as an intellectual movement in which the most radical changes took place in men's minds. Rather than a socio-economic or even a political change, the Revolution constituted a complete transformation in the Americans' image of themselves as a republican people. The value of Billias's study of Gerry is that it brings the lofty republican concepts down to earth. Most scholars have emphasized the abstract thoughts of the handful of theoretically-minded leaders such as Jefferson and John Adams. But Billias finds in Gerry a less abstract, more practical side of republicanism. "The precise configuration of a man's republicanism," according to Billias, "was as much emotional and experiential as it was rational and theoretical" (p. 339). Thus by illustrating that Gerry derived distinctive ideas of republicanism from the same intellectual context that influenced more cerebral statesmen, Billias has given a more accurate picture of the impact that ideas had on the Revolutionary generation. He has shown that the intellectual framework of the Revolution was more than abstract political theory; it was a meaningful cluster of ideas and moral concepts for ordinary men.

Some readers may find Billias overly protective of Gerry, particularly in the evaluation of his role as an Antifederalist and diplomat in France. But most will agree that this meticulously researched portrayal of the founder as a principled republican in turbulent times is an important contribution. It is likely to remain the standard biography of Gerry for a very long time.

Department of History
San Diego State University
San Diego, California

Robert Detweiler


About twelve years ago, when this reviewer was the brand-new curator of Old Economy, he was exploring in one of the second-floor rooms of the Great House and stepped up on a mound of rubbish to get a better look out of a window. When he looked down, he found that he was not standing on rubbish but on the collection of music of the Harmony Society. I suppose that every collection has its ups and downs, but this was pretty extreme even for this collection. We placed
it in neat stacks on tables, under cover, and there it sat until Richard D. Wetzel came along a few years later. He was looking for hymns, but after examining the collection he proposed that he catalogue and store it properly. Through the generosity of the Harmonie Associates, this was done. From this effort came a number of concerts of Harmonist music and eventually Dr. Wetzel’s thesis on the music (University of Pittsburgh, 1970), plus several articles.

These musings are mainly to illustrate Wetzel’s long association with the music of the society, both as a musicologist and as a musician. Since he handled each item in a large (about 300 cubic feet) collection, he is knowledgeable about it, even intimate with it. This has paid off in this book. It is not just a warmed-over dissertation; it has been thoroughly and carefully rewritten and edited into something quite readable. The book is a milestone in the historiography of the Harmony Society and joins the select few of originally researched studies on this interesting organization. It stands out in the field of communal studies where so much junk has been written.

The Harmony Society was started about 1785 in Germany by George Rapp (1757-1847) and migrated to this country, beginning in 1803. The society was established on the banks of the Connoquenessing until 1814-1815, when it moved to Indiana. In 1824-1825 the society moved back to Pennsylvania. It dissolved in 1905. These four moves resulted in the rather cumbersome title of this work but also had effects on the society’s music. Judging by the little we know about the Harmonists’ beliefs, their religious service consisted of hymns, readings from the Bible, and a sermon. Some of their religious events were extended into secular ceremonies, and they played contemporary secular music after the religious music. In this country, at least, they seem always to have had a few musicians who accompanied the hymn singing and rose to the stature of a small orchestra in some of the instrumental works. The leaders of the society all seem to have been competent, if not sophisticated, musicians. This talent almost seems to have been a prerequisite for leadership.

The book follows a sequential historical development from the beginnings in Germany to the end in Ambridge. This is probably the only logical method of developing the history of the music. Wetzel makes the point that the music seemed to flow and flourish like the streams beside which the Harmony Society lived. After the historical introduction, the author develops the beginning of the society’s music by the large stream in Pennsylvania and the small river in Indiana to its conclusion by the Ohio River. In this period they
refined the tastes they brought from their peasant culture in Europe. Some of the scenes sound as though they are from the romantic poets, with the gentle communists singing their songs in the glens by the banks of beautiful streams in a never-ending summer.

Although the Harmony Society participated in the growth of manufacturing in the United States, their thinking stayed conservative. As Wetzel points out, they were like a small German court stuck down in the American wilderness. They had a court orchestra, court musicians, and even patrons. This reached its complete development in the first few years at Economy (now Ambridge). Under the direction of the society intellectual, Dr. (M.D.) John C. Müller, the music became increasingly sophisticated. They brought in teachers, particularly William C. Peters and Charles Volz. Peters had a long and interesting career in the music-publishing business but at this time seems to have spent most of his time teaching. He raised the quality and the expectations of the little Harmony Society orchestra to the point where it was able to play sophisticated concerts and a symphony that he wrote for it. According to Wetzel, this was the first symphony written west of the Alleghenies.

The society’s orchestra and its programming reached a peak with the arrival of the followers of “Count” Leon in 1831. With the good count there actually were court musicians and the performances reflected this. It all ended with the schism caused by the count in 1832. Wetzel develops an interesting and valid theory that Dr. Müller took the society a little further than they wished to go. Court orchestras, printing presses, zoos, museums, and some of the other cultural strivings of the society did not fit into the thinking of a pietist such as George Rapp. Even if the schism had not happened, the society would have had a reaction. In any case, many of the good musicians left in the schism.

The man who took over the music program, if we can call it that, was Jacob Henrici, a many-talented man, but one who had not joined the society until 1826. Although the society did not go completely back to its traditional music, much of the spark was gone. Wetzel calls this period “the sound of harmoniums and a fading tradition.” The sound took quite a while to fade, as Henrici lived until 1892. With his death came the death of the real Harmonist tradition.

However, the society was not quite dead, and the musical tradition took on a new and strange form under the leadership of John S. Duss (1862-1951). Duss was not a reticent pietist, and, starting out with bands made up of society members, he began giving concerts
over the area. As Duss's insatiable taste to be in the limelight developed and as he acquired control of the society assets, he expanded the simple band, replacing society members with "professionals," until eventually he ended up "owning" the Metropolitan Opera Orchestra, at least in the summers of 1902 and 1903. This fascinating end of the society's musical tradition would be a study in itself. For all practical purposes, the musical tradition of the Harmony Society ends here, although Duss was still writing music and giving concerts into the 1940s. About half of the book is appendixes containing samples of Harmonist music, incipits from Dr. Müller's "Violin Primo" book, and melodies from the Harmonists' hymnbooks. The final appendix is a catalogue of the collection. There is a short recording accompanying the book, with examples of the Harmonist music directed by Dr. Wetzel. This is more on the order of a dictaphone record but still gives the reader a good sample of the music.

Despite the heavy music interest of the book, it is a thorough history of the society told through their music, and musician and nonmusician alike can find it valuable.

After vast amounts of unresearched garbage written about the Harmony Society in the last few years, it is refreshing to see this book. It certainly will be one of the basic research books on the society and should take a place in bibliographies of church music in the United States as well. However, it is not without errors. Knowing how much time Dr. Wetzel spent researching the book, it is upsetting to the reviewer to find so many of the dates wrong. The rest of the facts are right (or at least agree with the reviewer's opinion). Citations are extensive but appear at the end of chapters rather than at the bottom of pages. The index applies only to the historical text and contains only proper names. The illustrations are centered in the book and are muddy. But these are minor problems in what is an outstanding book.

The Harmony Society is often contrasted with the "society" of Robert Owen. The Owenites are illustrated as the very paragons of culture and enlightenment. Indeed, one wonders what sort of cultural desert America was before the "Boatload of Knowledge" sailed down the Ohio. On the other hand, the Harmony Society is painted as a group of unenlightened peasants toiling in ignorance and stupidity under the lash of a despot. One wonders how the latter managed to survive 115 years while Owen's community lasted only two! At any rate, Frontier Musicians helps to dispel this thinking and shows some of the cultural richness of the Harmony Society. This book is a major
contribution to American scholarship and is very readable besides.

Old Economy
Ambridge, Pennsylvania

Daniel B Reibel


This recent biography of Michael O’Connor, first bishop of the Roman Catholic Diocese of Pittsburgh, is a scholarly presentation of the clergyman as a person, as an educator and scholar, a pioneer, a prelate, an administrator, and a controversialist. Undoubtedly, the work is best characterized by the author’s prefatory statement, which reads: “The account . . . is that of his [O’Connor’s] dedication and drive, of his ideas and deeds, and of his successes and failures as he led Catholicism into the mainstream of the American Catholic experience” (p. ix).

In this publication, the reader is gradually introduced to Michael O’Connor by way of the historical developments which occurred in Western Pennsylvania during the early nineteenth century. Accordingly, the author’s major perspective is one which consistently links the origins and expansion of Roman Catholicism in southwestern Pennsylvania to the total westward movement of the American peoples.

In this respect, Szarnicki’s research is a significant contribution to the fields of both church history and the history of Western Pennsylvania within the period of 1843-1860, the era in which Michael O’Connor patterned and formed the foundation of the Roman Catholic Diocese of Pittsburgh. The experiences of O’Connor can best be defined as the reader observes him as a young Irishman gifted with superior intellectual powers, who after distinguishing himself as both scholar and theologian in Rome, accepted the appointment as first Catholic bishop of Pittsburgh at the youthful age of twenty-nine. With considerable ease and depth of interest, the reader follows O’Connor’s efforts and setbacks during the bishop’s seventeen-year episcopacy.

Through the detailed scholarship and literary ability of his biographer, Michael O’Connor becomes in this work a vital and