

mental collapse shortly before World War I until his death in 1941, Ida bore the burden of caring for the family. Thus, it is ironic that the spinster found relief from the pressures of family life only when she died in 1944 at the age of 86.

While Brady's biography captures the paradoxical nature of Tarbell's life experiences, it falls short of placing those experiences within the complexities of her time, of explaining why that which seems enigmatic about Tarbell's life might also express some of the tensions of that period. Nevertheless, Brady provides a thoroughly insightful narrative of Tarbell, the writer, and Tarbell, the woman. ■

Kathleen C. Berkeley  
University of North Carolina at  
Wilmington

---

### ***The History of the Duquesne Club***

By Mark M. Brown, Lu Donnelly and David G. Wilkins; Robert C. Alberts, editor.

Pittsburgh: the Duquesne Club, 1989. Pp. xii, 188 pages. Foreword, introduction, acknowledgements, appendix, notes, index.

WRITING institutional histories is a difficult job at best. The historian frequently ends up with a chronicle of anecdotes and unrelated topical treatments in an effort to satisfy all parties underwriting the book. Evidently the Duquesne Club in Pittsburgh gave free rein to the authors, for Brown, Donnelly and Wilkins avoided the usual pitfalls. Even the origins of the book are somewhat unorthodox. Unlike most books of this nature, this is not a centennial volume; the Club was founded in 1873 (even though it displays 1881, the year of its incorporation, on its logo). The book is due in part to the Club's

Art and Library Committee's earlier success, *Paintings and Sculpture of the Duquesne Club*, by David G. Wilkins. It also results from Mark Brown's organization of the Club's archives, to which he and the other authors were apparently given unlimited access. Since their efforts inevitably produced three distinct writing styles, the committee decided to engage the talents of Robert Alberts as editor. The book is an all-Pittsburgh undertaking, the authors being locals. Brown is a graduate student, Donnelly is a historical consultant and Wilkins is the chairman of the Fine Arts Department at the University of Pittsburgh. Alberts's books on the history of the H.J. Heinz Company, and most recently, the University of Pittsburgh, have established his credentials in the field.

Since its founding 116 years ago, the Club has been the downtown home of the city's business elite, eclipsing every other club, although the Pittsburgh Club has been held to be even more exclusive. In 1890 the Duquesne Club moved to its present location on Sixth Avenue, rather symbolically across the street from two other institutions of considerable influence, Trinity Episcopal Cathedral and the First Presbyterian Church. Even the building itself is something of a symbol. Its first story, with its rough-hewn stone and Romanesque arches, is vaguely reminiscent of another local landmark, architect H.H. Richardson's county courthouse — so very Pittsburgh.

The Duquesne Club is, of course, much more than stone; almost since its founding, membership in the Club has been "a mark of success equal to ordering a custom-built yacht or commissioning a building from architect Paul Rudolph" (page 137). From the perspective of an individual, this is important, but from society's vantage point the organization can be understood differently.

In many ways the Duquesne Club is, as the authors aver, "a microcosm of the social history of Pitts-

---

### **Decisions made within the club's walls have enormously affected the city.**

---

burgh and of the United States" (ix). Typical of Pittsburgh and the United States? Hardly, but decisions made within its walls have enormously affected the city and even the nation. Likewise, the social environment has greatly affected the Club. It is precisely this two-way relationship that *The History of the Duquesne Club* treats so well.

The book is arranged chronologically into 10 chapters and an epilogue. The authors did not intend that each decade be treated equally. Indeed the 1970s and 1980s are discussed in a single chapter while the halcyon 1920s merit an entire chapter. Although each chapter includes the almost obligatory discussion of Club operations (e.g. the cuisine, service, decor, admissions policies, etc.), it studiously avoids that most common feature of histories of this genre, namely being a who's who of club luminaries. It presents selected individuals in specially demarked sections (e.g. Gurdon F. Flagg, who was manager of the Club for half a century), but mostly it treats individuals as they relate to the Club's history. Of particular interest was Carl Banning, a German-born member who, upon seeing a parade of soldiers marching past the Club, remarked that they were like "sheep going to slaughter" and that they looked "like a bunch of bums" (63). The year was 1918 and the soldiers were off to fight the Kaiser. Banning was not only expelled from the Club but also imprisoned for a

half-year for his remarks. In the hysteria of the time even millionaires had to be careful.

The authors have skillfully woven the history of the Duquesne Club within the larger fabric of American history, and they do it exhaustively. In the Banning affair, some seven different sources were researched, including two newspapers and Carnegie Library's Pennsylvania Room. Unfortunately, the endnotes are not numbered in the text, making them difficult to use. Still, this book would be a fine reference work for the student of American social history but for its limited accessibility; it is only available to Club members, though the persistent researcher will find it housed in a few regional libraries. ■

Joseph F. Rishel  
Duquesne University

---

***The Shadow of the Mills:  
Working-Class Families in  
Pittsburgh, 1870-1907***

By S.J. Kleinberg

Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1989. Pp. xxv, 414. Introduction, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index.

FINALLY we have a manifestation of the kind of history Gerda Lerner has called for in *The Majority Finds Its Past* (New York: 1979). This is not a women's history and not a labor history, but a true work of synthesis: a labor history that counts women's unpaid work in the home as "labor," and a women's history that emphasizes gender. Kleinberg has written a history of working-class life in Pittsburgh with both sexes present and with full cognizance of the genderedness of the processes of industrialization and modernization. In this book, one can see the integration of two sub-categories of the New Social History,

working-class labor history and women's history, and can see that the result is greater than the sum of the parts.

This is not a narrow study. Kleinberg has focused on a major industrial "hotspot," Pittsburgh, a place given a lot of attention by progressives and governmental social scientists, and has included in her study a complex analysis of demographics; she has interwoven and differentiated the various factors of class, gender, race and ethnicity. Kleinberg has much to say about the impact of industrialization in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century on working people's lives, and their response to it. While not the focus of the work, a reader can glean information on the dynamics of progressive reform efforts and progressive ethnocentric, class motivations. In particular, Kleinberg observes that the "social engineers" condemned families that put the individual second and the family first.

The book depicts neither working-class men nor women as passive historical actors. Being especially careful in her portrayal of women in industrializing Pittsburgh, Kleinberg seems to have grounded her approach in the wise words that Jane Collier wrote in her essay on "Women In Politics," in *Women, Culture and Society* (Stanford: 1974): "The model woman of my argument...is not the affectionate daughter, hard-working wife, or loving mother...but the cold, calculating female who uses all available resources to control the world around her." This approach immediately dismisses the sexist cultural assumptions and biases so ingrained in even the most analytical of recent scholarship. Indeed, a major strength of Kleinberg's study is that she avoids equating "women" with "family," and thereby heeds Catherine MacKinnon's caution to women's historians, in her 1982 article "Femi-

nism, Marxism, Methodology and the State: An Agenda for Theory," in the journal *Signs*.

Kleinberg raises issues significant to continuing research on industrialization and gender. For example, she addresses concerns over the differences between the experiences of men and women in dealing with the wrenching changes of industrialization. Kleinberg discusses what she calls "the asymmetric family." She describes the situation of Pittsburgh women who lacked access to the work and wages of iron and steel mills and were reduced to virtual dependence on male wage-earners. This "asymmetrical family" contrasts with the family-economic relationships of preindustrial life in which work relationships were less pronounced: men and women both worked at productive labor and in the proximity of each other.

Kleinberg makes a second major point, asserting that the unpaid household work of women was essential to the wage-earning abilities of men. It was the women who maintained the household, raised the next generation of workers,

---

**The author  
addresses what  
she calls 'the  
asymmetrical  
family.'**

offered emotional support and sustained the bonds of family and community.

Kleinberg's book informs my own research on women's lives and the constructions of gender in the coal camps of southern Appalachia in the early decades of the twentieth century. It also complements Jacqueline Dowd Hall's *Like a Family: The Making of the Southern Cotton Mill World* (Chapel Hill: 1987), which deals with the cot-