

tion to another, although an index and some textual cross-references do help. Much of the material is in German and some is translated, although a lot is not. Among items of importance that are not translated is the very interesting excerpt from Traugott Bromme's description of the Harmonist settlement contained in her book *Nordamerika* (Stuttgart, 1839). The book was extremely popular in Germany. Where translations are provided they are accurate and stylistically adequate.

There is, in general, a problem with the frame in which the materials are embedded. The English introduction is followed by a different, short introduction in German. The illustrations between the two introductions have German captions only. The illustrations elsewhere in the book have English captions only. In spite of what appears to be an attempt at a bilingual approach to the descriptions of the materials, this is not carried through. The result will be a bit of frustration for both American and German researchers.

Similar inconsistencies exist in the style of language Arndt uses, particularly in the relatively small amount of German. The researcher who wishes to make use of these rich materials would also appreciate a bit more clarity about the criteria for selection of materials as well as a brief description of the archives themselves.

While the concerns listed above are serious, Arndt has done a yeoman's task in sorting through a great amount of material and has contributed greatly to our knowledge of the Harmonists. He has made available to a wide audience of researchers primary sources needed to understand better the nature of German-American and Anglo-American life in the first half of the nineteenth century. ■

Giles R. Hoyt
Indiana University-Indianapolis

The Diary of William Maclay and Other Notes on Senate Debates, March 4, 1789-March 3, 1791

Kenneth R. Bowling and Helen E. Veit, editors

Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1988. Pp. xxxii, 522. Introduction, appendixes, notes, index, illustrations. \$39.50, \$10.95 paper.

KENNETH R. Bowling and Helen E. Veit, editors of William Maclay's record of the earliest transactions of the U.S. Senate, have prepared a study of much significance to understanding the early politics and constitutional history of the new nation.

The work describes Pennsylvania's part in the first two years of government under the Constitution. The editors help us comprehend the work of the Senate and the contributions of Pennsylvania's first two senators to the legislative achievements of March 4, 1789, to March 3, 1791. The diary "is the preeminent unofficial document of the First Congress and fundamental to the historical record of the United States Senate" (page xiii). The role of William Maclay and the contents of his invaluable private diary, kept during his Senate term, are of special interest. The political, social, and economic values revealed by Maclay and his observations on the personalities of his contemporaries — the other founding fathers — make this work appealing. The diary is "a valuable source of information about both the work of the first Senate and the social life at the seat of government" (xiii). Maclay's revelations place him in the mold of a revolutionary, imbued with the spirit of 1776, and in some ways an Antifederalist. He was possibly the first Jeffersonian Democrat, even though he went to the Senate as a Federalist. In political attitudes and values, he

was much more like John Smilie, William Findley, Robert Whitehill, and other Western Pennsylvania Antifederalists, than he would admit. Maclay was more "democratic" than other Federalists such as John Adams, Alexander Hamilton, and Robert Morris. Clearly, if any doubts remain, Maclay's diary "establishes without question that the founding fathers practiced the art of legislative politics" (xiii).

Bowling and Veit's edition is organized in two parts. Part I, the core of the volume, is the diary Maclay kept during the first through the third Senate sessions. This section also includes supplementary material organized in five appendixes, including miscellaneous records, some of the newspaper articles Maclay authored, and extant letters he wrote and received. Genealogical data and a biography of Maclay are also included. In Part II, one may find other records of Senate debates, with notes kept by John Adams, Pierce Butler, William Samuel Johnson, Rufus King, William Paterson, and Paine Wingate. The editors' introduction places the Maclay diary and other notes in the economic, social, and political context of the period, 1789 to 1791.

This book obviously evolved over many years of scholarly effort, and it represents a major improvement over earlier texts. The diary is well edited, updated, and timely. An abbreviated version was first edited by G.W. Harris in 1880. The full text was first edited by Edgar S. Maclay in 1890 and reprinted with an introduction by Charles A. Beard in 1927. The Bowling and Veit edition brings improvements in several areas, most conspicuously in the detailed annotation. While the notes kept by other senators are sparse relative to the extensive Maclay notes and analysis, they may profitably be compared with Maclay's account of Senate business. Finally, the index is useful but not neces-

sarily an improvement. For instance, William Findley is mentioned several times in the text and notes, but his name does not appear in the index. The 21 page double-column index is three pages shorter than the index in a 1965 edition of the diary, but this problem does not detract severely from the overall excellence of the volume.

The diary is probably best studied in the context of a number of other recently published editions of primary sources. The diary is Volume 9 of the *Documentary History of the First Federal Congress of the United States of America, 4 March 1789-3 March 1791* (published 1972-1988). The first six volumes include the Senate's "Legislative Journal" and its "Executive Journal." These have numerous references to Maclay's role in the Senate. This collection also contains the "Journal of the House of Representatives" and the legislative histories from the proposed constitutional amendments to the resolution on unclaimed western lands — all major items of business transacted during Maclay's tenure. His election to the Senate may be studied by examining "The Elections in Pennsylvania," Merrill Jensen and Robert A. Becker, eds., *The Documentary History of the First Federal Elections, 1788-1790* (1976) I.

Maclay was born on July 20, 1737, in New Garden Township, Chester County, Pennsylvania. He studied under Reverend John Blair, future president of Princeton, attended Samuel Findley's academy at West Nottingham, and qualified for the bar in York County in 1760. He married Mary Harris in April 1769; they had 11 children, three of whom died in infancy. Maclay spent his adulthood in Mifflintown, Pomfret, Sunbury, Maclaysburg, and Harrisburg, all in the central part of Pennsylvania. One of the first U.S. senators from Pennsylvania, he also worked for the military, and as a surveyor, a

land agent, and a justice. In 1758, Maclay's military career began during the French and Indian War. As a lieutenant under General John Forbes, he used his surveying skills to help cut a road through the wilderness for use by the British against Fort Duquesne. In July 1763, he returned to duty accompanying Lt. Henry Bouquet on the expedition to relieve Fort Pitt. A month later, Maclay first witnessed fighting when Indians attacked the British at Bushy Run. As an assistant commissary during the Revolutionary War, Maclay equipped and forwarded troops to the Continental Army.

Maclay's greatest achievements came as a surveyor, land agent, and

Maclay soon found himself opposing Federalist views.

public official. Working for the army and the Penn family, he made his fortune, like Washington, as a surveyor and land speculator. He surveyed many central Pennsylvania counties, the Susquehanna Valley, and the state's borders. His knowledge and renown made him the preferred surveyor of many looking for property. He received land along the Susquehanna as a grant for military service, keeping some, but selling much of it. Finally, he laid out several towns, including Sunbury, where he maintained a home, and Harrisburg, the future state capital. Maclay's public life began as Northumberland County Treasurer, Prothonotary, and Chief Clerk of Courts in 1772. He also became the Judge of the Court of Common Pleas. His surveying skills next brought him the position of Deputy Surveyor in 1785. His reputation vaulted him to the state Supreme Executive Council, on to the Pennsylvania General Assembly,

and finally to his Senate seat.

In 1786, Maclay claimed to be the duly elected member of the Pennsylvania General Assembly from Westmoreland County. John Smilie and William Findley led the opposition to seating Maclay, on grounds that as Deputy Surveyor he was disqualified. In this manner, Smilie prevented Maclay from taking the Assembly seat. The Assembly selected William Maclay and Robert Morris as Pennsylvania's first two U.S. senators. Maclay won the nomination over John Armstrong, Jr., entering the Senate in 1789. Morris and Maclay drew lots to determine who would have the six-year seat, and Maclay received the short term, ending March 3, 1791.

The diary Maclay kept during his first two years in the Senate reveals his conversion from a Federalist to a Jeffersonian Democratic-Republican. Although he battled with Smilie and Findley, clearly his interests rested with Western Pennsylvania. Maclay was thought of as, and considered himself, a 1776 patriot rather than a 1789 politician. He supported the Declaration of Independence and, later, a strong federal government, but soon found himself opposing Federalist views. He disapproved of the ceremonies governing the relationship of the president to the Congress, objected to the president's presence in the Senate while it transacted business, and opposed the chartering of the United States Bank. Maclay boldly spoke against Washington's policies, sometimes within earshot of the president. So adamant was he in his views, that he found himself at odds with nearly everyone — including Adams, Knox, Hamilton, Washington and Jefferson — even though, as noted before, he may have been the first Jeffersonian Democrat. One of his greatest contributions to posterity was writing his notes and analysis of the Senate proceedings. Both are a major source of insight.

Maclay remained active in public affairs to the end of his life. As a presidential elector in 1796, he voted for Jefferson. He spent his final years in public office serving in the state legislature as a representative from Dauphin County in 1795, 1796, 1797 and 1803. On April 16, 1804, at the age of 77, Maclay died in his Harrisburg home. He was buried in the Paxtang Presbyterian Church cemetery.

Contemporaries viewed Maclay as one with "great talents for government," "independent in fortune and spirit," "a perfect republican," "a decided federalist," and "a scholar, philosopher, and a statesman." However, Maclay was

not so gracious in his assessment of his colleagues. John "Adams's preoccupation with ceremony so disturbed Maclay's republican sensibilities" that it prompted his decision to keep a record of the Senate's business (xiii). He later referred to Adams as a "fool" and a "viper." Maclay, opposing Washington's policies, called him "a dishcloth in the hands of Hamilton." He thought of James Hutchinson as "greasy as a skin of oil," and his witticisms as the "belchings of a bag of blubber." He had choice words, as well, for the Antifederalists John Smilie and William Findley. "As to Smilie he is so incorrigible a Savage and withall so giddy and man(a)geable,

That every attention would be lost on him" (175). Maclay thought Smilie and Findley had "nothing further in View than the securing themselves Niches in the Six dollar Temple of Congress" (385). This new edition of *The Diary of William Maclay* is a valuable contribution to our understanding of the man who wrote it, the early politics and constitutional history of the United States and Pennsylvania, and Maclay's important ties with Western Pennsylvania. ■

Rodger C. Henderson and
Danny F. Opel
Pennsylvania State University
Fayette Campus

(Correspondence from page 159)

building was concerned. Since then I retired from Landmarks and in 1978 I was struck by an automobile and badly injured. Since then I have written my local history articles, acted in television programs, and also had a radio program for some years on WQED.

In part of that time, I acted as a bibliographer for the present Hunt Institute of Botanical Research. I was head of the Historical American Buildings Survey at CMU. I was until 1970 editor of *Charette*. In the midst of all this I got the job of writing about the Court House. I spent several years on that, but I published only what I thought people would be interested in reading. I guess I was interested less and less in footnotes.

I was only interested in describing the building as it was now and I tried to include what people thought of it.

Mr. Toker is a much younger man than I, and really a first-class art historian.

Mr. Toker wanted more than I had to give. I'm sorry, but I don't think he's pleased. I like my book, such as it is. The county commissioners wanted something supernatural and I was aware of that, but, alas, it didn't come through to Mr. Toker. My book was a *cri du coeur* — my testament of the heart.

So be it.

Jamie Van Trump

Photograph Credits

Memoir, 1910-1922

All photos courtesy of author except: page 163 and 168, Archives of Industrial Society, University of Pittsburgh; page 170, Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania (HSWP) Archives.

All An Illusion, But Maybe Not So

Page 112, 117 The Carnegie Museum

Page 113, 114 Courtesy of Henry Koerner

'HI BUTCH': the World War II Letters of Everett Johns

Page 179 Pennsylvania Room, Carnegie Library of Pittsburgh
Page 180 Historical Society of Pennsylvania Archives, Philadelphia
Page 181 Courtesy of William J. Gaughan
Page 182 Pennsylvania Room
Page 183 HSWP Archives
Page 184-85 HSWP Archives
Page 186-87 Pennsylvania Room
Page 188, 189 HSWP Archives
Page 190 Pennsylvania Room
Page 191 Mementos for collage courtesy of Jo Clapperton

'Dear Friends': The Civil War Letters of Francis Marion Elliot, A Pennsylvania Country Boy

Page 193-94 Courtesy of Peter G. Boag
Page 195-97 Collection of the HSWP
Page 198 Courtesy of Peter G. Boag