

half-year for his remarks. In the hysteria of the time even millionaires had to be careful.

The authors have skillfully woven the history of the Duquesne Club within the larger fabric of American history, and they do it exhaustively. In the Banning affair, some seven different sources were researched, including two newspapers and Carnegie Library's Pennsylvania Room. Unfortunately, the endnotes are not numbered in the text, making them difficult to use. Still, this book would be a fine reference work for the student of American social history but for its limited accessibility; it is only available to Club members, though the persistent researcher will find it housed in a few regional libraries. ■

Joseph F. Rishel  
Duquesne University

---

***The Shadow of the Mills:  
Working-Class Families in  
Pittsburgh, 1870-1907***

By S.J. Kleinberg

Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1989. Pp. xxv, 414. Introduction, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index.

FINALLY we have a manifestation of the kind of history Gerda Lerner has called for in *The Majority Finds Its Past* (New York: 1979). This is not a women's history and not a labor history, but a true work of synthesis: a labor history that counts women's unpaid work in the home as "labor," and a women's history that emphasizes gender. Kleinberg has written a history of working-class life in Pittsburgh with both sexes present and with full cognizance of the genderedness of the processes of industrialization and modernization. In this book, one can see the integration of two sub-categories of the New Social History,

working-class labor history and women's history, and can see that the result is greater than the sum of the parts.

This is not a narrow study. Kleinberg has focused on a major industrial "hotspot," Pittsburgh, a place given a lot of attention by progressives and governmental social scientists, and has included in her study a complex analysis of demographics; she has interwoven and differentiated the various factors of class, gender, race and ethnicity. Kleinberg has much to say about the impact of industrialization in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century on working people's lives, and their response to it. While not the focus of the work, a reader can glean information on the dynamics of progressive reform efforts and progressive ethnocentric, class motivations. In particular, Kleinberg observes that the "social engineers" condemned families that put the individual second and the family first.

The book depicts neither working-class men nor women as passive historical actors. Being especially careful in her portrayal of women in industrializing Pittsburgh, Kleinberg seems to have grounded her approach in the wise words that Jane Collier wrote in her essay on "Women In Politics," in *Women, Culture and Society* (Stanford: 1974): "The model woman of my argument...is not the affectionate daughter, hard-working wife, or loving mother...but the cold, calculating female who uses all available resources to control the world around her." This approach immediately dismisses the sexist cultural assumptions and biases so ingrained in even the most analytical of recent scholarship. Indeed, a major strength of Kleinberg's study is that she avoids equating "women" with "family," and thereby heeds Catherine MacKinnon's caution to women's historians, in her 1982 article "Femi-

nism, Marxism, Methodology and the State: An Agenda for Theory," in the journal *Signs*.

Kleinberg raises issues significant to continuing research on industrialization and gender. For example, she addresses concerns over the differences between the experiences of men and women in dealing with the wrenching changes of industrialization. Kleinberg discusses what she calls "the asymmetric family." She describes the situation of Pittsburgh women who lacked access to the work and wages of iron and steel mills and were reduced to virtual dependence on male wage-earners. This "asymmetrical family" contrasts with the family-economic relationships of preindustrial life in which work relationships were less pronounced: men and women both worked at productive labor and in the proximity of each other.

Kleinberg makes a second major point, asserting that the unpaid household work of women was essential to the wage-earning abilities of men. It was the women who maintained the household, raised the next generation of workers,

---

**The author  
addresses what  
she calls 'the  
asymmetrical  
family.'**

offered emotional support and sustained the bonds of family and community.

Kleinberg's book informs my own research on women's lives and the constructions of gender in the coal camps of southern Appalachia in the early decades of the twentieth century. It also complements Jacqueline Dowd Hall's *Like a Family: The Making of the Southern Cotton Mill World* (Chapel Hill: 1987), which deals with the cot-

ton mill "world" of the late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Appalachian South. Hall describes family asymmetry as well, although it was constructed differently. Men, generally excluded from cotton mill work, and thus from wage labor, often faced derision by middle-class mill owners and townspeople as "cotton mill drones." There were many tensions over this sudden change in the family's economic relationship, and some attempts were made to redefine women's roles and statuses in cotton mill families, even to the point of exaggerating women's domestic roles.

*The Shadow of the Mills* presents a detailed picture of the role women and children played in the material and emotional sustenance of the industrial working man. Kleinberg is correct in the emphasis she places on this aspect of the story of industrial capitalism. It is encouraging to see this thesis articulated so unequivocally; she provides evidence for it on nearly every page of the book. How long traditional labor historians have missed the breadth of the implications of this kind of brutal labor! The story of industrial capitalism — in short, the genderedness of the industrial experience — remains the untold story of modernization. Perhaps in the next few years we will see more work done on the task begun here by Kleinberg's book. ■

*Glenna Horne Graves*  
*University of Kentucky*

## Photo Credits

### **You Couldn't Keep an Iron Man Down: Rowing in Nineteenth Century Pittsburgh**

- Page 51 Courtesy of Three Rivers Rowing Association
- Page 53 Courtesy of Sigrid Nama, Pittsburgh
- Page 54 Collection of the Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania
- Page 57 Courtesy of Sigrid Nama
- Page 58-59 Collection of the Historical Society
- Page 61, 62 Photographs by Herb Ferguson, Pittsburgh

### **Concert Note: The Rolling Stones at West View Park, 1964**

- Page 65 Courtesy of Paula Cline

### **Early Printing In Pittsburgh, 1786-1856**

- Page 67 Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania Archives
- Page 68 Historical Society Library
- Page 68 Historical Society Library

### **Central High School: Pittsburgh's First**

- Page 70 *Fleming's Views of Old Pittsburgh* (1932), Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania Library
- Page 71 Historical Society Archives
- Page 73 *Top, Fleming's Views of Old Pittsburgh* (1932), Historical Society Library; *bottom*, Carnegie Library, Pittsburgh.
- Page 74 Historical Society Archives
- Page 75 Historical Society Archives

### **Director's Gallery**

- Page 78-79 Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania

### **An American Dark Age: Echoes and Memories**

- Page 80 Courtesy of Robert G. Colodny
- Page 84 Courtesy of the Greenville-Reynolds Development Corp.
- Page 86-89 Courtesy of Robert G. Colodny