BOOK REVIEWS

Ill-Starred General—Braddock of the Coldstream Guards. By Lee McCardell. University of Pittsburgh Press, Pittsburgh, Pa., 1958. xii and 335 pp, including 272 of text, 42 of notes, 14 of bibliography and 7 of index. 5 illustrations. $6.

This book was seemingly planned to be—and starts off as—a good newspaperman's major contribution to history. Internal evidence indicates that the author organized his efforts and his materials to make possible a definitive biography-in-depth of that Major General Edward Braddock whose long march and swift defeat were so important in the early history of this region. The result is a book of much interest, but one which has missed its mark. If successful, it might have been another Border Captain or God's Angry Man. As it stands, it should provide material for several interesting articles in, say, American Heritage Magazine, and a number of additional articles in Sunday supplements.

Mr. McCardell immersed himself in background material. We are given a really brilliant short account of English history from the Restoration in 1665 through the nine decades to 1755 and what we Americans call the French and Indian War. We learn that Braddock was actually Edward Braddock III. His father, Edward II, like himself, was both a major general of the line and a lieutenant-colonel of the Coldstream Guards. Edward Braddock, the first, was Choir Master at, and buried in, Westminster Abbey. We meet, at length, Charles II, James II, Queen Anne and the first Duke of Marlborough, with his wife and sister. The tragedy of Braddock's sister Fanny is detailed. We read Braddock's will and learn what happened to his silver plate (but not half his fortune) after his death. The book fails at precisely the points where it should come to grips with its subject. We are told what Braddock does—but given little insight as to why. No new light whatever is shed upon the relationship of Braddock to the complex spendthrift 18th Century Actress George Anne Bellamy. Although her early life and loves are recounted in detail, we are not told whether or not she really gained anything from the half of Braddock's fortune he bequeathed to her supposed husband, the agent and politician, John Calcraft. In fact, the references to Miss Bellamy
and to Calcraft were so teasingly indefinite that this reviewer was driven to look up the biographies of both in the *Dictionary of National Biography*. We learn nothing of the Mrs. Mary Yorke, to whom Braddock left the other half of his estate, other than that her husband, Lieutenant John Yorke, was on duty at Gibraltar when Braddock was stationed there.

As *Ill-Starred General* approaches the climactic events of the Battle of the Monongahela, new materials are increasingly sparse. More and more reliance is placed upon secondary sources while the fruits of recent scholarship are neglected. The two most important and informative compilations of the last half century are mishandled in one case and neglected in the other. There is no reference whatever to the papers published in 1952 by the Universite de Laval, which contain French accounts written immediately before and after the Battle. Most of what we are told of the French side is derived instead from a somewhat suspect book published in Boston in 1841.

There are, indeed, copious quotations from the 1936 volume *Military Affairs in North America* prepared by Stanley McCrory Pargellis. This consists almost entirely of excerpts from documents studied by Pargellis in the Library at Windsor Castle whose importance was first recognized by him and whose existence had previously been unsuspected. However, there is no reference whatever to Pargellis' definitive account of the Battle as published in the *American Historical Review* 22 years ago, which was based upon analysis of these documents. Reliance upon quotations from the book which McCardell cites as "Pargellis" without any reference to or knowledge of Pargellis' masterly evaluation of the sources of the quotations has led to incorrect conclusions.

Both the index and the bibliography are full of errors and omissions, of which many may possibly be typographical. The notes are quite complete and extremely accurate in their references to pages, however, leading to the conclusion that the author rather than the typesetter or proofreader is responsible for the failings of the index and bibliography. Typical of the errors in the index are the omission of references to the Duke of Cumberland, although he was the Commander-in-Chief of the British Army in 1755 and figures extensively in the text itself; John Calcraft is called Jack Calcroft, etc. In the bibliography only the author, title, city and year of publication
are given, somewhat insufficient in several cases. Middle names and initials are dropped, and Solon Burk is credited with the authorship of *The Planting of Civilization in Western Pennsylvania*. Four illustrations are halftones, one a line engraving. Included are a photograph of the monument erected over Braddock's supposed grave, two photographs of maps so reduced in size as to be useless, and a photograph of an engraving made of Braddock 26 years after his death, used as a frontispiece. The line engraving is of the Braddock family tree.

Whoever in the future may attempt a definitive biography of Major General Edward Braddock III, or of any of his known ancestors, will do well to start with a critical reading of this gallant effort. Mr. McCardell has unearthed and made available to the general reader much material on the family, military, amatory and social background of the General. It is unfortunate that the closing chapters were inadequately researched and that they, along with the index and bibliography, did not receive the attention obviously given to the first half of the book.

Washington, D. C. and Pittsburgh

HARRISON GILMER

*Industrial Medicine in Western Pennsylvania 1850-1950.* By T. LYLE HAZLETT, M.D., and WILLIAM W. HUMMEL. University of Pittsburgh Press, Pittsburgh, Pa., 1957, XIII, 275 pp., Index. 4 Appendices, Notes. $6.00.

Dr. Hazlett is Emeritus Professor, Department of Industrial Hygiene, School of Medicine, University of Pittsburgh, and was Medical Director of the Westinghouse Electric Corporation from 1920 to 1950. Mr. Hummel is a teacher in the Department of History in the University of Pittsburgh. In this volume the authors attempt—and succeed very well—to describe the journey travelled by Industrial Medicine in Western Pennsylvania from the days of Dr. Albert G. Walter (1811-1876) to the present time. Before the publication of this book there had been none written on the subject of Industrial Medicine in Western Pennsylvania comparable to those written by Alice Hamilton on Industrial Disease. Little or no research was reported before the middle of the 19th century.

While the title implies that only Industrial Medicine in Western