imbedded in a crevice after the Monongah explosion, might have been supplemented by an amplification of the chapters dealing with the development of governmental legislation to help prevent such tragedies in the first place. Jackson's fondness for phrases such as "blown to bits," and "the surge for the almighty dollar . . . provided the Grim Reaper with an insurance policy against unemployment," give his work at times an air of yellow journalism.

The author's stress on the callousness of "absentee mine owners" of West Virginia and Kentucky overlooks the almost dazzling contrast of many coal companies in Western Pennsylvania, where solid financial backing enabled management to provide employees, as early as 1890, with well-designed communities complete with churches, schools, hospitals, and reasonably comfortable housing. Related to the above problem, Jackson's unrelenting portrayal of the American coal miner as an exploited victim of a heartless industry is often distorted. Nevertheless, Jackson's book, with its compilation of data and resource materials, is a valuable research tool that belongs on the shelf of any serious student of the history of the mining industry.

*Coal Heritage Center
Johnstown Flood Museum
Johnstown, Pennsylvania*


This is the fifth volume (but the third in the series) of Dr. Arndt's monumental documentary history of the Harmony Society (ca. 1785-1903). For reviews of the previous volumes, see *Western Pennsylvania Historical Magazine* 58 (Oct. 1975): 524-28; 62 (Jan. 1979): 80-82; 65 (July 1982): 241-43.

The whole story is a fascinating one detailing the life of the society from its founding around 1785 by George Rapp (1757-1847), a vine dresser and linen weaver, in Württemberg, its journey to the United States, the growth of a small agricultural community into a large industrial power, the founding of at least four towns in the United States, and the eventual demise of the society. This particular volume takes the reader through the transition made by the Harmony Society in moving from New Harmony, Indiana, to their new town,
Economy (now Ambridge), Pennsylvania, and the beginning of Robert Owen's New Moral Order in the Harmonists' old town (1824-1826).

The contrast between the two men is fascinating. Rapp considered himself a prophet. He placed a religious value on everything. He had inspired a group of about nine hundred people to follow him and adopt community of property, celibacy, and a strict religious life. Owen was a successful manufacturer, a cosmopolitan who conversed with the president and addressed joint houses of Congress. Yet it was Rapp who was the more successful. Rapp may have been a dreamer but he knew how to organize and how to work. In the founding of the new town no detail was too small for him. The size of the boards used in the buildings, the placement of water lines, where to plant trees, the types of shingles, the location of the buildings were all under his direct care. Owen, on the other hand, was the one who turned out to be the impractical dreamer. As a successful cotton spinner Owen could immediately point out to Frederick Rapp (1775-1834) what was wrong in the Harmony Society cotton mill but he could not operate that same mill efficiently after he took over the town.

The documents in this book provide a textbook case of what to do, and what not to do, in founding a communal society, the nature and character of a successful leader, and the lesson that intelligence is not always displayed like a wart on the face. Travelers often referred to the Harmony Society as "dull" or unlearned, yet it was the Harmony Society that was successful, not the overeducated New Moral Order.

The book has numerous documents to carry out its stated theme and these do this very well. Arndt is the great historian of the Harmony Society and has dedicated a life to capturing their history and publishing it. His publications on the Harmony Society take several pages of close typing to list and his history of the Harmony Society [George Rapp's Harmony Society, 1785-1847 (1965) and George Rapp's Successors and Material Heirs (1972)] are the definitive history of the society. When he completes this series of published documents it will be one of the most monumental single achievements in scholarship in recent times — worthy of a Carlyle or a Plutarch. By his perseverance and scholarship Arndt has raised the study of the obscure Harmony Society to a place of importance in American history.

Because of this it is unfortunate that the book has several serious flaws. Arndt has corrected some of the ones mentioned in my review
of his earlier work but the nature of the ones in the book which remain severely limit its scholarly usefulness.

What is most bothersome are the citations. Arndt states, "All manuscripts and records published are found in my archives either in original or photocopy, specific acknowledgments being made in the text of the volume." But specific acknowledgments are not made in the volume. Not more than twenty or thirty documents are cited as to source out of several hundred. The vast majority of these documents belong to the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission (PHMC) which is not mentioned once in the whole book. The PHMC has cooperated with Arndt over a period of forty years, allowing him access to the archives, allowing him to copy documents at will, and encouraging him in the publication of his books. In a book where he lists the brand of typewriter he used to type the book, it seems incredible that he could not cite the PHMC as the owner of most of the documents. Furthermore, any scholars using this book are going to have a difficult time if they wish to see the actual document because they are going to have to contact Dr. Arndt to find out where it is.

Fortunately, the PHMC has recently published their holdings of the Harmony Society in microfilm, *The Harmony Society Records, 1786-1951*. There is a guide to these compiled by Roland Baumann and Robert Dructor, et al., so that in the future scholars can find many of these documents and see them in microfilm. An index is planned which will make this even more useful.

The documents in Arndt's volume are also not cited as to their type. It is difficult to tell if the document printed is the actual autograph letter, a letterbook copy, a copy, or a signed letter. In many cases documents which I know are letterbook copies are presented in such a way that one would think they are the actual letter. As we know, letterbook copies are often different from the original or sometimes are not sent at all. Not all the German documents are translated, which limits the usefulness of the book. The German documents are often in terrible German, and one wonders if the translations have to be in equally bad English.

Documentary histories are often only as useful as their indexes. Sometimes very obscure people are of interest, and such themes as the movement of steamboats are important. The index in this work is severely deficient. There is a fair chance that any name selected would not be cited at the page checked. Such an important person as Jonathan Lenz is not cited at all. Themes such as cotton spinning are excluded as often as they are included.
Arndt has a love-hate relationship with George Rapp. He states that "George Rapp was a prophet, who spoke and conversed with God . . . his people believed it, and that he believed it, and this made him a powerful leader of God's chosen people" (pp. xiv-xv). Whether one believes this or even cares is immaterial. Rapp and his followers believed it and this made him an effective leader. Coupled with Rapp's ability to inspire his followers, his undoubted talent for leadership, and his shrewd business sense, he was a successful leader. Prophets are not like you and me. Arndt makes such statements as "the most disappointing and yet undesirable result of my long and thorough research into the history of Rapp . . . is the inescapable fact that an element of doubt . . . if not premeditated fraud clings to the most important documents . . . as far as its honesty toward the members . . ." (pp. 597-98). Rapp is several times referred to as a tyrant or a fraud. Under such circumstances, one wonders if there was a dispassionate, scholarly approach to the selection and editing of these documents. Everyone is entitled to his opinion, but my reading of these same documents — many in their original state — does not support this type of accusation. Rapp was a strong leader with loyal followers. Those who were not loyal left the society, having a sort of Darwinian effect on those who remained. Outsiders may have thought some of the ideas of the Harmony Society strange but they also had a great deal of respect for their hard work, religious piety, and their ability to make money in a tough world. This is not the picture painted by Arndt's comments on the documents. Many times I thought an alternate reading would have presented a more balanced picture.

If Arndt intends to bring out another volume on the founding of the town of Economy, then the selection of the documents is a good one. If not, he left out a lot of interesting material on establishing the new town and the building of a large industrial establishment.

A number of items printed in the text are from published sources. There are extracts from the William Owen and the Donald MacDonald diaries published by the Indiana Historical Society, and there are two long accounts from the diary of the Duke of Saxe-Weimar Eisenach (1828). These works are readily available to the type of scholar who would use a book like this and would have better been left out in place of more unpublished documents.

Arndt is the compiler, historian, editor, printer, and publisher of this work. It was typed under his supervision. The book would have been better if it had been edited by someone other than the compiler. The book is well typed, and the makeup of the pages is as attractive
as a book of documents can be. It is remarkably free of typographical errors. There is no bibliography.

The book shows some improvement over the first two volumes in this series but still is not up to the standards of the *Indiana Decade*. Should you buy this book? Yes, if you are interested in the history of the Harmony Society, Western Pennsylvania, Indiana, and Robert Owen. If you are interested enough you can almost read it as if it were a novel with no beginning and no end. The high price, however, will undoubtedly limit the sales to libraries and historical societies.

I hope that Dr. Arndt will hire a competent editor to look at his next books before they go to press. We at the PHMC have made such an offer to him. It would prevent a number of petty errors that diminish an otherwise excellent book.

*Washington Crossing Historic Park*  
*Washington Crossing, Pennsylvania*

**Daniel B Reibel**


The writing of traditional history has been frequently unidimensional, that is, political history, economic history, cultural history, and so forth. The focus has been on the individual, the event, the issue, and what was seen as the development, transpirings, and molders of events and issues. Traditional historical interpretation has centered on the charismatic leader, presidential administrations, political parties, national political campaigns, elections, voting behavior, legislation, movements, ideology, foreign affairs, and domestic, economic, and social issues. The interpretation has been done in broad strokes without much shading and tended to make the item under discussion predominant and causative. The behavior and study of aggregates have been relied on for analysis and interpretation.

During the past two decades historians have urged newer and more encompassing probings into historical processes. There has been a shift from interpreting history as the narration of episodic events to that of studying history as social change occurring over a period of time and the transition had as its basis the concern "with the interactions of large numbers of people — the whole society." Concepts of social structure and change and the understanding of their dynamics