

songs are familiar, such as "Herald Angels," "Jolly Old Saint Nicholas," and "Cradle Hymn," but the arrangements are taken from such long-forgotten nineteenth-century sources as *School Chimes*, *Temple Carmina*, and *Sunny Songs for Little Folks*. In contrast to modern versions of the Christmas songs, which are often "busy," these arrangements are peaceful and relaxing. The album contains the complete texts of the songs on the jacket and a brochure on the celebration of Christmas in the nineteenth century. ■

Maurine Weiner Greenwald *Department of History*
University of Pittsburgh
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Women and the Trades: Pittsburgh, 1907-1908.

By Elizabeth Beardsley Butler.

Introduction by Maurine Weiner Greenwald.

(Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1984. Pp. xlv, 440.

Introduction, foreword, illustrations, tables, appendixes,
bibliography, index. \$14.95, paper.)

The topic of women in the American labor force has received extensive scholarly attention during the last ten years. The reprint of Elizabeth Butler's *Women and the Trades* adds to this total of articles, dissertations, monographs, and reprints. This new edition of *Women and the Trades*, however, provides readers with two works in one: Maurine Greenwald's interesting and informative introduction, and Butler's original text.

Originally published in 1909, *Women and the Trades* was the first of six investigative volumes produced by the Pittsburgh Survey under the auspices of the Russell Sage Foundation. Maurine Greenwald's introduction both describes the survey's rationale and discusses the effect of its research by placing Butler's work in its proper context within the reform movement of the Progressive Era. The introduction also provides biographical information about Elizabeth Butler, discusses Lewis Hine's contribution to the Pittsburgh Survey, and critiques Butler's research methods.

Greenwald clearly identifies Butler's key research flaw: her inability to separate middle-class values from her working assumptions about women wage earners. Consequently, Butler only researched areas she

"viewed as problematic" and as exploitative if "characteristic of a trade group" (pp. xx, 381; Appendix A). Greenwald also points out the need for a reassessment of Butler's charge that working women were passive and powerless. These shortcomings probably resulted, at least in part, from time constraints, as a full inquiry into working-class values was hampered by the single year available for the research.

The book's methodological flaws create an interesting paradox. Unintentionally, Butler perhaps provides the reader with a stronger feel for Pittsburgh's geography and laboring classes, generally, than for women workers alone. Butler portrays the city as busy and bleak in 1907 and 1908. Her rich, evocative style gives the reader a sense of trudging through the city with her while she compiles field notes. Butler's description of a confectionery, for example, typifies the often hot, usually claustrophobic, and always monotonous workplaces she visited:

most of the factories are located in the old business section near the low ground where the two rivers meet. Narrow streets radiate out from "the Point," narrow buildings seek a few square feet of frontage, narrow work-rooms grasp at uncertain daylight from windows at either end. . . . The atmosphere indoors is cloudy from boiling kettles and cooling candies; the need for fresh air is urgent. . . . the type of room most in evidence is steamy, dark, and narrow, with windows tight closed. . . . inside, there are steaming copper kettles, white-aproned men who pass back and forth, and the quick, silent movements of a tableful of girls, dipping chocolates, wrapping and packing, or filling prize bags (p. 45).

Butler's account of life outside the factories and workshops is equally graphic. She presents a Jewish section of the Hill District as dark and depressing: "Along the unevenly paved streets, with their row after row of small brick houses, their dark courts with yet other houses thrust back and between, their little ill-smelling kosher shops, the life of the Jewish immigrant shows itself stripped of the picturesqueness, the gay colors . . ." (p. 319).

This visual quality of the prose of *Women and the Trades* is balanced by dry statistical tables throughout the text and in Appendix B. They suggest a clinical approach to the subject that struggles with the qualitative narrative produced from field notes.

Butler's study lacks the smooth, flowing quality of *The Steelworkers* by John Fitch and the popularity of Margaret Byington's *Homestead: The Households of a Mill Town*, two other volumes in the Pittsburgh Survey. Although the text vacillates between the fascinating and the tedious, a reader will recognize its value as a research model about a social environment. *Women and the Trades* is not an

appropriate class text nor a book for casual reading, but rather a valuable reference work for urban and labor historians. ■

Sharon Trusilo *Department of History and Philosophy
Carnegie-Mellon University
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania*

Guide to the Microfilmed Harmony Society Records, 1786-1951 (Manuscript Group 185) in the Pennsylvania State Archives. Compiled by Robert M. Dructor.
Edited by Roland M. Baumann.

(Harrisburg: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, 1983. Pp. vi, 77. Introduction, illustrations, index. \$3.00, paper.)

The microfilming of the Harmony Society Records, 1786-1951, was the result of a cooperative effort between the National Endowment for the Humanities and the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. This is a sizable collection and is contained in 311 rolls of microfilm. The papers cover the administration, legal records, business papers, and public documents of the Harmony Society.

The introduction to the guide describes the history of the Harmony Society. In its 101 years of existence it occupied three locations in two states, moving from Harmony, Pennsylvania, to New Harmony, Indiana, and back to Pennsylvania at Economy. According to the guide, the society began as "a copy of a self-sufficient German farming village." It soon expanded its activities and began producing shoes, hats, flour, and furniture for sale.

In Indiana the Harmonists erected larger factories, but their neighbors proved hostile and the community moved back to Pennsylvania. Here, because the quality of their goods was excellent and the labor of the Harmonist members free, the society undersold its competition and dominated the market. In the introduction is a list of "Harmony Society Trustees" from 1805 to 1905. A "Historical Chronology of the Harmony Society" gives an abridged history of its founding, growth, and development.

The history of the storing, moving, arranging, and rearranging of the documents can be found in the introduction. The society "destroyed records of the amount of property contributed by each member." Other papers may have been lost when the records were