paign for reform prospered and was appreciated most among people best informed about it. But the number of his enemies increased, especially after 1766, when he published *Four Dissertations on the Reciprocal Advantages of a Perpetual Union between Great Britain and her American Colonies*. The fact that he was at heart a patriot did not help him. On the contrary, when Congress chose him Physician-in-Chief of the American army, troubles multiplied. By January 9, 1777, he was removed "without explanation." The sensitivity which was innate in him led him to feel disgraced irretrievably. He withdrew from public life, confining his endeavors to his private practice and his commitments at his college and the Pennsylvania Hospital. In the end he was alone and poor, broken in health of body and mind. Dr. Bell has told the whole story as it never has been attempted by any other writer. The result is Greek and Shakespearean, but, in common with the greatest of tragedies, it is noble and inspiring — a good book, deserving of gratitude unqualified.

*Pittsburgh*  
*JAMES WALDO FAWCETT*


To bring accuracy, order, and meaning to romantic myths of the past is one of the great joys of the historian. Unfortunately, in doing so, he all too often does not match research skill with writing skill. Wayne Broehl's book on the Molly Maguires is an exception. His style has suspense, clarity, and continuity, and the book represents the first serious attempt to separate fact from fiction in the story of the violence perpetrated in the Schuylkill coal fields by the Irish secret society. The murders committed, the involvement of the Pinkerton detectives, and the resultant trials and hangings of the Mollies in the mid-1870's have been the subjects over the years of numerous non-fiction accounts, novels (Arthur Conan Doyle wrote a Sherlock Holmes novel based on the affair), and Sunday supplement articles; a scholarly look at the Mollies was definitely in order.

Previous writers on the Mollies have not had Broehl's devotion to meticulous and skeptical scholarship, nor have they had access to both the letterbooks of Allan Pinkerton and the files of the Reading Railroad, another of the major participants in the drama. Nor have
others done such extensive research into the backgrounds of Mollyism among the Irish secret societies or "Ribbon" movements. Broehl's attempt to be thorough, however, sometimes leads to excesses of scholarship. A case in point: Broehl's discussion of the Irish peasants' reactions to the brutal conditions of life in Ireland in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries and the resulting gangsterism and protest against English landlords is very helpful, but far too much time is spent on the specific events which occurred on the estate of Evelyn John Shirley in the early nineteenth century. One waits in vain for the relevance of all this to be later demonstrated. Similar comments could be made about the extensive documentation of Allan Pinkerton's peculiarities and personality and the discussion in minute detail of James McParlan's (the Pinkerton detective who exposed the Mollies) expense accounts, which could have been handled by a footnote or appendix. Broehl can be excused some overdocumentation, however, in view of the little regard for accuracy shown by previous studies.

More serious than Broehl's overzealous detailed reporting of events is the often alarming lack of clear statement of opinion or framework of interpretation. For example, even though he has proved beyond reasonable doubt that Franklin B. Gowen, President of the Reading Railroad, knew that there was no connection whatsoever between the Molly Maguire murders and labor union activity, he fails to point out that the Molly Maguire trials were important to Gowen only as a means of destroying the miners' union. Although the suspense built up in the first half of the book makes for very exciting reading (hinting that the Mollies may have been a myth), the continuation of this suspense in the second half could leave some readers believing that they really were a myth! The murders and other violence which occurred in the Schuylkill coal fields in these years were almost all personal grudge fights. No evidence is shown that the Irish miners generally conspired against the mine owners or against the Reading Railroad, although they obviously conspired against the Welsh and English miners. The number of murdered men does not even seem unusual, considering the length of time involved, the population of the area, and the lawlessness present in any mining community anywhere. Why, then, all the fuss? Broehl points out, but not strongly enough, that the Molly Maguire affair was useful to certain men and groups who could use the issue to attack Irish Catholics and labor unions. Bereft of the significance which Franklin Gowen and Allan Pinkerton (among others) lent to it, the whole affair was simply gang warfare.
What is needed to complete this study (if one admits, as does Broehl, that the private lives, ambitions, fears, and hates of the individual participants are vital to the story) is to determine just what groups and organizations in American society felt about the Mollies and why. Then we might know better the audience(s) to which Gowen and Pinkerton were playing.

In spite of the failure to make strong conclusions (and the professional historian can easily make them based on the evidence presented) the book is a good example of the historian's craft. It should definitely appeal to a very broad reading audience (perhaps this was the reason for putting the footnotes at the back). There is no bibliography, but this is more than compensated for by the remarkable list of characters which follows the last chapter. Broehl has written what will easily become the standard work on the Mollies, and deservedly so.

University of Pittsburgh                               Monte A. Calvert

Matthew Elliott, British Indian Agent. By Reginald Horsman.

This publication is in many respects a distinct success. It is a fine example of portraiture in language, an excellent example of biography as basic history. The biographical thread and emphasis give the volume much of its significance and historical value. Upon this line, steadily maintained, are hung wider subjects of national and international scope, though many of them are, probably unavoidably, general and sometimes cursory.

It might be said that the title is incomplete in that the earlier role of Matthew Elliott as fur trader is not included though it is well handled in the context. A valid excuse for the title would be that the last thirty-five years of Elliott's life were far the most important historically and much more fully documented.

Much geographical territory is touched upon in the eleven chapters. Various items deal with Pennsylvania, Ohio, Kentucky, Indiana, Illinois, Wisconsin, Michigan and other regions of the United States. And Canadian affairs receive much attention. British government and politics, centered at London, are brought into the picture.