and technological prowess is known the world over but why are there so many gaps, especially in accounts of the men who made it all possible—Samuel Keir is just one whose name comes to mind? We have worked and reworked the ground around the Germans and the Scotch-Irish but have passed over the millions who have come to us from southern and eastern Europe. Certainly this Bibliography bears out Philip S. Klein's contention (in his Presidential Address before the Pennsylvania Historical Association on October 18, 1957) that our historians have neglected the important post-1865 period in their never-ending search for the origins and development of our traditions.

This Bibliography is a valuable source of information for people of all kinds interested in Pennsylvania history; we owe a great debt to the compiler, editors, and publisher for their contribution. But we look to the Historical and Museum Commission to do two things for use in the future. First, bring out a new edition every decade to keep this resource up-to-date; second, begin the vitally important work of adding "primary materials" to make for completeness.

University of Pittsburgh

Robert E. Carlson


A Philadelphia Story is an account of what the author describes