

The number of illustrations in the 1974 catalogue has been increased almost fourfold, from 63 to 240. The quality of the offset lithography, unfortunately, is rather uneven. The three color reproductions are an enlivening addition and testify to the distinction of a number of portraits in the collection: the Copley portrait of Mr. and Mrs. Thomas Mifflin, the Joseph Wright portrait of George Washington, and the Benjamin West portrait of Jane Galloway.

The catalogue of portraits is arranged alphabetically by sitter. A biography of the sitter and a description of the physical appearance of the painting are set down methodically. The name of the artist where known or ascribed, occasionally the date, the acquisition by gift, bequest, or purchase, and pertinent references are recorded. "Other Subjects," including views of Philadelphia and environs, are arranged alphabetically by artist's name. No reference is made to the illustrations which are accessible only by perusing the appropriate chronological section in the list of illustrations, pp. xii-xix. The index to artists gives a brief biography and lists the paintings in the catalogue; again, there is reference neither to the illustrations nor to the catalogue entries. The lack of correlation of visual and written information and the absence of a general index make this catalogue trying to use.

Walter Whitehill strongly urges in *The Arts in Early American History* (Chapel Hill, N. C.: The University of North Carolina Press, 1965), p. 16, that ". . . every institution possessing pertinent objects . . . publish promptly as many carefully prepared and liberally illustrated catalogues of picture books, or both, as their time and resources permit." The Historical Society of Pennsylvania, through this important, though somewhat prosaic, catalogue, has made available to the antiquarian, the genealogist, and the art historian a large collection of American paintings. It is to be hoped that they will continue to record their resources for the public.

Art Division
Duquesne University
Pittsburgh

PATRICIA S. INGRAM

The Holy Experiment. By LOIS T. HENDERSON. (Hicksville, New York: Exposition Press, 1974. Pp. 237. \$7.50.)

Yankee Communes. Another American Way. By FLO MORSE. (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc., 1971. Pp. 179. Illustrated. \$4.95.)

Die Siedlungen der Württembergischen Templer in Palästina 1868-1918. By ALEX CARMEL. (Stuttgart: W. Kohlhammer Verlag, 1973. Pp. 307. Illustrated, index. Translated into German from the Hebrew. DM 35.)

Preussens Gloria im Heiligen Land. Die Deutschen und Jerusalem. By ERWIN ROTH. (Munich: Verlag Georg D. W. Callwey, 1973. Pp. 312. Illustrated, bibliography, index. DM 29.10.)

Only the first of the above titles is a work of fiction, and it is based on and developed around the two love affairs that a favorite of George Rapp, Hildegard Mutschler, had with two actual members of the Harmony Society — Jacob Klein and Conrad Feucht. George Rapp forced the former out of the society and gave him a very dirty deal, while the second, probably with his predecessor's fate in mind, did not give George Rapp a chance to do him dirt; he simply eloped with George Rapp's favorite assistant who had become an offense to the society. But while George Rapp quite cruelly had forced Jacob Klein out and, through a Pittsburgh lawyer, made him sign a document renouncing all his claims on Hildegard, George Rapp reversed himself and his preaching and openly called for the return of his favorite Hildegard.

While the congregation, and even Frederick who protested vigorously against Father Rapp's obvious unfairness, had to bow to the will of the tyrant, this double-dealing undermined his standing in the community and made the great schism under Leon comparatively easy. Fiction has one great advantage over fact in that it makes it possible for the author to present a smooth story without the disturbing gaps with which the historian must work, simply because certain facts have gone unrecorded or their record has been lost.

In this way, Lois T. Henderson, the author of *The Holy Experiment*, is remarkably successful in telling her story — up to chapter 15, that is the Klein climax, which is well told and passionately told. Then she makes the mistake of using Frederick Rapp's midnight letter to George Rapp, which pertained to the Hildegard elopement and not to the Klein affair, as an outlet for Frederick's feelings only to have him tear it up and throw it into the flames. Therefore, the entire Conrad Feucht affair, which culminated in the actual elopement *without* the prior knowledge of Father Rapp, becomes an anticlimax which is needlessly drawn out by Hildegard's illness. The author has shown in the Klein affair that she is capable of writing passionate scenes, but passions fail her in describing the much hotter affair with Conrad

Feucht. This is regrettable. One gets the impression that the author felt that marriage to a physician demanded a clinical preparation, such as witnessing the birth of cats. Physicians do probably know more about the anatomy of women than others before they fall in love, but my own experience tells me that all this is forgotten when physicians fall in love, which they do, and quite as passionately as other males. I think the author missed a great opportunity in failing to include the actual elopement of Hildegard and Conrad in her book. The space given to the entirely fictional aborted elopement of Gertrude Rapp should have been devoted to the real thing, which shook the foundations of the society.

Most admirable is the kindness and sympathy with which the author treats the faith that lived in the society. In the face of Father Rapp's tyranny and injustice it was not easy to write with so much understanding, and the author is to be complimented for this achievement. It would have been well to submit the text to some Germanist prior to publication, because this would have prevented quite a number of glaring errors in the German language which have now been fixed in print.

Flo Morse's *Yankee Communes* is a well-written, popular survey of the Shakers, Rappites, Oneida Community, and the more recent Society of Brothers. It contains some interesting illustrations which further enliven the text, and her treatment of the Harmonists, here called Rappites, is adequate for the readers she has in mind. Her book will pleasantly inform many of these various experiments in communal living whose interest in the subject would be killed at the sight of longer accounts documented and decorated with garlands of ibids and op cites.

The two works listed last are written in German, Carmel's being a translation from the original Hebrew. Both treat the history of German Protestant Zionism, particularly of Württemberg. The Harmonists were deeply interested in Protestant Zionism and the work of the Templars who settled in Palestine. They contributed heavily to this work both financially and spiritually; in fact, there was a time when, with their fellow Zionists, they held the title to Mt. Carmel and to large parcels of real estate in what is now Haifa. Much of their pioneer work today is resulting in rich harvests for Israel, and their descendants would still be in Palestine if they had not been forced to move their homes to Australia. That explains why the present director of the German Society of Templars writes his introductory comments

to Carmel's work under a Melbourne, Australia, date line. Robert Dale Owen's younger daughter Rosamond, in 1888, wrote from the top of Mt. Carmel: "There is a link between my native town and present abode; the upper story of the hospital here is built with money sent from New Harmony [she meant Economy!] by George Rapp, and his name is inscribed on the wall." Has this memorial to George Rapp and his American Harmonists survived in Israel today?

At the time of the move from Indiana to Economy, George Rapp taught his people that the plan of the then prominent American Jew, Mordecai Noah, to assemble all Jews in America was an important prelude to Christ's return to judge the quick and the dead and to restore all things. In order to help this important cause along and to speed the return to Christ in His Second Coming, the Rapps offered their second settlement, New Harmony, Indiana, to Mordecai Noah. New Harmony on the Wabash thus had the chance of becoming the gathering place of all Israel. The German books cited above overlook the important link between the Harmonists of America and the Protestant Zionists of the Holy Land, but both books testify to the living interest of the millennial hopes of man to this day, and both authors have assured me that in their future works they will fill in this unfortunate gap in their histories by dealing adequately with the contributions of America's Harmonists to the development of the present state of Israel.

Professor of German
Clark University
Worcester, Massachusetts

KARL J. R. ARNDT

Bugs to Blizzards Or An Army Wife at Fort D. A. Russell. By MARTHA FLEISHMAN and CAROL JOY JUSTICE. (Cheyenne, Wyoming: Wigwam Publishing Company, 1974. Pp. 111. Illustrated with sketches and photographs. Hardback, \$7.66; paperback, \$4.07.)

Fort David Allen Russell in Wyoming is now F. E. Warren A. F. B. Martha Fleishman and Carol Joy Justice are married to men who were stationed there. Martha Fleishman graduated from Taylor Allderdice High School in Pittsburgh and from Carnegie-Mellon University. She taught at Westinghouse High School following graduation.

Bugs to Blizzards Or An Army Wife at Fort D. A. Russell is