
Pennsylvanians take great pride in the cultural accomplishments of their state. Hence this publication by John Joseph Stoudt with its wealth of handsome illustrations will be happily received.

In the introduction and preface Mr. Stoudt attempts to define his purpose and to characterize the arts and crafts of all of Pennsylvania as he sees them. He continues with five chapters, one each on architecture, furniture, fine arts, crafts, and the illuminating art. Each of these is a survey of these aspects of the visual arts, separate essays, that he has considered to be suitable categories. They seem to be natural divisions for the art that is peculiar to Pennsylvania, although one might question terms and wonder why the art of glass painting is considered to be a major art and the art of the potter only a craft. Be that as it may there are here descriptions and illustrations of many interesting and worthy fine works in the arts that have not hitherto been published. Perhaps more attention might have been given to Pennsylvania chalkware figures, one of the most charming, in my opinion, of the folk arts of this state.

The entire publication reflects careful preparation, and a sensitivity, especially for the folk artist and craftsman, that are admirable. Mr. Stoudt proposes in his introduction and preface some interesting, some obvious, points of view, but poses, it seems to me, more than is realized in the detailed discussions. He suggests, for example, that the designs of Pennsylvania folk art are symbolic and take meaning from the culture which surrounds them and that they are related to other cultural forms like religion, poetry, folklore and religious literature. In this connection, in this work, he seems not to have gone beyond what he had already proposed in Consider the Lilies, How They Grow. Surely no one would quarrel with the thesis that designs found in Pennsylvania frakturs, pottery, barn decoration, are not representational copies of natural objects or that they do not show what natural flowers look like.

The discussions of each of these five phases of the arts are factual and descriptive of objects or buildings, satisfactory for the most part in themselves, but not developed, in a sense, as promised. I am not quarreling with the result. A survey of the arts of Pennsylvania so carefully and sensitively expressed is a worthy accomplishment. Some of it is repetitive, but many examples are new. Some of Mr. Stoudt's
observations seem to me to have been proposed and already well established, such as the suggestion that Philadelphia furniture reflects differing ways of life — the life of the social aristocrat in the city or the simpler way of living practiced by the piedmont farmer. Surely, too, it must be generally accepted that the folk arts and crafts of what the author calls piedmont Pennsylvania, as of anywhere, are a sincere expression of the people who made them.

Mr. Stoudt has placed great emphasis upon the influence of Germany upon these arts. In so doing it would have been more convincing perhaps to have included some examples of German prototypes in illustration. One thinks especially of the chapter on architecture, and also on the illuminating art. It is of interest to have reproduced so many examples of frakturs from the splendid collection now in the rare book room of the Philadelphia Public Library.

One is aware in reading this book of an unevenness. In the section on painting, for example, an undue emphasis has been put upon the importance of the artist Valentine Haidt. Nor does this section do justice to the Philadelphia school in general. Indeed the absence of footnotes and bibliography for the entire publication is somewhat disconcerting.

There is a strong provincial flavor throughout the book, resulting it would seem from both what has been said and what has not been included. This discussion of the importance of Pennsylvania in early American art is strangely isolated with no definite statement of a relation to the rest of the colonies, and influences which played upon them. New England, Virginia, the Dutch settlements all appear to be remote and almost unacknowledged. It seems almost presumptuous to say that “Pennsylvania craft art . . . is surely the best known.” Known to us in Pennsylvania, perhaps, but one would think in the Southwest that Indian arts and crafts are better known to people of that region than are slipware pie plates or German frakturs, and that Navajo rugs were more familiar than are Pennsylvania quilts. Possibly a visitor to the folk museum at Shelbourne, Vermont, might prefer the creativity of that region. It does not seem to follow necessarily that no other region did better work because a British art historian adores Pennsylvania folk art. On the other hand it is of interest to point out the importance of the recently established museum of American art at Bath in England where an appreciation of the American arts, and especially of Pennsylvania work, has been so admirably demonstrated.

This provincial approach has been emphasized in another way by a complete lack of recognition almost of the very existence of western Pennsylvania. This is owing, I believe, to Mr. Stoudt's justi-
fiable enthusiasm for his native section rather than to any deliberate rejection of the settlements on the other side of the Alleghenies. But one is reminded a little in reading this splendid publication, often highly illuminating, of the little old lady from Boston who thought she would travel to California by way of Dedham. We would like Mr. Stoudt to plan his route at least by way of crossing the Susquehanna. It could have been suggested that while we here in the far hinterland of Pennsylvania recognize the clear-cut priority of the eastern part of the state in any claim to significant achievement in the arts, we have not been totally devoid of some attempts to emulate, however feebly, our peers of the "plain country" over east. There is evidence of interest in the arts in this region in the early nineteenth century and even at the end of the eighteenth. From early times here, too, as in Philadelphia, the buildings of Pittsburgh can be said to symbolize the qualities of its citizens; there were reminiscences at least of American historical styles here, tempered by environmental influences which have given often a special quality to architecture here. The log cabin, the log cabin house, church, school, in the west was also directed by the materials and tools at hand, and the log building stands in western Pennsylvania as a symbol of the unsophisticated hard working pioneer peoples who built the city of Pittsburgh, much as does the simple stone cabin of the plain and primitive culture of eastern Pennsylvania. The log house known as Croghan's Castle was a peculiar product of this region. Here in the west a certain elegance, such as one might have seen in the mantelpieces ornamented with plaster angels and wreaths of a house built by General John Neville, combined with a basic primitive spirit of the log house to produce structures peculiar to this region. A number of individual houses that once stood in this area might be mentioned, as Mr. Stoudt has so interestingly and informatively pointed out examples in the eastern end of the state. Our houses built of local field and limestone had a flavor of their own. The Wallace house in Braddock in certain of its architectural refinements tempered by environment could be likened to houses of the Federal period such as might be found in Salem, Massachusetts, Wiscasset, Maine, or other areas in the colonies. We had our special Georgian style here, too, in the last decade of the eighteenth century and the early part of the nineteenth century, such as the Isaac Meason house, the Isaac Manchester house, the First Presbyterian Church, the octagon-shaped Trinity Episcopal Church. The town of Brownsville and surrounding countryside, Washington, Pennsylvania, Bedford, all can boast of handsome buildings of a localized style of worthy archi-
tectural refinement. There is a typical western Pennsylvania type farmhouse to be seen today throughout much of western Pennsylvania. The first third of the nineteenth century saw in the Pittsburgh region some very fine Greek Revival style houses and other buildings, tempered again to produce a special quality of Greek Revival that can be said to be characteristic of this region, marked by a certain strength that reflected the character of the peoples who came here to build up the frontier.

The buildings at Economy, Pennsylvania, of the Harmony Society founded in 1805 as a Christian communal group by German colonists from Wurttemburg, formed one of the most interesting architectural and sociological groups in the entire country. There, skilled craftsmen produced pottery, textiles, and other crafts. Pennsylvanian Germans settled in and around Somerset County and were active in the folk arts. There is no space here to go into detail about the industry and art of glassmaking. Yet O'Hara, Bakewell, Pears, and others are names familiar to anyone seriously interested in the history of American glass. There were early efforts here, too, in good cabinet making.

In painting while no specific school developed here and there is no validity in thinking of Pittsburgh as a center, yet individual painters working in this area reflected this environment. There were itinerant portrait painters here. There was an Ohio River Valley tradition of painting that warrants notice. A Ph.D. dissertation by Miss Katherine Donaldson, head of the art department at Western College for Women, is in process at this time. Painters such as Audubon, Joshua Shaw, Charles Lesueur, Chester Harding, Thomas Cole, George Beck, Russell Smith, James Lambdin, and later, although not so pertinent for our period, Joseph Woodwell, William C. Wall, George Hetzel, David Blythe, and others worked in the Pittsburgh region.

Hopefully an account of some detail of this very subject is forthcoming in a publication which has been made possible by a grant from the Mellon Educational and Charitable Trust and is now in the hands of the University of Pittsburgh Press. With these two volumes one should be able to obtain a reasonable understanding of what happened in the arts throughout the whole state of Pennsylvania. My quarrel with Mr. Stoudt's book is chiefly the title, because we have here a handsome publication describing Philadelphia, a sophisticated center of early American painting, its handsome architecture, furniture, along with the fascinating work of the folk artist, the craftsman, all with the richness of a European background modified by a necessary adaptation to local environment. This is the story of American art as a whole.
Hence this handsome publication pointing up Pennsylvania as an outstanding exponent of the visual arts of this country is a welcome one.

*Assistant Director of the Henry Clay Frick Fine Arts Building and Professor of Fine Arts University of Pittsburgh*